The *Yesterday&Today* is an educationally focused journal, currently published in conjunction with The South African Society for History Teachers (SASHT) under the auspices of the School of Basic Sciences, Vaal Triangle Campus, North-West University. An electronic format of the journal is also available on the SASHT website:  [http://www.sashtw.org.za](http://www.sashtw.org.za)

Educational and fair-use copying of the *Yesterday&Today*, for research and teaching and not for profit, is permitted. The use of correct citation methods and acknowledgement of authors’ work is a prerequisite. Opinions expressed or conclusions arrived at in articles and book reviews are those of the authors and are not to be regarded as those of the North-West University or the SASHT Editorial committee. Two editions of *Yesterday&Today* are annually published.

**Notes to contributors**

Manuscripts, (2 per author) in any of the official languages, not exceeding fifteen pages, single spacing (12 font) and accompanied by a stiffy/CD disk in Word are welcome. A summary/abstract must also be included in a different language to that of the manuscript. Contributors are asked to write clearly and simply and to avoid technical terms as far as possible. The language of all articles must be edited by a professional language editor. The use of informative subheadings is important. For general style and reference techniques of articles, contributors are recommended to the last pages of this publication. THESE WILL APPLY FROM THE OCTOBER 2007 EDITION. Two copies of the entire issue will be sent to a contributor of an article. Page fees will be asked if the contributor of an article is not a member of the SASHT.

May 2007
| Block Letters Please | BLOKLETTERS ASSEBLIEF |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Membership</th>
<th>Lidmaatskap</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I hereby wish to</td>
<td>ONDERGETEKENDE WENS HERMEE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Renew his/her membership</td>
<td>1. SY/HAAR LIDMAATSKAP TE HERNU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Subscribe as a new member</td>
<td>2. AS NUWE LID TE REGISTREER</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title/Titel:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Surname/Van:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initials/Voorletters:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Address/Adres:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code/Kode:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tel/(H) ( ) (W) ( )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cell:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-mail Address:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fax:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. Include an amount of R120.00 as annuity for membership (payable to the South African Society for History Teaching) |

Send your payment (cheque or postal order) and made out to the society to: |

SASHT Account Details: |
| Absa Potchefstroom SASHT 078209406 |
| SASHT Fax No: 016 910 3451 |
| (Please send copy of direct payment fee paid) |

The Secretary Treasurer, SASHT/ |
| Die Sekretaris-Treasurier SASHT/ |
| Prof. E.S. van Eeden/ |
| South African Society for History Teaching/ |
| Sud-Afrikaanse Vereniging Vir Geskiedenisonderwys/ |
| School of Basic Science/ |
| North West University/ |
| Vaal Triangle Campus/ |
| PO Box 1124/ |
| Vanderbijlpark/ |
| 1900/ |
| South Africa/ |
CONFERENCE 2007

INTERROGATING THE HISTORY CURRICULUM AFTER TEN YEARS OF OBE

21-22 September 2007

VENUE:

FACULTY OF EDUCATION
UNIVERSITY OF KWAZULU-NATAL
EDGEOOOD CAMPUSS
PINETOWN

CONTACT DETAILS

DR. JOHAN WASSERMANN & MS. BARBARA WAHLBERG
HISTORY AND SOCIAL STUDIES EDUCATION
FACULTY OF EDUCATION, UKZN
EDGEOOOD
PRIVATE BAG X03
ASHWOOD 3605
TEL: 031 – 2603484 OR 2603421
FAX: 031 – 2603595
E-MAIL: WASSERMANNJ@UKZN.AC.ZA
OR WAHLBERGB@UKZN.AC.ZA
CONTENTS

Intellectual Thoughts

F Pretorius

Unfair “affirmative action” in South African historiography

J du Pisani

Learners, teachers, professors and historical consciousness

G Sutton

The layering of history. A brief look at eugenics, the holocaust and scientific racism in South Africa

J Wasserman

The historical consciousness of Afrikaner adolescents - A small scale survey

A Wagana

Spirituality of African woman: A necessary change for moral development in the 21st century

E Mackie

Histories that creep in sideways: a study of learner’s attitudes to history and their senses of the past

Methodolgy

E Smuts

Create a usable sense of the past: working with sources

H Steyn & M de Kock

Use of the DBD (Digital Book disk) for effective teaching in history

M Carr & H Barclay

An educational tour of the Hector Pieterson Museum for high schools development by learners using OBE principles

C Bertram

An analysis of Grade 10 History assessment tasks
R Siebörger
In the beginning.... Where to start in history teaching? 161

L van der Merwe
The "how to" of history teaching with and through music in the GET phase 173

S Zimmerman
The visual medium in the history classroom 193

C Jooste
Plaaslike geskiedenis as ‘n genre vir sekondêre geskiedenis onderrig met verwysings na spesifieke bronnemateriaal beskikbaar in Laudium 205

History Educator

M Ntabeni
History teaching, learning and Junior Certificate (JC) Examination results in Lesotho, 2000-2006: Implications for teacher education 218

J R Wilson
The high stakes of remembering the past in South African history & Social Sciences classroom: Creating a way forward for the white staff & students 239

P McMahon
How relevant is the History teacher in the 21st century?? 255
Intellectual Thoughts
I have some concern that the Afrikaner does not figure in the “New History” books on South African history, except as the scapegoat and the villain. The Afrikaner is ignored particularly in the historiography covering the nineteenth century. For most non-Afrikaans historians South African history has become the suffering, struggle and eventual victory of the suppressed masses, that is, African or black history – the African struggle. Afrikaners are judged and condemned in negative terms. Just like there was a “native problem” in Afrikaner national historiography, there is now an “Afrikaner problem”. The Afrikaner has achieved nothing positive in the history of South Africa. The pendulum has indeed swung to the other side. For the victor reconciliation seems to mean that the view of the majority has triumphed. There is no room for other views beside the “official” view.

This intolerant new view on history is nowhere better illustrated than in a series of six history books published by the Institute for Justice and Reconciliation with the overall title of *Turning points in history*.1 And do not underestimate the impact of this series. In the latest matriculation examination paper for history (higher grade, October/November 2005) of the National Department of Education it was expected of learners to comment on an extract from *Turning points in history.*2

The planning of the *Turning point* series was launched with commendable goals, judging from the point of departure expressed by the chairperson of the editorial committee, Professor Bill Nasson. He reckons that, in contrast to the one-sided Afrikaner-centric school histories in the era of apartheid, “it is the responsibility of a democratic perspective to embrace not only the experiences of different groups but also to reflect the existence of divergent historical memories in the making of a shared past.”3
But do not be fooled by this. Nasson’s writers have left him in the lurch. With the exception of a small number of authors in the series to give the past experiences of all the different communities in South Africa, most of them seem to embrace a different meaning than Nasson to the concept “democratic perspective.”

With regard to Book 2, *The impact and limitations of colonialism*, Jeff Peires discusses the uneven development of colonialism in South Africa. A whole page is devoted to condemning the “atrocities” of the Boers in 1854 in the “Makapansgat massacre”, when between one and three thousand Africans were murdered out of revenge for the murder on 28 Boers in three separate incidents. It is noticeable that nowhere in the series is there a reference to the Zulu “atrocities” in February 1838 on the Voortrekkers at Bloukrans or to the killing of Piet Retief and his party that preceded the Bloukrans incident. As a matter of fact, there is no reference to the battle of Blood River (Ncome) – neither in Book 2, nor in Book 3, where the Great Trek receives more attention.

Two pages are devoted to Sir Harry Smith, British Governor at the Cape, and King Msoshoeshoe of the Basotho also receives attention, but Andries Pretorius and Piet Retief’s contribution to South African history vanishes into oblivion, though Andries Pretorius is called “the leader of the Transvaal Republic” – which in effect he was not. And I would reckon that in this age of reconciliation one could make something of Retief’s intent in his Manifesto, where he confirms the desire of the Voortrekkers to live in peace and friendship with the black communities in the interior. But obviously it does not fit in with the image that the author (Yonah Seleti, “State formation in nineteenth-century South Africa”) wants to convey. In the chapter by Wayne Dooling in Book 2 on the development of colonial slave society, there are extensive portrayals of the experiences of the slaves at the Cape. In vain one looks for a similar portrayal of the Voortrekkers on trek.

In Book 3, entitled Migration, land and minerals in the making of South Africa, the chapters of Yonah Seleti on state formation in nineteenth-century South Africa and Timothy Keegan on imperialism and the union of South Africa catch the eye. I would reckon that in this age of reconciliation one could make something of Retief’s intent in his Mani-
festo, where he confirms the desire of the Voortrekkers to live in peace and friendship with the black communities in the interior. But obviously it does not fit in with the image that the author (Yonah Seleti, “State formation in nineteenth-century South Africa”) wants to convey.

In the chapter by Wayne Dooling in Book 2 on the development of colonial slave society, there are extensive portrayals of the experiences of the slaves at the Cape. In vain one looks for a similar portrayal of the Voortrekkers on trek.

In Book 3, entitled Migration, land and minerals in the making of South Africa, the chapters of Yonah Seleti on state formation in nineteenth-century South Africa and Timothy Keegan on imperialism and the union of South Africa catch the eye. Rightly Seleti states that the history of nineteenth-century South Africa has been a history of struggles for dominance and resistance to dominance. And it is laudable that he discusses both the liberal and the Cobbing theory on the Mfecane or black migrations. However, these seven pages overshadow the four pages on the Great Trek. Noticeably black on black violence is not discussed in detail or condemned, but, as indicated above, Voortrekker “atrocities” on black people are presented extensively. Shaka isn’t a murderer, but Piet Potgieter is.

It is good that Seleti places different views on the Great Trek alongside each other. This is what Bill Nasson meant by a democratic perspective. But to declare that wherever the Voortrekkers went they found African societies that were better organised than they were, is highly contentious. Fact of the matter is that the Voortrekkers were on trek, and the moment they came to a relative halt, they established their own republics, admittedly initially frail and poor, but with a constitution, representation by the people and democratic franchise for all white male citizens, thirty years before all male citizens received the vote in Britain. Anybody complaining that the Boers did not give the vote to Africans, think a-historically and apply an early twenty first century norm to the nineteenth century. How many indigenous people (“Red skins”) had the vote in the southern states of the USA in 1852?

Seleti’s chapter is stimulating, and he acknowledges that both the Mf-
ecane and the Great Trek changed the face of South Africa — in contrast to the well-known *Oxford history of South Africa* that relegated the Great Trek to a sub-section of the rise of the Zulu kingdom.

Timothy Keegan’s revisionist petticoat is clear to see. He seems to have 1994 in mind all the time. In his treatment of the Anglo-Zulu War the battles of Isandhlwana and Ulundi are mentioned, and there is even a photograph of Isandhlwana hill, but no battle of the Anglo-Boer War or South African War of 1899-1902 is mentioned. Not even Majuba in the first Anglo-Boer War of 1880-1881. There we merely read: “The Boers pushed the British out again in 1881”.

Keegan only concedes two lines to Paul Kruger (p. 45) – the man who led the Boers/Afrikaners through a critical period in their emergent national consciousness and struggle to maintain their freedom – and that in a negative way, stating that Kruger was not always sympathetic to the needs of the mining industry. That’s all. On the other hand, much attention is paid to Cecil Rhodes (pp. 45-46), plus a large photograph (p. 47), part of which is even on the front page of Book 3. There are six lines on the nature of the Anglo-Boer War (South African War) of 1899-1902, with no reference (as has been mentioned) to any battle, but also no reference to any Boer leader in a struggle for freedom against foreign domination with which the modern South African could identify him- or herself. On the other hand the role of Africans in this war is covered in nine lines, and tells us of the many deaths in the African concentration camps. Nothing is mentioned of the deaths in the white concentration camps. This is unfair “affirmative action” in the historiography of South Africa par excellence. And then more than a page and a half is devoted to the question what role Africans played in shaping their history.

In Book 4, *Industrialisation, rural change and nationalism*, Rachidi Molapo devotes 33 lines to a discussion of how Africans were affected by migration to the cities – whites get eight lines.

Albert Grundlingh’s chapter on Afrikaner nationalism in the 1930s and 1940s is, as with all his work, stimulating. His analyses are honest and perceiving, and make a meaningful contribution to the debate on South
Africa’s past. I would regard his chapter as an asset to the series.

I refrain from commenting on Book 5: *People, places and apartheid* and Book 6: *Negotiation, transition and freedom*, and leave it to people who are more acquainted with the second half of the twentieth century than I.

The lack of Afrikaans sources or works by Afrikaner historians in the whole series is noticeable. Only a few are mentioned in the bibliographies. This is not the way to achieve Professor Nasson’s ideal of a democratic perspective. The most important African writers are there. But when it comes to the choice of illustrations and photographs, the series shines in its one-sidedness. If one does not consider Book 1 on ancient civilizations and global trade and one makes a list of objects from British/English, Boer/Afrikaner and African origin, the result is amazing. There are only twelve illustrations of Boers/Afrikaners, of which one is Dr Beyers Naudé. Nine British personae are portrayed. On the other hand there are at least forty photographs or illustrations of Africans, and they are often presented in the captions as the exploited.

It is true that one-sided national Afrikaner viewpoints characterised our school textbooks in the era of apartheid. It was – depending on your point of departure – the Great Lie, or the Great Truth. And that was a mistake. In 1994 democracy was established and there is rightly a need for a new interpretation of the past, a democratic interpretation that illuminates the experiences of the different communities, in effect an affirmative action in our historiography. But for the sake of reconciliation the pendulum must not now swing to the other side. The question is whether the New Great Lie or New Great Truth is now upon us?

In recent times a number of voices have been raised that unwittingly are connected to *Turning points in history*. The first was Wilhelm Jordaan’s article in a column in the Afrikaans newspaper Beeld of 2 November 2005, entitled “Van mens tot mens”. He pleads for an integrated approach to the past, and points out the subjective presentation of the past in the apartheid dispensation. He reckons there should not be a subjective claim to history, as was long the case with official white historiography on for example the Anglo-Boer War (South African War).
On the other hand he states that Africans cannot now claim the Anglo-Boer War for themselves. Thirdly he pleads for an integrated history of the whole, where the narratives of the different communities must exist alongside each other. This viewpoint reminds strongly of my argument in the final chapter of the book Scorched earth in 2001. I quote: “While Afrikaner politicians and Afrikaner historians in the twentieth century claimed the war for Afrikaners, the opportunity now exists to study the war in its totality – including the scorched earth policy. However, it is important not to wipe Afrikaner feats and Afrikaner suffering from the table. New perspectives must complement, not supplant, each other. It is equally important now not to view black involvement and suffering as the only perspective on the war. No group may claim the Anglo-Boer War for itself. It would be healthy to allow room for various perspectives on the war – including for example, different perspectives among Afrikaners. It is indeed important to convey a broad and multifaceted perspective to the South African nation and the outside world.”

A second voice that has relevance to Turning points in history, was Z.B. du Toit’s report on the front page of Rapport of 6 November 2005, with the heading “Regstel-aksie vasgevat” (Affirmative action taken to task). It informs us that the machine is in motion for a code of practice to eradicate unfair or unjust racial discrimination or excessive affirmative action in the working place in South Africa. The campaign stems from a discussion on 20 August 2005 when a senior government delegation under the leadership of Dr Essop Pahad, minister in the office of the State President, discussed fundamental issues with a group of Afrikaner leaders under Mr F.W. de Klerk. According to Rapport the two delegations agreed in a mutual statement that a code of practice for the fair application of affirmative action be developed. Rapport quotes Mr Dirk Herman, spokesperson for the trade union Solidariteit, as saying that one of the main aims with the fair code of practice is to counteract the alienation of some South Africans (that is, Afrikaners) by stopping new forms of racial discrimination.

The third voice relevant to Turning points in history, was Beeld’s leading article on 8 November 2005 with the heading: “Regstelkode” (Code of affirmative action). It comments on the initiative to draft a code of practice against unfair affirmative action in the South African work-
ing place. It criticises the over-eager application of affirmative action by some companies who in this way render themselves guilty of a new form of discrimination. Beeld says: “It is therefore important that it is constantly emphasised that unfair application of affirmative action, like apartheid, marginalizes the victims and that South Africa cannot afford to return to the practices of the past.”

How do these voices relate to Turning points in history? The point is that South Africa should, over and above the attempt to check unfair affirmative action in the working place, also avoid unfair “affirmative action” in the new historiography. Otherwise there is going to be alienation and marginalization. It is already present? Is the Afrikaner historian already on the sideline? Turning points in history indicates that. But then it is our task to write objectively, with unbiased judgment on the past.

References

1 The *Turning points in history* series, with Bill Nasson as chairperson of the editorial board, is a joint initiative of the South African History Project in the Department of Education and the Educating for Reconciliation Programme of the Institute for Justice and Reconciliation (Johannesburg, 2004).


5 B Nasson (ed), *Turning points in history*, Book 3, Migration, land and minerals in the making of South Africa.


7 FA van Jaarsveld, Honderd basiese dokumente by die studie van die Suid-Afrikaanse geskiedenis 1648-1961 (Johannesburg, 1972), p. 54, from The Graham’s Town Journal, 2 Februarie 1837.


LEARNERS, TEACHERS, PROFESSORS AND HISTORICAL CONSCIOUSNESS

Kobus du Pisani
North-West University, Potchefstroom

Abstract

The following main points will be covered:

- What is historical consciousness and why is it significant?
- The level of development of historical consciousness among SA learners;
- Possibilities of a historical consciousness approach to history teaching;
- Obstacles in the way of closer co-operation in this regard between stakeholders such as history professors, teachers and learners;
- Recommendations to try and forge a stronger partnership between these stakeholders in the development of historical consciousness;

Introduction

Each individual, group, culture, nation, state has a vision of the past, which is not possible without historical consciousness. Many authors have attempted to define the concept of historical consciousness (see e.g. Brightman, 1990: 109; Collingwood, 1946: 7-10; Lucaks, 1988: 340-341; Marcus, 1980: 205; Rauche, 1990: 14-15; Rüsen, 1993: 195). From all of these definitions, in some cases very high-sounding formulations, following tentative definition:

Historical consciousness is a dynamic (i.e. not a static, but a forever changing) and culturally based and determined mental awareness of how a string of historical events of the past has conditioned the current position of an individual as part of a larger group. This mental awareness involves a consciousness of various elements, e.g. a perspective on time and chronology, an ability to periodise, an ability to recognize change and transition, an ability to establish cause and effect, and a sense of development. Historical consciousness influences the behaviour of the individual and group in the present and his/her/their aspirations with
regard to the future.

Jörn Rüsen (1993: 195) identifies experience, interpretation and orientation as key elements of historical consciousness. Through historical consciousness one experiences the past, interprets it as history, and receives life-orientation. Rüsen in particular has identified the development of historical consciousness as an indispensible function of the practice of history as a discipline. The development of a sound historical consciousness plays a crucial role in the education of people to fulfil their role as citizens in any society. Historical consciousness is highly significant for both the individual and the group in a variety of ways, some of which I only mention here briefly.

**What is historical consciousness and why is it significant?**

In the first place, historical consciousness provides a temporal orientation, through which the human self extends itself beyond mere mortality and becomes part of a temporal whole larger than that of his/her personal life. It addresses current issues in terms of their historical roots and shows the implications for the present and the future. It gives meaning to the past in such a way that it orientates society in the present. It provides a crucial link between past, present and future and helps a person to interpret the present through the past and develop a future orientation. The essence of historical consciousness thus does not lie in merely remembering and transmitting the past, but in the way it helps us view the present and in shaping the thoughts and actions that will determine the future (see Esposito, 1984: 61; Osagie, 1997: 64-66; Rüsen, 1993: 66-67; Schieder, 1978: 1).

Secondly, historical consciousness also plays a crucial role in shaping the cultural identity of both the individual and the group, based on perceptions of the past. It presents a vision on the world and on the position of the individual and the group in the world. As a collective memory history acts as a conscious or unconscious influence on the decisions of individuals as well as on the collective actions of the great social forces that move in history. Historical experience has a formative influence on and clearly affects the mentality of groups (Kapp, 1997: 7).

In the third instance, historical consciousness helps to shape moral
values and thus serves as a moral force in determining human behaviour. Historical consciousness fulfills a mediating function between cultural determinism and moral free will and between values and action (Budick, 1989: 88; Marcus, 1980: 186; Rüsen, 1993: 66).

The level of development of historical consciousness among SA learners

Postgraduate studies undertaken under my supervision by Kwang-Su Kim (1997, 1999) revealed serious gaps in the development of historical consciousness among history students at South African universities. Some of the results of our empirical studies have been similar to those of the extensive study of the historical consciousness of 15 year old learners in Europe by the Körber Stiftung in Hamburg (see Anvik and Von Borries, 1997):

- Learners have a rather superficial interest in history, limited to the few topics with which they are familiar.
- The resources of their historical knowledge are limited to information received from teachers and parents and a narrow range of textbooks and popular media.
- They lack historical knowledge, particularly in fields such as economic history and international relations.
- Knowledge about the history of their own cultural group or of local history is often lacking.
- There are deficiencies in their understanding of time concepts, chronology and periodisation.

These empirical results imply that history teaching in South Africa seems to be missing its goals and that the functions of historical consciousness in terms of temporal orientation, identity formation and moral education may be severely impeded in the case of many or even the majority of learners at South African schools and universities.

Possibilities of a historical consciousness approach to history teaching

One way to address the inadequacies in terms of history teaching may
be to follow an approach specifically aimed at developing the historical consciousness of learners. What are the possibilities of a historical consciousness approach to history teaching?

In his doctoral thesis, done at Unisa, Gerald Mazabow (2003) proposes a historical consciousness approach to the teaching of history at school. He contends that it is compatible with OBE and consonant with the highest didactical criteria. He has developed a model, aligned to the policy and curriculum statements of the Department of Education and complete with an applicable learning programme organiser, specific outcomes, practical classroom examples and assessment methods, which will place historical consciousness at the centre of the educational task of the history teacher.

I do not wish to go into the details of the merits and demerits of Mazabow’s model, but only wish to state that in my opinion there are many potential benefits of such an approach. A list of positive outcomes for learners of a historical consciousness approach to history teaching have been identified in the literature:

- Historical knowledge, understanding and skills are developed
- The capacity to participate in the ongoing dialogue between historical and contemporary reality is enhanced
- Moral consciousness, an awareness of values and the ability to make sound value judgements are fostered
- The ability to understand and demonstrate civic responsibility and democratic values is developed
- The preservation of tradition, culture and collective identity is promoted
- A multi-perspective interpretation of history is cultivated and empathetic understanding nurtured.
- A clear perception of the interrelatedness between past, present and future events is developed.
- The competence is acquired to form an overall picture in which each particular event of the past is part of a wider whole.
- The ability is developed to ascribe meaning to the learner’s own present situation in a manner which reflects the value he/she attaches to the past, and the expectations he/she has for
the future.

To the degree in which his/her historical consciousness is developed a person will be able to:

- Develop an insight into and an understanding of the historical background of contemporary problems and phenomena.
- Develop an historical open-mindedness regarding issues and a critical appreciation of the value and role of historical heritage and tradition.
- Acquire knowledge and understanding of the uniqueness and interdependence of human relations on micro and macro level in order to develop a national and international vision (Kapp, 1996: 2).

I agree with Mazabow (2003: 28) that the historical consciousness approach has the potential to restore the dignity of history as a subject and cultivate an ability in learners to overcome impediments which obstruct their attainment of an authentic knowledge and understanding of the past. Conceiving history as a process that encompasses the past, present and future might lead to a new appreciation of the legacy and meaning of the past, and to a new capacity to assess and judge contemporary problems and complexities within the context of their evolution in time.

**Historical consciousness and a multi-perspective interpretation of history**

Scholars such as Martin Trümpelmann (1990) and Pieter Kapp have argued the case for a multiperspective approach to the past in history teaching. An approach specifically focused on the development of historical consciousness will promote precisely this type of multiperspective approach, which is needed to counter the danger of a so-called politically correct or officially endorsed version of the past, which is one-sided and divisive.

Such an approach will deal with the conflicting interpretations of the South African past by taking into account the diversity of our population. It will appreciate the fact that for different groups with different
values the events of the past have different meanings. We can only appreciate the caleidoscopic nature of the South African past when our historical consciousness has reached a level of maturity.

It will also inculcate a strong sense of identity, of who we are and where we come from. This is a prerequisite for the appropriation by each individual and group of a specific part of the colourful tapestry of the past. Thus the relative place and role of events and people are put into perspective. Furthermore it will create the sense of a contested but shared past. The task of the historian and history teacher is to incorporate the different values and perceptions in South African society into a dynamic vision of the past which would promote understanding of one another and tolerance. Learners need to understand that there is no simplistic division of heroes and villains in the past, and that guilt is not limited to one group. The past is a mixture of good and bad. Intellectual engagement with the self and the other in terms of a divided and shared past will culminate in the appropriation of co-ownership and co-responsibility.

Thus, if a high level of historical consciousness can be attained maturity and tolerance become possible.

The shared responsibility of historians, history teachers and learners of history

In his study Mazabow (2003: 254-263) identifies the following tasks at hand to develop a historical consciousness approach to history teaching:

- Training educators in the historical consciousness approach.
- Developing methodologies for the historical consciousness approach.
- Revamping the content and scope of the curriculum to accommodate the historical consciousness approach.
- Promoting history as a discipline as a means to advance the historical consciousness of learners.
- Further research on the historical consciousness approach to history teaching.
Historians, history teachers and learners of history have a shared responsibility in realizing the ideal of a mature historical consciousness by working together in addressing these challenges.

**Obstacles to stakeholder co-operation**

Based on my own experience as an academic historian I would venture to state that some serious obstacles to stakeholder co-operation in the field of history teaching have arisen over the past number of years. In my view there are deep divisions in the history teaching profession in this country. Although many of these divisions may stem from the divisions of our apartheid past, others have arisen after 1994.

From my personal perspective I have experienced these divisions within the university and between the university and the schools. Within the university, at least as far as our own university is concerned, there has been a tendency for the Faculty of Education and the other Faculties that accommodate subjects which are also taught in the schools to drift apart. Because of several reasons, which I do not wish to discuss in any detail here, our university’s Faculty of Education has, apart from the didactical training of would-be teachers, also taken over the task of teaching the content of subjects such as History, English, Maths, etc. We, as subject specialists, feel that we have been increasingly sidelined in the training of history teachers. I have heard that at other universities there are similar trends, but it probably differs from university to university. For obvious reasons, on which I do not have the space to dwell here, this is not a good thing in terms of the training of history teachers.

To me it seems that there is a general lack of communication and co-operation in the broader history teaching profession. Perhaps as a result of the drifting apart of the Faculty of Education and the History Department at our university myself and the other lecturers in our department have also lost track with what is happening in history teaching in the schools. Many years ago I used to often consult with history subject advisors of the provincial Department of Education. I served on task teams of the province. On several occasions I addressed history teachers on aspects of our discipline. Many history teachers used to register for honours and masters studies in history. None of these things are
For a while I tried to keep track with the establishment of an SGB for history. Today I do not even know whether such an SGB has eventually come off the ground. When Kader Asmal was our national minister and the History Project was alive and well, I often got invitations to meetings and workshops. I have not had any communication from the national or provincial Departments of Education for many months. It may be partially my own fault, but I know of many other history professors who have had the same experience. We do not wish to sit in ivory towers, we would really like to get involved in building our discipline from the ground at all levels where it is practiced.

**Recommendations for partnerships**

Is it not now, at a time of crisis for our discipline, the moment to seek closer co-operation between stakeholders? I would like to make the following recommendations as a starting point for forging closer partnerships between all of us who have the common interest of promoting history in general and historical consciousness in particular:

- We should improve the communication between the various stakeholders. I think the South African Society of History Teaching and other organizations, such as the Southern African Historical Society and the Historical Association of South Africa, which have the infrastructure in the form of their management committees, should take a leading role to approach the national and provincial Departments of Education to establish better channels of communication.

- We should establish exactly what common ground does exist between us. At least we may be able to identify a set of common objectives for the broader history teaching profession. The development of a mature historical consciousness among learners at all levels, the topic of this paper, would probably be one of the major objectives, with a number of subgoals, perhaps in the form of the list of tasks at hand stated above.

- In terms of the development of historical consciousness and oth-
er common objectives that may be identified, the broader history teaching profession ought to engage in co-operative ventures, where our different levels of experience and expertise can be pooled more efficiently.

Furthermore it will create the sense of a contested but shared past. The task of the historian and history teacher is to incorporate the different values and perceptions in South African society into a dynamic vision of the past which would promote understanding of one another and tolerance. Learners need to understand that there is no simplistic division of heroes and villains in the past, and that guilt is not limited to one group. The past is a mixture of good and bad. Intellectual engagement with the self and the other in terms of a divided and shared past will culminate in the appropriation of co-ownership and co-responsibility.

Thus, if a high level of historical consciousness can be attained maturity and tolerance become possible.

**The shared responsibility of historians, history teachers and learners of History**

In his study Mazabow (2003: 254-263) identifies the following tasks at hand to develop a historical consciousness approach to history teaching:

- Training educators in the historical consciousness approach.
- Developing methodologies for the historical consciousness approach.
- Revamping the content and scope of the curriculum to moderate the historical consciousness approach.
- Promoting history as a discipline as a means to advance the historical consciousness of learners.
- Further research on the historical consciousness approach to history teaching.

Historians, history teachers and learners of history have a shared responsibility in realizing the ideal of a mature historical consciousness by working together in addressing these challenges.
Obstacles to stakeholder co-operation

Based on my own experience as an academic historian I would venture to state that some serious obstacles to stakeholder co-operation in the field of history teaching have arisen over the past number of years. In my view there are deep divisions in the history teaching profession in this country. Although many of these divisions may stem from the divisions of our apartheid past, others have arisen after 1994.

From my personal perspective I have experienced these divisions within the university and between the university and the schools. Within the university, at least as far as our own university is concerned, there has been a tendency for the Faculty of Education and the other Faculties that accommodate subjects which are also taught in the schools to drift apart. Because of several reasons, which I do not wish to discuss in any detail here, our university’s Faculty of Education has, apart from the didactical training of would-be teachers, also taken over the task of teaching the content of subjects such as history, English, maths, etc. We, as subject specialists, feel that we have been increasingly sidelined in the training of history teachers. I have heard that at other universities there are similar trends, but it probably differs from university to university. For obvious reasons, on which I do not have the space to dwell here, this is not a good thing in terms of the training of history teachers.

To me it seems that there is a general lack of communication and co-operation in the broader history teaching profession. Perhaps as a result of the drifting apart of the Faculty of Education and the History Department at our university myself and the other lecturers in our department have also lost track with what is happening in history teaching in the schools. Many years ago I used to often consult with history subject advisors of the provincial Department of Education. I served on task teams of the province. On several occasions I addressed history teachers on aspects of our discipline. Many history teachers used to register for honours and masters studies in history. None of these things are happening any longer.

For a while I tried to keep track with the establishment of an SGB for history. Today I do not even know whether such an SGB has eventually come off the ground. When Kader Asmal was our national minister
and the History Project was alive and well, I often got invitations to meetings and workshops. I have not had any communication from the national or provincial Departments of Education for many months. It may be partially my own fault, but I know of many other history professors who have had the same experience. We do not wish to sit in ivory towers; we would really like to get involved in building our discipline from the ground at all levels where it is practiced.

**Recommendations for partnerships**

Is it not now, at a time of crisis for our discipline, the moment to seek closer co-operation between stakeholders? I would like to make the following recommendations as a starting point for forging closer partnerships between all of us who have the common interest of promoting history in general and historical consciousness in particular:

- We should improve the communication between the various stakeholders. I think the South African Society for History Teaching and other organizations, such as the Southern African Historical Society and the Historical Association of South Africa, which have the infrastructure in the form of their management committees, should take a leading role to approach the national and provincial Departments of Education to establish better channels of communication.

- We should establish exactly what common ground does exist between us. At least we may be able to identify a set of common objectives for the broader history teaching profession. The development of a mature historical consciousness among learners at all levels, the topic of this paper, would probably be one of the major objectives, with a number of subgoals, perhaps in the form of the list of tasks at hand stated above.

- In terms of the development of historical consciousness and other common objectives that may be identified, the broader history teaching profession ought to engage in co-operative ventures, where our different levels of experience and expertise can be pooled more efficiently.
Who should take the lead? Seeing that we, as the history professionals at the tertiary education level, are the ones who seem to be feeling left out, the initiative should probably come from us.

But our professional associations do not really have a track record of keeping intact the communication lines with the rest of the history teaching profession. Would it be too much to expect from the management committee of the South African Society for History Teaching to establish some sort of consultation forum for the broader profession? In my opinion that would be a great service to our profession.

References


THE LAYERING OF HISTORY
A BRIEF LOOK AT EUGENICS, THE HOLOCAUST AND SCIENTIFIC RACISM IN SOUTH AFRICA.

Gill Sutton
Herzlia Middle School, Kenwyn, Cape Town

Writing in 1995, Saul Dubow made the following comment, “undeniably, racism has been, and remains, an inseparable part of the structure of South Africa society. Patterns of paternalism and prejudice have been deeply embedded in the collective mentalities of white South Africans, for whom notions of superiority, exclusivity and hierarchy exist as more or less conscious ‘habits of mind’”. ¹

Recent experience, in the History classroom, has caused me to stop and reflect on how the ‘mind of South Africans’ – all South Africans, reflects a struggle with the past and a reluctance to think deeply about its present implications. For example, recently in a Grade 9 History class, while discussing Nazi racial theory I had a learner hold up a ‘Nik Naks’ chip packet and point to the ‘Nik Nak figure’ as an illustration of ‘a wrong’ being committed in South Africa. After further questioning it was stated that the learners felt that they were on the receiving end of ‘reverse discrimination or racism’. The discussion is one of many that I have experienced with my classes. Each time I think that I have explained our past and the implications for the present I am confronted with a new example. If Saul Dubow is correct and ‘race thinking’ is a ‘habit of the mind’ how do I as an educator begin to deconstruct this thinking for my learners and evidently for their parents?

Thinking about ‘race’ and how we ended up in a world ‘full of race’ has forced me into reading more about the theories that surround racial ideology. The Grade 11 NCS requires educators to examine what the impact was of pseudo-scientific racism and Social Darwinism on the 19th and 20th century. This includes the eugenics movement in the late 19th century and its impact on the ideas of race and racism in Africa, the USA, Australia, Europe and particularly leading to genocide in Nazi Germany. This may be helpful, however many learners select not to do History to Grade 12 and hence the theories and practices remain unknown.
The focus of this paper is a reflection on an on-going investigation into how the eugenics movement developed and impacted on South Africa and how ‘eugenics thinking’ facilitated the establishment of a foundation of racists thinking in the minds of white South Africans which left the policy of segregation and the ideology of apartheid unquestioned and accepted as scientific fact. It is just a start.

The idea of investigating the development of eugenics in South Africa was prompted by a three-day workshop entitled Understanding Race, Eugenics and Human Rights that I had the privilege of attending last year at the Cape Town Holocaust Centre. It was run by Stephen Feinberg from the Holocaust Memorial Museum in Washington, D.C. It opened my eyes to a whole different world, and the international eugenics movement in the 19th and 20th century.

The origins of the word race is thought to be derived from the Arabic ras, meaning ‘beginning’, ‘origin’, or ‘head’. The idea that all the peoples of Europe belonged to one white race is credited to Professor Johann Blumenbach (1752 –1840). Blumenbach, a pioneer of comparative anatomy, and ‘skull analysis’ (craniometry) is generally credited with the invention of the ‘five-race scheme’ According to his analysis Europeans represented the highest racial type within the human species. His ideas became conventional wisdom and others followed in his footsteps. In 1855 Joseph-Arthur, Comte de Gobineau (1816 –82) made the following statement: “History shows that all civilization derives from the white race, and that a society is great and brilliant only so far as it preserves the blood of the noble race that created it. Peoples degenerate only in consequence of the various admixtures of blood which they undergo.”

This racial hierarchy was used in many cases to justify European dominance and imperialism. Although these ideas have been scientifically discredited and have ‘gone out of fashion’, for close on a hundred years they remained acceptable in scientific circles and accepted in society at large.

Race theory developed in a particular intellectual environment in which Evolution and Social Darwinism were being debated and discussed.
Charles Darwin’s (1809 – 1882) ideas about evolution and the processes of natural selection and the constant struggle for existence were picked up and extended by philosopher and sociologist Herbert Spencer (1820 –1903). He applied the theory of evolution to philosophy, psychology and the study of society. The result was the development of Social Darwinism, which espoused the idea of the ‘survival of the fittest’. The idea of human society being in an evolutionary process led some of Herbert Spencer’s followers to believe that society ought to weed out its unfit and permit them to die off so as not to weaken the racial stock. It was Charles Darwin’s cousin, Francis Galton that coined the term eugenics meaning ‘well born’ in 1883. Galton applied the principle of natural selection to humans, believing that the biological health of humans could be improved by ‘selective breeding’. He defined eugenics as “the study of agencies under social control that may improve or impair the racial qualities of future generations, either physically or mentally.” The eugenics movement saw itself as fostering the public good. It believed that scientific changes to human breeding habits would solve many of the complex problems faced by modern society. Eugenists favoured: better public health, family planning, more thoughtful preparation for marriage and education about human reproduction.

Two strains of eugenics developed. Those that argued that many of the social problems could be eliminated by discouraging or preventing the reproduction of individuals deemed genetically unfit. This was known as negative eugenics. On the other hand positive eugenics encouraged the reproduction of those who were deemed most genetically fit. Eugenic ideas began to spread around the world and societies and associations were set up in Argentina, Austria, Brazil, Canada, China, Finland, France, Italy, Japan, Mexico, Norway, Spain, Sweden, Britain and the United States. The assumption was that physical and psychological differences between individuals and ‘races’ were an indication of their relative worth. Eugenicists encouraged the reproduction of the ‘best and the brightest’ and discouraged reproduction of the ‘unfit’. They sought to isolate the genetic stock from the taint of allegedly ‘bad genes’. Those thought to be unfit included criminals, alcoholics, psychotics, the retarded, paupers, and those in poor physical health. This was extended to promote the purity of some ‘race’ groups over others and prevent racial mixing.
Eugenics in America had its origin in agricultural genetics. Every farmer knew the value of selective breeding. The man who promoted the idea of eugenics in America was Charles B. Davenport. He referred to the ‘science of human improvement by better breeding’. Davenport and others set up a Eugenics Committee of American Breeders Association in 1903. This was later followed by the Eugenics Record Office, founded in 1910 and merged in 1920 with the Station for Experimental Evolution which became the Department of Genetics at the Carnegie Institution, in Cold Spring, Long Island. Their work and views were publicized in books and magazine articles. They promoted exhibitions and conducted the “fitter family” contest to encourage eugenic thinking. Interest in the eugenics movement coincided with one of the greatest eras of U.S. immigration. During the first two decades of the 20th century between 600,000 and 1,250,000 immigrants entered America per year. Eugenicists began to express concern that the immigrants would weaken American biological stock. Hence they lobbied for federal legislation to be ‘selective’ about immigration and restrict those from ‘undesirable’ countries. This resulted in the Immigration Restriction Act of 1924.

Another aspect that was important was that of sterilization. Those deemed ‘defective’ were to be prevented from reproducing, thus reducing the burden of ‘social dependents’ who needed to be institutionalized. In America, according to Edwin Black, “elements of the philosophy were enshrined as national policy by forced sterilization and segregation laws, as well as marriage restrictions, enacted in 27 states. In 1909, California became the third state to adopt such laws. Ultimately, eugenics practitioners coercively sterilized some 60,000 Americans, barred the marriage of thousands, forcibly segregated thousands in colonies, and persecuted untold numbers in ways we are just learning. Before World War II, nearly half of coercive sterilizations were done in California, and even after the war, the state accounted for a third of all such surgeries. In its first 25 years of eugenics legislation, California sterilized 9,782 individuals, mostly women. Many were classified as bad girls, diagnosed as passionate, oversexed or sexually wayward.”

American eugenicists influenced the thinking of eugenicist around the world, and were proud of their influence on legislation in Nazi Germany. They recognized that the California Sterilization Law had influenced the
drafting of the German Law to Prevent Hereditary Diseased Offspring (1933). Maria Kopp, an American eugenicist visiting Germany in 1935, claimed, “Without information regarding sterilization in California, it would have been impossible to implement the comprehensive German sterilization program.”

Eugenic theory and practice was used to justify Nazi racial ideology and ultimately resulted in the ‘Final Solution’ – the extermination of the Jews of Europe.

For me the question that looms larger then life is, what was the influence of eugenics on South Africa’s racial ideology and practice? According to Saul Dubow, the presence of mainline eugenic thought in South Africa became visible in the years after the First World War. The most consistent and active promoter of eugenics was Prof. Harold B. Fantham (1876 –1937). He presented a number of academic papers to the South African Association of Science. In these papers he claimed that ‘the ultimate factor of national decline is racial deterioration…. There are two chief ways in which human betterment can be brought about, which may be summarized as (1) improving the individual, and (2) improving the race. It is clear that one great basis is that of heredity.’ He went on to say that, ‘the development of a eugenic conscience in the community as a whole is necessary’ and that the segregation of persons with marked hereditary defects was important. These people included ‘epileptics, idiots and habitual criminals. The development of the best mental and moral strains should be the ideal.’

In 1932 Prof. Fantham, together with Annie Porter presented a paper entitled, *Notes on some Cases of Racial admixture in South Africa*. The purpose of the paper was to summarize the effects of various racial admixtures, as seen in the descendants. The classification, ranking of the individual and racial hierarchy is evident in the text, which reads as follows (I have quoted one example in full):

**The D. Family**

Founder, German, with hints of coloured blood; foundress, Hottentot, who has never left South Africa; family 2 sons, 2 daughters. F1, eldest,
son, 27, light skin, light brown eyes, with slight coffee tints to the whites; lips, full, pouting; hair with slight crimp; intellectually bright but given to bragging, conceited, dandified. F1, second daughter, G., 25, fair skin, brown hair, hazel eyes. Rather marked full lips, pigmented patches on legs which are explained as due to an accident, always ailing, flashy in dress, musical tastes, violent explosions of temper at times; married to young, fair haired, blue-eyed German, who thinks her pure German; she is in terror of her coloured blood becoming known; infant son said to be like father, but with hazel eyes. F1, third daughter A., 19, big, fair, florid rather flabby, always suffering from chest trouble; very arrogant, overbearing, bad tempered, ashamed of her mother’s side of the family, bullies her brothers, domineers over her mother; has abandoned her family name and taken another German surname; unmarried. F1, fourth, son, P., 17, resembles his mother but has European type nose; narrow chest, coughs a good deal, not really strong; skin yellowish, hair slightly crimped but shining and fine; quiet, hardworking, well spoken, kind to his mother but on bad terms with his father, as he has not mastered German. In this family, F1 generation is physically weak and temperamentally unstable. The European influence is definite but varies in degrees. The native influence is more obvious in the two males than in the two females. There is antagonism between the whiter and less white members of the family, the former considering themselves white. The Hottentot mother is bitterly conscious of the position of her children. In her own words: “The whites look down on my family; the blacks spit at us; we are outcasts.”  

As can be seen this extract is riddled with the thinking of the eugenic movement of the 1920s and 30s. In the conclusion, Prof. Fantham and Annie Porter stated that, ‘in regard to conditions in South Africa, it would seem desirable that attention should be given to the maintenance of racial purity’ It is not difficult to see how these views and others like them were embraced and propagated in order to secure a racial hierarchy in South Africa.

The use of this text in a classroom allows the educator to highlight specific aspects of racial ideology, namely:

- Physical anthropology – the size of the lips, the crimpy hair, skin pigment etc.
The caricaturing of people according to Social Darwinian hierarchy of race – the German, the Hottentot (an explanation of etymology may be appropriate) etc.

Eugenics, the idea of how racial mixing causes a ‘degeneration’ of individuals revealed in suggestions around health problems, temperament (bragging, conceited, overbearing…) and language acquisition.

The suggested ‘fear of discovery’, ‘antagonism between siblings’ and people becoming ‘outcasts’.

Using one extract it would be possible to explore the main ideas on which the foundation of racial thinking has been built. Newspapers from the 1930s and 40s (and even later) are helpful in allowing learners to analyze the role of the media in moulding public thinking. The example of the Empire Exhibition of 1936 comes to mind.

A lot more could be said about public health, the nature of criminality and mental testing. All of these are areas that need further explanation and deconstruction. This would require the educator to prepare notes and questions or assessments that would assist in deconstructing the ideas of the past. As yet I haven’t undertaken this task, but I must admit I would like to experiment with these ideas in my Grade 9 classes next year.

I found an interesting comment by Hendrick Verwoerd quoted in Dan O’Meara’s Forty Lost Years. “He (Verwoerd)...told his wife in November 1960, [when the question of Coloured representation in the House of Assembly came up] that he was not the man who would lead the Afrikaners to ‘bastardization’... he publicly rejected the plea for the representation of Coloureds as a springboard for the integration of the races, leading to biological assimilation.” This clearly reflected the influence of biological determinism, which is the essence of eugenics. More over it encouraged me to consider doing more with my classes that simply teaching the apartheid laws.

How does all this help me as a History educator in South Africa today? I think that some of the discussion above answers this question. It could be stated that the policy of segregation and apartheid established as they were on a twisting of scientific theory (pseudo-science) in order to
meet social, economic and political ends has lead to a complex society in which race is still very much an issue in the minds of learners. It is my belief that it is important for learners to understand the process of knowledge acquisition. How ideas influence peoples thinking and how ideas can be used to manipulate. A more detailed explanation that goes deeper than simply explaining apartheid laws is needed. Learners could be encouraged to investigate and expose the false premise and resultant thinking behind the apartheid laws that still affects our thinking today. Hence the use of the example of ‘Family D’ is a powerful window in opening a range of preconceptions in the classroom. This together with other examples of stereotyping allows the educator to make explicit the similarities and differences between South Africa’s race policy and that of the United States and Germany.

There is a lot more that could be said. For me this is just the beginning of the process and I would welcome feedback and discussion.

References

Journals

*Illicit Union, Scientific Racism in Modern South Africa* by Saul Dubow, Page 5.

For a more detailed account of craniometry see *The Mismeasure of Man*, by Stephen Jay Gould

Jarred Diamond has a detailed deconstruction of ‘civilized people’ in his book *Gems, Guns and Steel: A History of Europe*, by Norman Davies, Page 734 - 735


From an article by Edwin Black, in the *San Francisco Chronicle*, Sunday, 9 November 2003.

Note from power point provided by Stephen Feinberg, at conference in 2005.

*Illicit Union, Scientific Racism in Modern South Africa* by Saul Dubow, Page 133

*Heredity in Man*, SAJS, no. 21, 1924,page 522 - 423

Ibid

Notes on Some Cases of Racial Admixture in South Africa, SAJS, no. 24, 1927, page 478 - 479


*Forty Lost Years* by Dan O’Meara, page 107.


‘Heredity in Man: Its Importance both Biologically and Educationally’, SAJS, 21 (1924).

‘Heredity in Man: Its Importance both Biologically and Educationally’, SAJS, 21 (1924).


"Some Thoughts on Biology and the Race", SAJS, 24 (1927).

“Biology and Civilization”, SAJS, 29 (1931)


Books


THE HISTORICAL CONSCIOUSNESS OF AFRIKANER ADOLESCENTS – A SMALL SCALE SURVEY

Dr. Johan Wassermann
Faculty of Education, UKZN

Introduction

After the National Party came to power in 1948 large scale changes were implemented to the educational system. These changes included the introduction of mass education and the enforcement of Apartheid in all spheres of life, including schooling. Most importantly, in the context of this paper, the National Party Government took firm control of History education and, until 1994 with the end of pigmentocracy, History school textbooks were written, curricula were devised, and the subject was generally taught from an Afrikaner-Nationalist perspective which, in crude terms, portrayed whites in general, and Afrikaners in particular, as heroes and people of colour as villains. Likewise History at certain universities was dominated by the agenda of the state. In Orwellian terms it was a case of he who controls the present controls the past, and he who controls the past controls the future. Consequently all South African learners were taught a History in which the struggles of the Afrikaner against both the Africans and the British were glorified. In turn the History of people of colour was portrayed as not so glorious. This changed after 1994 when History education, like all other aspects of South African society, was transformed. The new curricula envisaged, and eventually implemented, was a paradigm shift away, both in terms of content and methodology, compared to the Afrikaner Nationalist-orientated curricula of the past. As a result, Afrikaners in a reversal from their previous position of dominance and power, found themselves on the fringes of History. This did not go unnoticed and recently a lively debate took place between Professor Fransjohan Pretorius of the University of Pretoria and Doctor Fanie du Toit the project manager of the Turning Points History series in the pages of the Afrikaans Sunday newspaper, Rapport. Pretorius felt Afrikaners and their History were being marginalised, while Du Toit denied these accusations and argued for
a broader inclusive South African History.\textsuperscript{4} In the context of the above, more than a decade after all South Africans have gained their freedom, it is necessary to ask: Where does this leave Afrikaner adolescents and History, especially in the light of the History of History education in South Africa and the positions of power and dominance Afrikaners had in the past? This is a pressing question especially since none of the Afrikaner adolescents currently at school were ever exposed to the ideology of Afrikaner Nationalist-orientated History as the previous generations had been simply because they have undergone all their schooling in the post-1994 period. Instead, over the past decade, they had been exposed to the ideology as enshrined in the very liberal South African constitution which guarantees rights and freedoms for all - a philosophy which is embodied in the National Curriculum Statement (NCS) and the History Curriculum.\textsuperscript{5} The NCS, in turn, is supported by a range of new generation textbooks\textsuperscript{6} screens by a national committee, and in some instances published with the full support of the National Government.\textsuperscript{7}

The purpose of this study is therefore to investigate, against the backdrop as outlined above, the Historical Consciousness of Afrikaner adolescents in 2006.\textsuperscript{8}

**Historical Consciousness**

Over the past decade much has been written about Historical Consciousness and what it entails. *The Youth and History\textsuperscript{9}* project surveyed 31 000 15 year-olds in 26 European countries during 1994/1995.\textsuperscript{10} Similar research was also undertaken in the USA\textsuperscript{11} and Australia.\textsuperscript{12} According to Peter Seixas, one of the leading researchers into Historical Consciousness, contemporary analysis of the concept draws on many disciplines and intellectual traditions. These include Education, History, Memory Studies, Psychology and Museum Studies. Although this diversity could make for an interesting debate, it presents a problem when common ground is sought. In fact the range of voices is at times so varied that it is difficult to determine if they are involved in the same discussion. As a result Seixas argues for the need to find common ground.\textsuperscript{13} In the light of the above, and for the purpose of this paper, the working definition adopted by the Youth and History project, namely that Historical Consciousness is “the connection between the past, the pres-
ent and the future” (See Figure 1 below for a graphic depiction) will be used. The foremost reason for this, apart from accepting this as a convincing conceptualisation of Historical Consciousness, is that this small scale research project is not only using the same questionnaire as the Youth and History project, but is likewise investigating the connection between adolescent conceptions about the past, their evaluation of the present and the expectations of the future.14

Figure 1: Diagram of Historical Consciousness¹⁵

Methodology

The methodology employed in researching this paper involved administering questionnaires to a small sample population at a purposive selected Afrikaans co-educational school in a predominantly English speaking part of South Africa. The school was chosen because it provided accessibility to Afrikaner adolescents from across the socio-economic spectrum that could serve as respondents.16 The research population comprised 49 Grade 10 learners (n=49). All the respondents were white, Afrikaans speaking and 15-16 years of age. 63% were girls and 37% were boys, while 96% described themselves as Christian, and 51% regarded their income as average “when compared to other families in South Africa.” Girls were overrepresented in the sample, possibly because of the events planned in anticipation of the derby sport day against an Afrikaans school from another area. This gender-bias would
have affected the outcome of the research to a certain extent. Another limitation which emerged was the narrowness of the study - it was only conducted amongst 49 Afrikaner adolescents within a single school. However, while this will not necessarily allow for broad generalizations to be made, the survey conducted is still an excellent yardstick to measure the Historical Consciousness of Afrikaner adolescents.

A quantitative study such as this, according to Cresswell, falls within the empiricist paradigm which views reality as “objective”; “out there” and “independent” of the researcher. Within this context free paradigm it is thus deemed to be fairly possible to measure the Historical Consciousness of Afrikaner adolescents objectively, and use the data gathered to generalize, predict, explain, and come to some understanding.

According to Sanders and Pinhey a questionnaire is “…a form or document that contains a set of questions, the answers to which are to be provided personally by respondents.” Questionnaires are widely used in research as they have the following advantages: large quantities of information can be assembled in a short space of time and it is easy to administer and provides a fair overall reliability. In short, questionnaires are good to gauge people’s opinions.

Questionnaires are, however, not without problems. Dane, Cohen and Manion have identified these as relating to both the structuring and the organisation of the questionnaire and include aspects such as: the time-consuming nature of developing a questionnaire; problems relating to the development of categories, items and the recording and coding systems used in the questionnaire and the lack of motivation and commitment to the questions on the part of the respondents. By the same token questionnaires are problematic in the sense that the agenda is set by the researcher and the respondent is constraint to follow pathways. This serves to provide an impersonal static picture with facts and views given as almost concrete and fixed. Since the respondents do not have an opportunity to state, within the range of questions and answers provided, what they want, it does not allow for a dynamic flow of ideas. An equally pressing problem is the lack of validity and reliability. Validity refers to the correlation between what a measuring device, in this case a questionnaire, is supposed to measure and what it really measures. Reliabili-
ty, in turn, refers to the consistency with which an instrument measures what it sets out to measure.\textsuperscript{21} Fortunately, in the case of the questionnaire used in this research project, it had previously been administered to 31 000 adolescents in 26 countries.\textsuperscript{22} As a result problems of validity and reliability were greatly reduced, except for when certain questions were adapted to the South African context or omitted completely.

The questionnaire used in this paper was adapted from the one designed and developed to research the Historical Consciousness of European adolescents and consisted of four major sections with subsections – all geared towards measuring Historical Consciousness.\textsuperscript{23} The major sections were:

- Relevance of and motivation for History
- Chronological knowledge, Historical associations and Historical-Political concepts
- Political attitudes and decisions based on Historical experiences
- Relations of past, present, and future

In adapting the questionnaire from its original format, and when translating it into Afrikaans, a concerted effort was made to achieve absolute clarity in terms of what was expected from the respondents. To this end the stems used in the questions were phrased in such a way that the language was clear and concise.

This questionnaire consisted exclusively of structured or closed questions – 31 in total. Structured questions have the advantages of straightforward data tabulation and since this is not time-consuming, it is easy to code or answer.\textsuperscript{24} Closed questions, on the other hand, allow for the gathering of unproblematic facts and to determine points of view. The main disadvantage of structured questions is that it limits the response and does not allow the researcher to probe attitudes, values and opinions.\textsuperscript{25}

Generally a Likert rating scale - a non-numerical measurement on a scale indicating level of agreement - ranging from 1 to 5, was used. (See Figure 2 for an extract from the questionnaire). The justification for using a Likert scale is that it provides the respondents with opportunities to express their opinions and to indicate the degree to which the claims expressed the perceptions of the respondents. Where necessary, when creating tables for the purpose
of analysis, the 5 point Likert scale was collapsed into a three point scale – for example very little and little and a lot and very much were integrated. It was judged that this would not overly alter the general tendencies.

**Figure 2: Example of question from questionnaire**

- In your onion: How important is the following aims at the study of History? (Merely circle your point of view)
  - Knowledge of the past (very little/ little/ somewhat/ a lot/ very much)
  - To understand the present (very little/ little/ somewhat/ a lot/ very much)
  - Orientation for the future

For the purpose of this study the questionnaire used was applied under the supervision of the researcher. It was expected of respondents to complete the survey without the intervention of the researcher. Questionnaires completed under supervision are generally less time-consuming and are often the only viable way of carrying out research. Administering questionnaires in such a manner provides an opportunity to provide guidance. This is both a strong and weak point of the data gathering process. During the administration of the questionnaire under discussion numerous questions were asked by the respondents about the language used and the Likert scale employed. The researcher answered these questions, but at the same time consciously attempted not to intervene in the research process.

The survey was analysed by using the SPPS program to conduct descriptive and inferential statistical procedures. The resulting information was presented in the form of percentages, ranked according to the arithmetic mean. The data was further analysed by means of tables and graphs. Percentages were calculated for all questions which used the Likert scale. This was done to reveal trends such as similarities and differences between the sub-sets. Percentages are suitable
for this as they supply a frame of reference for reporting research results by standardising raw data and are also easier to read and comprehend than frequencies. Responses were further quantified by noting their rank with regard to the target dimension. This ranking was done by the use of the arithmetic mean or average. The arithmetic mean or average is obtained by adding all scores and dividing it by the number of scores. The sample size used in this study was such that the above statistical analysis was judged to be appropriate.

Data analysis and results

The survey conducted consisted of 31 questions and yielded a significant amount of research data. Due to constraints of space and time, and considering the research question posed, it is impossible, illogical and unnecessary to provide an analysis of all 31 questions. As a result only a cross-section of the data gathered was used to analyse the Historical Consciousness of Afrikaner adolescents and to draw some general conclusions. This was done in terms of the four major categories as outlined earlier. Furthermore it was decided, for the purpose of this paper, to use valid percentages in compiling the various graphs for analysis. The reasoning behind this was to provide accessible and an easy to digest set of statistical information.

Relevance of and motivation for History

- Concepts of History

**Question 1:** What does History mean to you?
Question 2: How important are the following aims in the study of History?

From the graphs related to questions 1 and 2 it is clear that the Afrikaner adolescents surveyed attached great value to History. It is furthermore evident that they do not subscribe to the archaic notion that History is merely related to the past and is thus separated from the present and the future. Evidence for this is that they regard it as much more than a school subject dealing with aspects of the past that are dead and gone. Instead 65% of the respondents view it as providing the backdrop to how we live at present, while more than 70% see it as providing us with an opportunity to learn from the past. The most convincing proof of this positive view of History is provided by the responses to question 2 where more than 60% of the respondents viewed
the aims of History as threefold – knowledge of the past, to understand the present and orientation for the future. This is in sharp contrast to the views of the majority of learners in South Africa to whom, in the words of Luli Callinicos, “history teaching had seemed irrelevant.”

**Questions 3 and 4:** What presentations of History do you enjoy? - What presentations of History do you trust?

The responses to which of the presentations of History they trusted and enjoyed expressed a range of contradictions. While Historical novels and films, and the presentations of adults other than teachers, were enjoyable they were viewed with suspicion. This seems to indicate a clear preference for fictional and audiovisual material framed by a different Historical Consciousness. An explanation for this tendency, as argued by Angvik, is that the “need of entertainment” supersedes the “wish for education.” On the other hand while Historical documents were viewed as highly reliable it was not regarded as an enjoyable presentation of History. Museums and other Historical places which make for an interactive, constructivist and visual learning experience were viewed uncritically and regarded as both extremely trustworthy and highly enjoyable. The reason for this is in all probability a case of “seeing is believing” while having fun at the same time – in other words the worlds of entertainment and education meeting. Alarmingly, at least for the school in which the survey was conducted, is the lack of trust and enjoyment placed in the History educators. Textbooks, which along with educators
should form the cornerstone of History Education and the shaping of Historical consciousness, were likewise viewed with suspicion. A possible cause of this, as pointed out by Pretorius in his criticism of the Turning Points series, is the portrayal of Afrikaners and their History in textbooks. Furthermore, a survey of the 21 authors and consultants of the textbooks recently published by Shuters, Oxford and Maskew Millar Longman indicated that none of them were Afrikaners. If the old adage of “first study the historian before studying his/her History” holds true then none of these authors would treat Afrikaner History with much sympathy.

**Motivation and Interest**

**Question 5:** How much interest do you have in the History of the following Geographical regions?

**Question 6:** How much interest do you have in the History of the following eras in the History of South Africa?
Question 7: How much interest do you have in the following types of History?

In terms of motivation and interest, as can be gleaned from the responses to questions 5, 6 and 7, a range of Historical preferences and interest exist amongst the research population. Pertaining to the History of regions a distinct preference was expressed for “World History” followed by “South African History”. It is clear, from the analysis of the data, that that local History (that of the city and the province) and African History attracts very little interest. The indifference in local History could possibly be explained by the fact that they preferred “meta narratives” rather than micro-history of everyday events or regions. Why then the lack of interest in African History (38.3%) despite feeling strongly about collaborating with Africa (66%) in question 14? A possible reason is supplied by Jörn Rösen who calls it “ethnocentrism” and explains it as “one’s own people historically stand for civilization and its achievements, whereas the otherness of others is a deviation from these standards.” As a result “Non-Western History normally plays a marginal role.”

In terms of South African History the Apartheid and post-Apartheid eras, with slightly more than 50%, attracted a great deal of interest. The reasons for this are probably three fold – it is contemporary History and the learners have to a certain extent lived and experienced it. Secondly it is an aspect of History that has received a lot of classroom coverage as required by the curriculum and on which much audiovisual material exists. At the same time they do not seem to suffer from or complain about
“a surfeit of Apartheid” like other learners of their age do. Two possibilities exist for this. Firstly the interest expressed by the Afrikaner adolescents surveyed in this dark or negative aspect of Afrikaner History means that they have integrate negative Historical experiences into the Historical self-consciousness which is in itself a necessary step for creating Historical Consciousness. In other words they are grappling positively with a painful past. A more disturbing possibility is that the Afrikaner adolescents surveyed, like those surveyed by the Truth and Reconciliation Commission as quoted by Hermann Gillomee, held positive views on Apartheid because it is viewed as a master narrative of an Afrikaner success story and one of the view aspects of the History taught in which they can “see themselves” as a group of people.

Iconic highlights of Afrikaner History in the past, the Great Trek and the Boer Republics, drew marginally less interest than Apartheid. Possible reasons for this are that only the Anglo-Boer War (called the South African War in the educational documents) appears as a cameo in the curriculum leading up to the grade the respondents found themselves in. Despite this lack of “curriculum time” the fact that such a high level of interest exists in these two topics is an indication of the enduring memory of these events. In contrast pre-History, or the History of South Africa prior to the arrival of Europeans, received very little interest. This was the case despite the fact that themes related to this topic, such as Human Evolution and Southern African Kingdoms such as Mapungubwe, were covered in the years leading up to Grade 10. This is a clear indication that the pedagogy in this case made no real inroads into the Historical Consciousness of the learners surveyed.

As far as types of History are concerned, the survey revealed that Genealogy and the History of royalty, celebrities and Environmental History were favoured. While the interest in the History of famous people can, to a certain extent, be attributed to the endless coverage of their lives in the print and electronic media. The strong interest expressed in Environmental History is interesting but consistent with the general value attached to environmental matters – see questions 13, 14, 16 and 17. Likewise the complete lack of interest expressed in the History of the development of democracy, the lowest score at a mere 29.8%, is in line with other aspects of the survey related to politics (65% indicated that...
they had no interest in politics) and democracy as covered in question 12. A possible reason for the lack of concern with politics is that the Afrikaner adolescent might view it as a waste because of the current position of disempowerment Afrikaners find themselves in when compared to the pre-1994 period. The strong interest in Genealogy (87.3%) is possibly best explained by Barton and Levstik who claim that it is “one of the most basic forms of Historical identification” that is common inside and outside schools. 39

Chronological knowledge, Historical associations and Historical-Political concepts

• Chronological knowledge

Question 8: Place the events in the order in which it happened in the History of South Africa. Place the earliest event first and the most recent event last.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event</th>
<th>1st</th>
<th>2nd</th>
<th>3rd</th>
<th>4th</th>
<th>5th</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Arrival of Van Riebeeck</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anglo-Boer War</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Great Trek</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fall of Apartheid</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arrival of Bantu</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Question 9: Place the following ships in the correct chronological order (1) is the oldest and (5) is the newest.

The rationale behind questions 8 and 9 is to gain a rudimentary understanding of the chronological understanding of Afrikaner adolescents. A range of variables, such as for example instruction on a topic, would have influenced the responses. From the analysis of the above questions it is clear that the respondents were generally highly successful in ranking the ships in the correct order, possibly because of the visual nature of the source. What proved more problematic was dealing
with the chronology of major events in South African History. What the adolescents found easy to place was the fall of Apartheid and 75.5% got it right. Other events proved more problematic to place. As a result the arrival of Jan Van Riebeeck - the start of European settlement in Southern Africa – was viewed by more than two thirds as the first event. Although his arrival hardly features in the latest History curriculum the ranking is an indication of the persistence of the memory of Apartheid era teaching which stated that Van Riebeeck arrived before the Bantu settlers. As a result the arrival of the Bantu settlers which should have been ranked number one is ranked second by 27.7% and fourth by 38.3% of the respondents. The latter response is probably a reading of the South African landscape over the past decade as millions of immigrants from other parts of Africa have made their way to South Africa. Ironically the Great Trek and the Anglo-Boer War, which under question 6 received a substantial amount of support as an era of interest, were not placed with great confidence in the timeline of events. Especially the Anglo-Boer War was viewed as a difficult event to place – despite the centenary commemorations which ended four years ago. Possible reasons for this are that it forms a miniscule part of the curriculum and then goes under the name South African War and that the commemorations for a range of reasons had lost its impetus by September 1999. 

- **Interpretations of the past**

**Question 10:** With what do you associate the changes in South Africa after 1994?
Question 11: With what do you associate Nelson Mandela?

The purpose of questions 10 and 11 was to gain insight into how Afrikaner adolescents interpreted the New South Africa which was created a couple of years after they were born and its iconic first president, Nelson Mandela. The Afrikaner adolescents surveyed, as an ethnic group, held very strong, and at times contradictory views, about post-Apartheid South Africa. Although they viewed it as a democracy with a strong economy that provides justice for all they also, paradoxically, felt that affirmative action (AA) (53.2%) was a form of racism and that the History and language of the Afrikaner were being oppressed. Especially the latter
point of view was strongly supported as 73.2% of the respondents subscribed to it. Possible reasons for this are provided by the prominent Afrikaner Historian Herman Gillomee who claims that Afrikaners are cynical about the politics and frustrated about the future because their ideology, Afrikaner Nationalism, has crumbled. From this political and ideological position the New South Africa is viewed as a marvelous place socio-politically and socio-economically speaking, to which they, in the Historical Consciousness that they have constructed, do not belong. Consequently a distinct danger exists that a separate and aggressive tribalism could develop amongst Afrikaners.

In the light of the above, former President Nelson Mandela received mixed views. Although the vast majority associated him with being the first president of South Africa they also strongly associated him with the ANC. Viewing Mandela as a “charismatic leader” and the “father of the people of South Africa” only received but lukewarm support, and not the universal adulation normally bestowed on him. What the respondents (61.7%) did feel very strongly about was that he was not “imprisoned as a terrorist.” Although the nature of the survey failed to elicit an answer to this point of view, it can be assumed that the powerful presence of Mandela in the media and in real life served to erode earlier accepted beliefs for his imprisonment. In the process a national myth has been created.

- **Historical-Political concepts**

**Question 12:** What is your point of view on democracy?

![Graph showing different opinions on democracy](image-url)
The responses on how democracy was viewed proved to be contradictory. What the Afrikaner adolescents felt very positive about was that it was government by the people BUT that it is something used by politicians during elections. Equally worrying for a young democracy such as South Africa’s is the indecision respondents had pertaining to democracy as a means of securing law and order, the rights of minorities as well as the position and role of the rich and powerful in the process. This notion was in all probability been shaped by experiences since 1994 which served to undermine the previous position of power and advantage of whites. As a result the respondents acknowledged the existence of democracy (question 10) as an integral part of the post-1994 landscape but, at the same time, in their Historical Consciousness as constructed in this period, viewed themselves, as explained in the previous section, as marginalised and distant from it.

- **Political attitudes and decisions based on Historical experiences**

**Question 13:** Imagine a new highway is planned for our city. In the process the sites listed below are threatened. How much energy would you spend on the protection of each?

The rationale behind question 13, in terms of Historical Consciousness, was to determine how Afrikaner adolescents linked past experiences and present decisions by argumentation. Topping the list, in terms of energy expenditure in saving certain sites in the face of development, is a park which contains the nests of threatened birds. Similarly a substan-
tial amount of energy would be expended to save other outdoor/environmental sites. The concern with the natural environment correlates positively with the interest expressed in question 7 for Environmental History and in question 14 in environmental preservation. The sincerity of this interest is supported by the fact that the respondents felt stronger about protecting the park with endangered birds than they did about protecting an old church. This is especially significant in light of the fact that 96% of the respondents regarded themselves as being Christian and that all (see question 14) regarded religion as extremely important to them. Surprisingly, particularly in the light of the sentiments expressed in question 10 that the History and language of Afrikaners were being oppressed since 1994, is the fact that only 34.7% of the adolescents would expend a lot of energy in saving the house of a Boer warrior. The reason for this is possibly one of aesthetics and morality which implies that it is of greater importance to save natural and religious sites. Unsurprisingly, in a clear statement of political ideology, very little energy (8.1%) would be exerted by the research population to save the statute of an ANC leader.

- Relations of past, present, and future

Question 14: How important is the following to you?

![Importance attached to factors](image)

Question 15: People tend to see History as a line in time. Which of the following lines do you think describes Historical development best?
Questions 16 and 17: What do you think life was like in South Africa 40 years ago?/What do you think life will be like in South Africa 40 years from now?

How then do Afrikaner adolescents, in the light of the working definition of Historical Consciousness as being the “the connection between the past, the present and the future”, view the relationship between the past, present and future in South Africa? As can be gathered from question 14, religion, peace at all costs, environmental preservation and freedom of speech top the list of factors they hold dear. Although freedom of speech is one of the cornerstones of democracy, the respondents, as part of a pattern revealed by the analysis of the data, clearly indicated
that they did not attach much importance to the broad philosophy of democracy but merely one aspect thereof – namely the right to speak out and criticise.

Although 65% of the respondents viewed themselves as South Africans rather than Afrikaners, this did not translate into practice as they attached slightly more importance to the ethnic group they found themselves in than to South Africa as a country. This hints at a feeling of marginalisation and not belonging to the post 1994 “born frees” but rather to a separate grouping with a different language and History that prefers to be unique. The surveyed group furthermore expressed substantial solidarity with the poor (69.6%), and were less concerned with those suffering from HIV/Aids (55.3%). Wealth and money were not considered as important. A possible explanation for the former point of view is that 51% of the respondents regarded their income as average “when compared to other families in South Africa.”

Considering the factors which the research population held true, how then do they view, in terms of Historical development, the past (40 years before – circa 1966) and future (40 years from now – circa 2046) of South Africa? In other words – how do they interpret the past and the future in present time? An analysis the responses to questions 16 and 17, as illustrated graphically above, indicates that ethnic and class conflict is seen as part of the past, present and future of South African existence, with the distinct possibility that it will even escalate by 2046. Violence and conflict was therefore seen as a static aspect of the South African existence over time.

The views held by the surveyed adolescents on other aspects hinted at deep changes in the fields of politics, economics and the environment over time. While the South Africa of 1966 was viewed as undemocratic, it was conceived as relatively prosperous and definitely unpolluted and sparsely populated. In contrast the South Africa of 2046 is being envisaged as a democratic but polluted and overpopulated place which could possibly be exploited by a foreign nation. Attempts were made, when analysing questions 10 and 11, to provide some reason for this pessimism of the future. Although the latter point of view does not correspond positively with the lack of support expressed in question 15.
for the statement that “events become worse over time”, Angvik argues that change is denied when asked about directly but accepted when it is done in an indirect manner as questions 16 and 17 did. 42

**Conclusion**

If a profile had to be compiled of the Historical Consciousness the Afrikaner adolescents surveyed have created it would possibly look something like this:

Someone that is Afrikaans speaking; very religious; shows no interest in politics; acknowledges the existence of democracy but does not embrace it at all; attaches great importance to History and views it as important in understanding of the past, the present and the future; enjoys Historical novels, films, museums and stories adults tell about the past; distrust History textbooks, and their teachers while preferring to trust Historical documents, documentaries and museums. In addition, they enjoy the study of Meta narratives of World and South African History and specifically themes around Apartheid, the Great Trek and the Boer Republics. Otherwise they enjoy learning about the History of their families, celebrities, famous people and royalty. Their view of the New South Africa is a contradictory one – although they recognize the democracy, good economy and the justice and freedom it brought, they also view it as a place where affirmative action is a negative presence and where the language and History of the Afrikaner is oppressed. As a result Mandela is not embraced as an idol and they would exert no energy at all to save the statue of an ANC leader. Instead they would rather expend energy on environmental matters while they treasure freedom of speech and want peace. However, at the same time they are actually aware of being Afrikaners. Finally they view the South African past, from their present position in time, as an undemocratic but unpolluted, relatively prosperous place with a low population density. In contrast the South African future is anticipated as a democratic place that is severely polluted and overpopulated. Finally in their view, like in the past, the future will be characterized by conflict between rich and poor and the various ethnic groups.

In conclusion it is important to remember that Historical Conscious-
ness, as a mental construct, is invariably influenced by “dynamic temporal, spatial, spiritual, cultural and ideological contexts.” These include the post-Apartheid political, economic, social and educational experiences of the adolescents surveyed. The latter is of particular importance as we have to realize the “consequences of Historical knowledge amongst those who are exposed to it.”

References

1 Nasson, B and Samuel, J (1990), *Education from poverty to liberty*. Cape Town: David Philip.


3 Kros, C (May 2000), ’Telling lies and then hoping to forget all about History’, in *South African History Journal* (42), pp 69-88; Kallaway, P (January 1995), ’History Education in a democratic South Africa’ in *Teaching History* (78), pp 11-16; Callinicos, L (2000), ’Reconceptualising the History Curriculum’, in notes to The report of the History and Archeology Panel to the Minister of Education.

4 Rapport, 9 April 2006.


6 For some of the accepted History textbooks see the webpage’s of, amongst others, the following publishers: Macmillan; Shuters; Oxford; Maskew Millar Longman and Heinemann.


8 Note – this paper is based on a small scale pilot study and forms part of a bigger research project that envisages to, over the next couple of years, to look at the Historical Consciousness of adolescents of all race groups in South Africa.


10 Permission for this was granted by Professor B Von Borries by e-mail on 28 June 2006. This was not the first time that the *Youth and History* questionnaire was applied outside of its original context, see: Torsti, P (2003), Divergent stories, convergent attitudes. *A study of the presence of History textbooks and the thinking of youth in post-war Bosnia and Herzegovina*. Kustannus Oy Taifuuni, Helsinki.


14 It is important to note that this working definition is not universally accepted. For a critique of this see, for example: Lee, P (2002), ’Walking backwards into tomorrow’ – *Historical consciousness and understanding History*, paper given at the annual meeting of the American Educational Research Association, New Orleans.

34 Callinicos, L (2000), 'Reconceptualising the History Curriculum', in notes to The report of the History and Archeology Panel to the Minister of Education;
37 Rösen, J (2004), 'How to overcome ethnocentrism: approaches to a culture of recognition by History in the twenty-first century' in History and Theory, 43 (4), pp 118 -129.


SPIRITUALITY OF AFRICAN WOMEN: A NECESSARY CHANGE FOR MORAL DEVELOPMENT IN THE 21ST CENTURY

Annie Wagana
University of Lesotho

Abstract

The impact of moral degeneration is currently being felt around the globe. It is currently gripping all people across the spectrum of all cultures on the globe. Few members of these cultures can claim to be living a life free from stress caused by this kind of evil that is eating up the moral fibre of our society. However, given the fact that moral decay showed up shortly after God had created the earth from Chaos to Cosmos as the holy bible confirms this, we have to live with hope that this situation can be rectified in the near future. Who will, and how this will be done is going to be the focus of this paper’s discussion.

The first part of this paper will focus on how God or the supernatural being developed and struggled with the human beings whom he had given special favours and they just failed to honour them due to submitting to Immoral behaviour he had warned them against. Further, the argument that this has now become like a pattern in human history will be emphasized to show that the forgiving God can still provide us with means to rectify immorality of this century.

The third part will be examining current trends that encourage serious moral degeneration of the 21st century. Further I will examine whether today we are hoping for God’s mercy by embracing our extrasensory perceptions and accepting them to help us venture deeply in spiritual experiences that face us daily. For instance the natural disasters point to a likelihood of renewing the face of the earth once again as he did in the past.

Since moral decay began as a gender related issue with Eve during creation, I will also apply that aspect of females as the people who
can try to stop what they started. And that the spirituality of Women that leads them into counter-cultural type of life helps them to see other dimensions of concern in life better than their counterparts, the males. This is to elaborate on the fact that they are different from men in all aspects of life and the way they experience the supernatural spirit can make them better people to make the difference in society.

The conclusion will underscore the centrality of the Holy Spirit’s work among women from the past years to this new millennium and the likely results of their effort among the entire human race.

Introduction

“Spirituality refers to personal attitudes towards life, attitudes that change an individual’s deepest feelings and most fundamental beliefs. It encompasses the religious attitudes and experiences of individual and may often be used as a synonym for religiousness” (Yates G. Gayle 1983:60)

Spirituality of women has the potential to be used as a means to counteract moral degeneration of the 21st century. Morality is generally understood as an acceptable mode of conduct in a cultural setting. Webster defined it as “conformity to ideals of right human conduct.” Currently, there is moral degeneration that is creating a great impact on society globally. This moral degeneration is a phenomenon particularly to an African woman who lives a sub-standard way of life in regard to acceptable modern ways of civilization in the world. For instance women who are illiterate and are basically guided by laws and traditions that were introduced by the patriarchs are the ones in more awkward situations. They need to be enlightened in regard to the importance of upholding moral values, particularly in relation to their sexuality. Among the elite sexual harassment does not have serious consequences on the offenders. Take the case of the deputy chair person of ANC in South Africa. He was nominated and trusted to monitor the factors that contribute to moral degeneration in the country only to find himself committing the most grievous offence. His case was solved with ease in court because there are no severe measures that were laid down by the patri-
archal society to punish such type of offence. And such cases do reflect negatively society to punish such type of offence. And such cases do reflect negatively on the women more than men. In fact the woman is blamed more than a man. That is why the term prostitute applies to women more than it does to men. Despite the fact that the plight of women put them in a dilemma they have the potential to use their spirituality and overcome the moral degeneration of the 21st century.

Immorality began as early as the beginning of creation. When God created mankind in his inhabitant the first human beings He created, Adam and Eve, disobeyed His instructions. Some where along the way they tasted the forbidden fruit from the “tree of knowledge of good and evil,” which He had reprimanded them not to taste (Gen:3). In the Old Testament the story portrays the whole scenery of their encounter with God. And from that point in time it was woman but not man who was sported to be the one that yielded to the temptation by the serpent. That disobedience made a turning point in the life of mankind, more so in the life of a woman, she was “cursed” (Genesis 3:16). Hitherto, woman has ever struggled to figure out how her spirituality can be utilised to counteract the free flow of immorality in this world.

A woman’s quest for genuine spirituality

Apparently, the guidelines for moral stability and development in all cultures of the world largely depend on the holy scriptures for guidelines. They refer to the Holy Bible, Koran, Geetha, Avesta and many others. The different constitutions of governments that design rules and regulations of countries use oaths from various scriptures to swear in their officials. Therefore, holy scriptures are held to be sacred in all cultures. One important reason why they are of great value is that they constitute the wisdom of the patriarchal society that has been evolving with female species. Such a male dominated society regarded women as legal minors in a way of master slave relationship; not as God had planned for them to be companions. Indeed patriarchs failed to exert women’s spirituality despite the fact that mothers have genuine impact on nurturing their children. Other women believe that they must nurture their husbands too with the hope that they will be more accepted and be loved. But as generations keep changing women continue to question all this dogma of the
patriarchal society. This therefore, becomes a juxtaposed relationship that was and is still a dilemma for an African woman of the 21st century.

Most, if not all women's lives have been a melancholy from the time of creation up to today. And because of that situation women struggle daily to understand Gods' spirituality and its transcendental nature that provides unconditional solace. Some of them join 'charismatic' groups, others become nuns, others, like in Western Uganda's traditional religions they are known to have 'emandwa' (Hafkin & Bay 1987:158) that guides them in their spiritual journeys and protect them from potential dangers. It has been a long soul searching journey for some women who did not want to adapt to religions that were introduced by colonialists because they live with a lot of obscurity. However, these women put in an effort to transform their plight that had condemned them for their existence.

The famous Holy Bible has been the straightforward educative form of scripture to teach women how spirituality can be a consolation to those who seek for it. These scriptures are still not easily comprehended by illiterate or ordinary minds. The case in point is during the Pentecost, (Acts 2:1-12). The reader notices that the spirit entered a group of believers and they went into a frenzy, as they spoke in tongues. Indeed it was the same case when John was baptising Jesus and a white dove descended and uttered some words (Matt. 3:13.16-17) it remained too amazing a thing for ordinary minds to comprehend. However, the modern world has almost come to understand how to experience the holy spirit without waiting for it to occur just like a phenomenon among believers. Rahner, shades more light on the way spirituality is genuinely experienced by ordinary beings in modern days and he wrote that:

“A human being really affirms moral values as absolutely binding... intrinsically oriented as this is beyond and above itself towards the absolute mystery of God. She poses that attitude of authentic faith which together with love suffices for justification and so makes possible supernatural acts that positively conduce to eternal life,” (Rahner, Karl 1979: 55).

We need to understand that most religious people particularly African
women need to be confident with whatever means works for them in experiencing the holy spirit. This is because religious mysticism has been testified in writing and verbally in big open conventions and also in charismatic groups. One author believed that “they are experiences which in spite of their extreme diverse forms and interpretations are still known as a holy spirit.”(Rahner, 1979: 22.) Further more, the familiar medium of holy spirit that humans testify to fellow believers originates from within their internal bodies “it sometimes intoxicates those who experience it” (Rahner, Karl 1979:22).

One famous mother in the prehistoric patriarchal society who testified such experience was the virgin Mary the Mother of Jesus. Her conversation with the Angel Gabriel was her real internal dialogue with God who assigned her a duty of giving birth to the saviour of the world, and she obeyed (Luke, 2). Most people are still experiencing the appearance of angels while they are both conscious and asleep, but they do not take them seriously yet they bring more than love and light. Lawlis also pleas with people in his book, The Transpersonal Medicine “ that there is lack of attention and respect given to the emotional and spiritual needs of people.” (Lawlis, G.F.1996:6 &7). They can be worriers for the good and initiate spiritual struggle (Redfield, Murphy, and Timbers1991:193&195). Many scholars including theologians, poets, philosophers, saints and sages insist on telling all people in writing, music, and art to be more observant and concentrate on what they experience or to ponder more on ideas or dreams that occur to them when they are half asleep. Nevertheless, people seem to find no logic and then they become overwhelmed and ignore those experiences. That is how most women’s spirituality is ignored most of the time and thus people miss out on opportunities to acknowledge the higher power. One may imagine if Mary ignored her internal dialogue that was actually a spiritual message! One’s religious conviction may result in the belief that the angels that appeared during pre-historic days are similar to angels that are experienced today as I indicated in the quotation above. So, most women still need to be aware of their spirituality and intrinsic motivation that emanates from within, in order to do more soul searching for higher power. That may lead women to making valid choices in life and combat immorality.
The sacred nature of woman

Women’s encounters with the spirituality of God is quite implicit in various forms. Firstly, He selected a woman and provided her with a uterus and placed in ovaries to conceive so that the human race can continue evolving. Furthermore, he gave women a unique responsibility of nurturing humans from the cradle to the grave. It is again this plight of women that led to their own condemnation as already mentioned in previous paragraphs. The women who do not want to be condemned for originating sin are those who shelved off the responsibility of child bearing like the Catholic nuns who made the vows of chastity. Many other women who do not have a choice but to continue following the traditions in their cultures are the ones experiencing the pressure of being traditional or real women. Gradually they seem to adopt other means of survival. For instance scholars who researched about the spirituality of women like those of Nepal concluded that:

"Women resort to peripheral cults of possession that allow them a modicum of power; these practices operate as female auxiliaries recompensing the dispossessed... from this perspective women in structurally weak positions are seen as susceptible to extreme psychic tension...rites therefore enable women to vent and transfer stress and result in temporary or permanent psychological ‘cures’" (Gelpi, B.C. 1983:41)

This attitude of escapism by women is often revealed in various ways. Some of the women start acting in strange and desperate ways because of failing to be herd or recognised by cultures they belong to. Starting from way back in the patriarchal times of long ago when the Holy Bible was being written some women were portrayed in awkward situations. All that could be written about them was the immorality they promoted as they were not able to make valid choices or be recognised as people with human instincts. For instance, the two daughters of Lot committed incest because they thought there would be no other men other than their father to produce with them (Genesis 19:30-38). And the law regarding the treatment of women as prisoners of war was of sheer disgrace to female species for they were to be used as sex objects (Deut.21:10-14). The list of women is too long. But again the paradoxical nature of handling women in the bible is awesome. It shows that women who seek the knowledge of God are able to become transcendental.
Such illumination is typically associated with mystics and saints of sacred traditions but they happen to people in all walks of life (Redfield, J. et al 1988:140). As already indicated above, those who experience such illuminations refer to them as evil spirits not to discuss about or given any attention.

**Women’s spiritual encounter with God**

A lot of women in the bible had very close spiritual encounters with God and gained confidence to the extent that God used them to save the human race. At some stages in the life of evolution of mankind God has had special duties for female species without regrets. For instance famous women in the Holy Bible alone are eye openers for the women in society who have low regard for spirituality or religion in general. The intimacy of God with women in the Holy Bible once again is intricate and sacred. Also in the other shamanistic religions in African beliefs women hold their heads up to work for their gods and get their blessings in turn.

Women are just portrayed as instruments of God. Their first famous deep intuition from God is remotely revealed through the Levite woman that saved her son Moses and in turn Moses saved the Israelites from slavery in Egypt. Later the former slaves came to be known as the ‘chosen people of God’ (exodus, 2:1-10). Historically, this became the first patriarchal society that formulated the rules and regulations which we live by today. In fact these rules and regulations provided a foundation for moral development (Exodus 20:1-17) as has already been stated in the preceding paragraphs.

Many women performed different duties for God as prophetesses, One may make mention of prophetess Anna. She stayed in the temple in Jerusalem praying all the time for the birth of Jesus until he was born. Her intuition or spirituality did not betray her it was so intricate, in that her and the God she prayed are the only ones who knew (Luke 2: 36-3 ). The fact is that all the prayers she made, as she believed with confidence, brought about Jesus, the saviour of the world. Today it is believed that the Christian religion has the largest number of followers in the world. The next most powerful women’s spiritual encounter with God
that brought great revelation to mankind was the virgin Mary’s conversation with the angel Gabriel. God, through this angel gave Mary a duty of giving birth to the saviour who later changed the course of history. Still it was for the purpose of counteracting the decaying moral fibre of the patriarchal society at that time. Jews had become obsessed with their culture and wanted to promote it against any other culture regardless. But the birth of Jesus helped all people of the world to be God’s children and not as Jews and gentiles but Christians.

The birth of Jesus and his death and resurrection are all works of encounters of women and God. Jesus our saviour came and intervened in the world’s immorality of mankind when he was crucified. Along the way during his passion week the three women who were known as Magadalene, Joana and Mary brought about awareness of the spirituality of Jesus at the time of resurrection. They woke up on a Sunday morning and announced the empty tomb with the stone next to its entry. The apostles became sceptical as they thought that what the women said was sheer nonsense (Luke :24 :1-12). From that time, the resurrection they announced has given tremendous blessings to many people of the world. Other believers went on to illustrate the experience of the holy spirit that emerged with Jesus’ resurrection on the Pentecost as they spoke in tongues and did other demonstrations as the spirit directed them (Acts 2:1-13) The emphasis here is that this was another turning point in the life of all Christians of the world opened up by women’s encounters with God.

Likewise in shamanic beliefs in most African countries women are believed to have had major roles to play in interacting with spirituality the way they understood it and that gave them special confidence. For instance, in the western part of Uganda women are known to have mediated for some members of their community. Scholars who researched on women in Africa came up with the following conclusion:

“Large number of women could attain highly regarded position as local mediums and priestesses ...they could communicate with one of the clans chwezi spirits . she directed construction of shrines and advised on their maintenance offered prayers on periodic visit to homesteads... their authority unquestioned in all matters.” (Hafkin, J.& Bay,G. 1967:176)
Apparently, women had serious intimacy with God as they ventured for their own survival in the patriarchal society. And if they did not have that good intuition to understand that “transcendental knowledge of extraordinary attributes seem to come from a being beyond ordinary self; and then it can further reveal a higher presence calling us towards greater life and action in this ever evolving world” (Redfield, J. 2002:146) they wouldn’t have been able to repel oppression from males to a degree they have achieved today. Through accepting the holy spirit and following their intuition women are gradually living a fair life. They are sometimes able to make some valid choices as leaders in politics. The pioneer as the first African female head of state is the Liberian lady Hon. Ellen Johnson. Somehow women are seen working hand in hand with God as they become transcendental to counteract the immorality that was tough from the pre-historic times up to this day.

By and large, this world we live in has been infested by immorality and it grows worse every day, week, month and year as generations come and go. God’s spirituality also is ever spreading, they are like parallel. Many people believe in God’s existence, and go to pray on holy, pilgrimages, at river Ganges in churches, mosques, temples and synagogues. Spirituality seem to be the major way to tackle immorality and wipe it away from the face of the earth especially among the poor women of the African continent. Already HIV and Aids disease coupled with crime and substance abuse are unstoppable. These diseases are a phenomenon in our daily experiences. The nature in which they spread leaves a lot of questions as to whether people still respect moral values. Immediate examples are revealed by women who come to the mass media crying for help against their own fathers for raping them and leaving them traumatised. (SABC 1 HIV support group ‘siyayinqoba’ at 1.30-2.00 pm on Sunday’s) This topic featured one of the famous singers ‘Andile’ among others, on the 20th of August who spoke out about having been raped by her own father. Therefore, we need spiritual guides who are going to revive the spirituality of women in society. They indeed were able to alter the course of history and make the world a better place, temporarily free of immorality.
Life of a 21st century woman

Life of a 21st century woman is just a phenomenon in the life of species. Women have been experiencing rough times at all their levels of development from the time they become babies to adolescents and to a catch all category of adult females in marriage, motherhood, work and society. Therefore, women need to put some mechanisms in place to tackle the challenges of the 21st century. These challenges include living as legal minors, sexual harassment, substance abuse, contempt from opposite sex and general immorality.

Apparently, as soon as the girls change to adolescents the desire for freedom becomes their obsession. Once they gain the freedom as they understand it, which in most cases is when they are free from being responsible to care for their good moral development then they gain entry into the challenges as listed above. Cunningham, had this to say:

“They are often clear about what it is they want to be free from, school parents, rules, oppression, staying at home, illness, etc but what they want to be free for is not clear” (Cunningham, J, & D.1994:8)

Indeed, adolescent girls particularly have other emotional and psychological desires they ever struggle with and are beyond their control. For instance, the menstruation period that they experience every month of the year leaves them confused, moody, and at times temperamental or sickly. This sort of change makes them extremely different and vulnerable to the opposite sex. Thus the desire to have their own space and in charge of their lives, makes them awkward in the eyes of those who do not experience the same. Often mothers who are aware of this experience seem to ignore this pitiable situation and sometimes instead of empathising with them they loose tempers and stage mini wars within the family demanding for what adolescents can not understand because they are often in a state of confusion. One day they will want to be treated as adults who need to be left alone and another day as young girls. Because they are still totally dependent on their families or as the famous psychologist once correctly stated that, “most of them can hardly predict the consequences of their actions”(Dr. Phil, SABC 2, July, 2006). Cunningham viewed them to be claiming this status:
“I am the centre of the world I see; where the horizon is depends on where I stand. Education may broaden that horizon as climbing a tower broadens the view. But I remain the point of reference...I’ll be the king of my own castle. Paddle my own canoe and be master of my destiny, the right to be and say ‘I am my own person.’ ” (Cunningham, J. & D. 2000:8)

This attitude by adolescents is totally backed and cushioned by the current generation of information technology. They gain a lot of helpful knowledge for the current modernity, but some of it is detrimental to their moral development, and they just depend on computers, laptops, webcams and cell phones. Youths indeed have shown a tendency of ignoring and despising their own customs and traditions they belong to because of what they learn on computers. This gives parents a lot of stress. Also this neglect is brought about by lack of extended families or lack of parents who are good role models. They therefore succumb to knowledge from the media and peers. This knowledge is basically contaminated with serious immorality.

In most African cultures especially that of before the 21st century, the place of an adolescent African girl was in her mother’s kitchen. The purpose was to enable her to get closer to her mother so that they can have that unique intimacy. Unique as her mother’s intimacy with God. There was a lot of teaching, recruiting, guiding and many informal roles to play as a potential mother. The spirituality that she built from this teaching would provide appropriate transition to adulthood. Most of this intimacy had to do with child bearing, menstruation, medicinal herbs and nurturing of children. Also any adult responsible woman within the extended family would do that. Most youths who studied in missionary schools had the advantage of being exposed to God’s spirituality at an early stage of which they sometimes carried on in adulthood.

As a matter of fact most avenues that would promote immorality into society would be counteracted in its early stages. For instance some mothers knew how to detect very early pregnancy by using some clues or extrasensory perceptions. Webster defined it as when one “resides outside ordinary senses”. But today the cultural setting has altered due to immoral behaviour. Youths and mothers do not have time for one another. Girls think their mothers are nosy in their private lives and mothers are complaining that daughters
daughters have no time for them and they do not listen. Yet the truth is that technology is robbing them of their intimacy. The void between youths and parents that used to be filled by parent child intimacy is being swept away by immorality and God’s spirituality too is being marginalised.

Once young girls feel that void they feel the need to occupy themselves with wrong choices in life. They start doing crime, prostitution, substance abuse, the list is long. As most people might be aware of the saying that ‘an idle mind is the devil’s workshop,’ the devil gains ground to promote immorality. These days there are many inexperienced or teenage mothers in society. Some girls prefer having abortions or abandoning their babies in awkward situations. Those who deliver and become mothers are sometimes denied the identity of motherhood as they are called sisters to their babies. African women in this case are the worst hit because they become pregnant after being raped though others deliberately conceive due to immorality.

As soon as the babies of such mothers come to understand their background they feel a sense of betrayal. Definitely, the vicious circle becomes inevitable and more children are brought to the world in such immoral ways. But is this what we want for our sons and daughters? This is a rhetoric question but worth asking at this stage. What actually happens is that we are promoting an immoral society due to the fact that there is concealment of the real truth about motherhood to the innocent children. This is very common in most African cultures.

Young women need to be aware that the life they live as youths has a great impact on them as adults in future. Most of them become school dropouts and experience extreme poverty if some support groups do not give them some financial support. Then they totally lose their experiences of teenage hood, through obstacles of caring for their children. Nevertheless, it is at this point that youths need to be tipped as to how they can find solace in spirituality. All they need is to reform in order to repossess their power that immorality takes away leaving them traumatised with a sense of hopelessness.
As mothers of the youths today who are empowered by formal education and a sense of spirituality unlike most illiterate women of the past generations they need to humbly acknowledge the “virtue of spirit from God, that was given to every woman in life in form of the inner holy spirit that radiates our unselfish love in longing for eternity, patience of the cross and heart felt joy, that nurture all mankind” (Rahner, K. 1979:57). This way the spirituality of women will transform the immoral world into a habitable moral world.

The plight of women and their glory

The origin, existence and value of women is surrounded by a mystery. According to the Holy Bible woman was formed from a rib of a man and later named by God as her companion. It is this mystery that symbolises women as a delicate and weak human being. In other words figuratively women are meant to be subservient to their opposite sex since God made them from their rib (Gen 2:21-22). On the other hand women, within their nature, experience menstruation, child birth contractions and nurturing their siblings. However weak and delicate women may appear, their value to men is irreplaceable. God symbolically used the rib because it supports the most important organs of the body and that is how women support a man’s life. However, patriarchs failed to acknowledge it that way, instead gay men are trying to adopt babies in order to supplement roles of women to young ones but that has raised a lot of controversy globally. One of the reasons is that the psychologists believe a well rounded policy of bringing up children involves both a father and a mother. The holy bible condemns same sex couples too (Lev:18:22). Some researchers have found out that a male sea horse can conceive but among male human beings that is still a mystery.

Some African religions also portray women as goddesses in order to elevate their image. Among some religions in South Africa a woman is treated with delicacy. Firstly she is called ‘Inyanga’ meaning moon. The moon in Zulu is associated with the reproductive system. And as ‘Inyanga’ she is regarded as a nurturer of emotions. Also she is regarded to be as gentle as the moonlight, since she provides good company to the husband like the moon does to the sun. So as it is clearly stated women in
this cultural or religious setting are handled with the superficial respect. Again in another cultural setting in Burundi traditional women are nowhere near enjoying some superficial respect. One author who wrote about ‘spirit mediums in East Africa’ had this to say:

“The people of Burundi believed that women’s greater strength suited them better for manual labour, but their clumsiness lack of agility, inability to control their emotions and proneness to jealousy left them generally inferior to men. And despite the recognition of their continual hardships in child bearing...woman is only the passive earth; it is the man who provides seeds.” (Hafkin and Bay 1987:7)

Women were quite aware of the attitude that men had towards them but they had no means to confront their condition as much as they try these days. And those who tried to rectify their plight, were regarded as insane, “confused and those lacking a sense of direction (basil ba a fokola bahloka kelelo), (Wagana A.I.K.1997: 107) In Western Uganda some women acted as spirit mediums for their extended families or communities. Schweinfurth had this to say:

“These ladies are certainly not beautiful and they would hardly be legible for vestal virgins, but they are feared and therefore venture to take any liberties. As is always the case where professional interests are concerned. They vie with one another in eccentricities. One at Rionga’s court grunted every minute; another sat down beside one of the company, wanted her shoulders rubbed and her head bent” (Hafkin and Bay 1976:163)

This is a typical example where by women were thought to be manipulative of their surroundings or sometimes known as voodoo women. However this was a way of venting their situation using spirituality the way they understood it in order to survive. The myth of ‘emandwa’ in Western Uganda still passes on as mythical to future generations. It is used by women who do not believe in modern Christianity. Most scholars attribute the active traditional spirituality of women to the fact that generally, “difficulty can be combated and controlled best by heroic fights of ecstasy so the cults by women represented an attempt to master the intolerable environment” (Hafkin and Bay1976:168). Therefore, the modern religious spirituality of women or spirituality devel-
opposing through help groups need to be revived vigorously in a more concerted effort. Since this modern world is overcome by immorality there might be hope to bring about the desirable moral change.

There is a huge difference from the morals of modern women of the 21st century and that of before. This is because modern times have a more professional therapeutic mode of helping women to release their bitterness that used to be bottled up by women and lead them in ecstasy. In the long run they are rehabilitated. But those without financial help to attend therapy sessions, must know that there is abundant help in the free spirituality of God. The researchers in the seventies seem to be agreeable with the above argument by realising “that such women's possession afflictions were treated not by permanently expelling but by taming and domesticating it rather than exorcise,” because definitely these women were not possessed but just lacked the female technical know how of getting males to accept them as humans with their own choices different from men's (Lewis in Hafkin 1976:168).

As young and old women continue to be educated in various disciplines of higher learning formally and other informal settings they get conscientised about who they are, why they are here, and what they want in life. Most women are now aware that to forgive their painful past experiences is divine. They need to just forgive themselves for hurting and hence hindering development to move on and support their families, economic development, political organisations and religious organisations. Besides, women need to acknowledge that forgiveness gives authentic freedom of mind to the victim.“ One of the most important things is that it is a choice to forgive ‘sometimes it seems easier to just keep nagging and blaming and being angry. But to create magic (spirituality) in our lives we must be present with all our hurts, Judgements and beliefs impacted in all our energy to be able to achieve spiritual transition.’” (Lodge Wolf:3, 6/17/2006).

This view of a modern woman poses serious threat to the institution of marriage. The gay people are gaining chance to prosper because of women's attitudes during difficult situations. Indeed the president of America G. W. Bush together with the head of the Catholic church, Pope Benedict have already informally tabled this concern about the threat facing the
institution of marriage (BBC News). These days the situation is further worsened by both male and female's contemptuous attitude towards one another. They want to live separate lives all together as they live a life of non-committal. The constant cases of homicide in families by males is a pointer to tough times for women. The most recent of this kind was committed by the former mayor of Klerksdorp on the 2nd September 2006. (SABC radio FM). In one article “Is the Homosexual my neighbour?” by Mollencott, she emphasised that despite women being vocal and agitated about their plight “They retain their traditional frameworks of thought.” (Yates, G.1983: 70). The implication is that women still love to be what God created them to be. This belief is supported by the following words:

“We’ve gotten in the habit of telling what is wrong to a therapist as a way to feel heard and connected we really need to turn that around … to create a nurturing and helpful place at home to be heard. And we need to work in our communities in the present moment, to create more nurturing and helpful environments.”(Eagle, B.M. 17/6/2006)

Again this argument entirely reveals the fact that women have ever been God’s spirit mediums during times of crisis in the course of history of mankind. Therefore, they just need to respect moral values and become sensitised to play the role of spiritual mediators to counteract immoral relationships. Women who are already in relationships clearly know that without God in their relationship there is no clear foundation. Some women tend to act according to their bitterness and use punitive justice instead of succumbing to the holy spirit that gives wisdom and courage to practice the restorative justice and promote moral development.

If it was in the power of women, definitely they would wish to be front bares’ of the burner written on ‘PEACE’. At the moment around the globe there are many women’s organisations, some political, economic, religious and many more. What connects these women together is the moral fibre that guides the way they live. They might be weak but they are at least aware of what is right or wrong. Sometimes they need to be together and guide other women who are helpless, through church groups and HIV support groups and many others. Other times women are seen tackling bigger obstacles than we think they can handle because we fail to perceive their renewed spiritual strength For in-
stance the women who are serving in the military along side the males.

In conclusion, this paper has argued that the patriarchal traditions have over looked the contribution women can make towards spiritual life in Africa throughout the course of history. The paper has further argued that from the scriptures, there is evidence that God recognises women’s contribution to spirituality. Lastly the paper makes a plea to women to exert their spiritual influence on their various communities especially in the 21st century in order to avert moral degeneration.

References

BBC (News), 2006.


EVALUATION CHECK LIST
Rating Criteria

1. Voice:
   a. Clearly audible
   b. Well modulated
   c. Pleasant tone

2. Pace:
   a. Varied
   b. Steady
   c. Appropriate ideas
   d. suitable

3. Non-verbal:
   a. Good gestures
   b. Eye contact
   c. Good body language

4. Organisation:
   a. Well organised
   b. Well planned
   c. Coherent
   d. No repetition
   e. Clear ideas
   f. Edited material
   g. Supporting documentation

5. Features:
   a. Set induction
   b. Summary provided
   c. Supportive of presentation

6. Attitude:
   a. Friendly and warm
   b. Enthusiastic
   c. Positive
In all communities, all over the world, children are being educated and socialised into the values, traditions, rules and norms that characterise and govern their particular societies. They are being socialised, in effect, into conventions which have been founded in times gone by; in other words, children are socialised into the traces of the past.

In the modern, western world, since the late nineteenth century, much of this activity has been concentrated around the system of state education, and more particularly, around the subject of school history. Furedi (Furedi, 1992:19) has argued that:

> the very emergence of history as an academic discipline [during the nineteenth century] and a central feature of the school syllabus in advanced capitalist societies reflected the conviction of the ruling classes that history could act as a cohesive force against the destabilising consequences of industrialisation. Authorities concerned with the maintenance of the established order have long placed great emphasis on history education. They regard it as providing vital moral inspiration and as helping to forge a sense of national identity in the face of disintegrative trends or subversive influences

What this suggests is that school history has, in part, been a useful tool which helps the state to condition ‘learners’ (by learning through past example) into mature, independent adults and responsible, loyal, obedient citizens. It helps to teach children about what behaviour is considered acceptable by the dominant view in their societies and what is frowned upon, about the types of qualities that are celebrated and remembered and those that will not be tolerated. Through the study of history in schools, children can be taught about how their societies prefer to remember their past and how these societies came to be in the present. In South Africa, the long colonial, settler-dominated past in which white people sought to maintain control over the larger
indigenous black population has resulted in state education systems that, until 1994, have tended to be used by government education authorities to present and promote a particular world view, particularly through the use of school history, in an unproblematic and uncritical way. Chernis (1990:30) writes:

The history of history teaching [in South Africa] illustrates the massive degree to which the state has attempted to influence or steer the objectives and nature of history as taught at school. History teaching, i.e. the institutionalised state-supervised part of the process, as a rule follows the current, sanctioned spectrum of historical consciousness

With the power to select which sections of history were taught and determine the way that they were presented, South African education systems tried to encourage loyalty and submission through authority by generally avoiding the responsibility of teaching their charges how to critically engage their world. Mulholland, writing in 1981, suggested that ‘the more closed the political system, the more emphasis there has been on history teaching and learning, and the more forcibly do the rulers wish to impose their views’ (1981:iii) in their attempt to stamp out any sign of opposition or resistance. History education in South Africa has a long history of syllabus adjustment as different power holding groups tried to ensure that school history met certain political and social demands. It is only really over the last two decades that the unproblematised and uncritical approach – the “how to” - of history education in South Africa has begun to be meaningfully addressed both at a curriculum level and in some classroom practice.

Moreover, school history is not the only (nor is it necessarily the most influential) force which helps children to establish a foundation of past knowledge and values. Their parents, families, religion, ethnic group, peers, communities and cultures all potentially play an important role in shaping and developing the ways in which children perceive, remember and think about the past. Thus, in a heterogeneous or multi-cultural society, there is a potential source of conflict between the various ways in which children experience the past in their everyday lives, and the official 'historical consciousness' which they are expected to develop as learners through the study of history at school. This paper refers to a pilot study (conducted by the writer) that set out to explore the points at
which these two ‘forces’ overlap. The research investigated the value of further exploring the question: to what extent are learners’ attitudes and perceptions of school history informed and shaped by their experiences and encounters with the past in their everyday lives and what ‘senses of the past’ these individuals acquire as a result of this interaction between their experiences of the past in the everyday, and history as taught and learnt as a subject at school? The argument put forward here is that it may well be worth our while to pause in our ongoing attempts to identify and solve the problems of history teaching in South Africa and take a moment to listen to the histories that are being produced both inside and outside of our classrooms by the learners themselves.

In explaining this position, it is necessary to make two detours: the first will provide a brief overview of the history of teaching practice in South Africa; the second will outline a few key developments in the thinking surrounding academic history over the last few decades.

**History as taught and learnt in schools: a question of practice**

School history education in South Africa has been a contentious issue since its formal introduction to the Cape Colony in 1839. First British and then Afrikaner government education officials deliberately selected the historical content which they thought would help to socialise and condition their own children, and those of other population groups, into their particular world view, and excluded or ignored the content matter which contradicted or stood in opposition to this. The introduction of the apartheid state and its centralised policies of Christian Nationalist and Bantu Education simply served to fuel the already historically charged issue of state history education, and brought the matter of content to the forefront of discussion. This fixation over content had the added disadvantage of hindering the growth of discussions around the methodology and practice of history teaching, and tightly controlled syllabuses, coupled with the close monitoring of teachers under the National Education Policy Act of 1967, made it especially difficult for teachers to deviate from the official syllabus.

Despite this, some South African history teachers did begin to pay increased attention to the practice of history education in South Africa.
Kallaway (1995), for example, shows that during the 1970s, small groups of teachers and historians began to make some attempts to challenge the official history syllabus. Kallaway himself is one such example. He explains that during the 1960s, employed as a history teacher at an all-boys, white school in the Orange Free State, he ‘made it [his] daily business to demythologise the history curriculum’ by ‘tackl[ing] the essential issues of the partialness of knowledge and the fragility of our interpretations’ (Kallaway, 1995:11). Thus he explains that at the height of apartheid, he was able to give his pupils a more critical understanding of history irrespective of whether they stood in support of the apartheid system or not.

This shift towards the questioning of history teaching practice amongst some South African history teachers was partly inspired by developments in history pedagogy in Britain during the 1970s, and partly influenced by the liberal Africanist and radical Marxist histories emerging from the South African history academy in the 1970s and 1980s, as well as increased opposition from within those sectors of the population who were supposed to be undergoing socialisation (school pupils). Kallaway (Kallaway, 1995:13) writes that:

Teachers seminars on African history and the neo-Marxist historiography [that began to be produced in universities in America, western Europe and other parts of Africa during the 1960s], as well as the introduction of “New History” methodology...broke the ground for teacher involvement in the production of resource materials on a modest scale

History teacher, Alan Gunn, explains that ‘the term ‘new history’ was increasingly used, in a general sense, to describe the movement away from the chronology-bound and content-based approach to the subject at school’ (Gunn, 1990:47). ‘New history focuses on a process (i.e. historical enquiry) not a product (i.e. the facts of the past). The past is seen as a resource for creative activity with an emphasis on constructing a range of histories from a range of sources’ (Jenkins and Brickly cited in Gunn, 1990:47).

Gunn reports that his experiment with the methods of ‘New History’ in his own history classes at a High School in Cape Town during the early
1980s were cut short because they did not help to equip learners for the heavy emphasis on content evaluation in their final examinations (Gunn, 1990:ix). He describes being both ‘frustrated’ and ‘perplexed’ that although the ideas of new history were known to education authorities in South Africa, there had been no official attempt to consider the possibilities of using the approach in South African schools.

In 1983, prompted, by ‘the growing crisis over the teaching of history in South African schools’ during the 1970s, Owen van den Berg and Peter Buckland, members of the Schools History Education Committee (established by a number of history teachers in Natal in 1979, in an attempt to improve the teaching and learning of history in schools), conducted a study into the possible reasons for the decline in ‘the popularity of history as a school subject’. They suggested the following possible reasons why pupils (now termed learners) were choosing not to study history as a subject to Matric:

- the status of history in the school curriculum is low (it is seen as a subject for less able candidates and is perceived to be unhelpful in the job market)
- the history examination encourages rote learning
- the syllabus is repetitive
- the way history is taught is teacher-centred with the learners as passive recipients
- syllabuses are overloaded
- textbooks are too heavily relied upon in the classroom
- the material selected is too Eurocentric and also concentrates too heavily on military, political and biographical history
- the purposes of history are seen to be inappropriate
- history is seen as a factual subject rather than an interpretative one
- school history in South Africa is seen as part of a socio-political ideological plan
- history teachers often do not have an adequate academic background in the discipline
- teacher training encourages teachers to present history as a fixed body of knowledge (adapted from van den Berg and Buckland, 1983:2-4).

This initial questioning and challenging of state history education
amongst a small group of South African history teachers took place within the broader political context of the 1976 Soweto uprising; a protest against the use of Afrikaans in African schools that only served to increase the intensity of African resistance towards the Bantu education policy of the apartheid state. That uprising gave birth to a larger movement which came to be known as People’s Education. Johan Muller writes:

For many, the evolution of people’s education through...two consultative conferences, can be understood as a shift from “liberation first, education later” to “education for liberation”. It marked the change from a strategy of potentially militant struggle which was temporarily willing to forfeit education, to a struggle of emancipatory education as an alternative to militant struggle (original emphasis) (1991:326).

Increased student resistance and school boycotts meant that ‘[b]y the end of 1985, urban black education had totally collapsed’ (Hyslop, 1999:173). Beinart sums this period up neatly by saying that (1994:234):

[the cycle of insurrection and repression based around schools, universities, factories and townships which began in 1976 rose to a crescendo between late 1984 and early 1986. This marked the turning point for the apartheid state]

In memory of the 1976 Soweto uprising, black students throughout the country planned a ‘Year of No Schooling’ for 1986. Aware of these plans, parents in Soweto formed the Soweto Parents Crisis Committee which called a National Education Crisis Conference in December 1985. It helped to establish other crisis committees across the country, to be coordinated by the parent body: the National Education Crisis Committee (NECC) (Hyslop, 1999:174). Between 1987 and 1988, the National Education Crisis Committee set up a People’s History Commission which aimed to help to draw up an alternative to the official history syllabus. Although it concerned itself mainly with political mobilisation, its workbook promoted a more critical approach to history education, ‘African history and the history of the liberation movement was given a position of prominence, and the issue of methodology and interpretation was highlighted in the group’s publication that emerged at the beginning of 1988’ (Kallaway, 1995:14). But Kallaway explains
that ‘the initiative failed to make much headway with regard to school history.... The [Department of Education and Training] refused permission for the publications of the NECC to enter its educational institutions’ (1995:14).

Also during the mid-1980s, a small publishing house in Pietermaritzburg, Shuter and Shooter, approached a small group of teachers and academics to write an alternative textbook series, History Alive, still in keeping with the requirements of the official syllabus, but more interrogative and critical in nature. Kallaway writes that the series was ‘welcomed by a number of teacher organisations and very well received by the liberal press’ (1995:13).

By the late 1980s, increased levels of violence on the part of the apartheid state, in its efforts to quell the rising tide of resistance amongst the black majority, brought increased international pressure against the apartheid regime. This political crisis together with the controversy surrounding the question of history education, led the Government-funded Human Sciences Research Council’s (HSRC) Education Research Programme to set up an independent inquiry into the teaching of history in South Africa between 1988 and 1991. Kallaway (1995:15) explains that:

the culture that grew up within the context of this group reflected a much greater degree of agreement on principles and objectives than had ever been experienced in the past...a common concern for the state of the subject in schools was manifested by a broad commitment to the goals of the new history...[and] there was at least a common commitment to a critical skill-based curriculum.

However, the HSRC investigation also came under quite a lot of criticism. Kallaway (1995) who was involved in the investigation pointed out that it did not achieve a clean break from the apartheid history of the past, especially in the area of content revision, not least because the investigation was conducted mainly by white, Afrikaans men. Lowry (1995) also states that the committee failed to take into account the broader context in which it was operating. He explains that ‘[t]he failure to undertake a thorough analysis of the situation within which history is taught is a major shortcoming of the research’ (Lowry, 1995:109). Perhaps a more comprehensive examination of the curriculum came from the National Education Policy Investigation (NEPI) in 1990. This
investigation was commissioned by the NECC with the purpose of analysing ‘education options and their implications in all major areas of education policy’ (NECC, 1993:1). It emerged from the context of much political excitement brought about by the change in the leadership of the National Party in 1989 and the promise of political transformation with the unbanning of the ANC and the release of its future president, Nelson Mandela in the February of 1990 (Shillington, 1995:431). The investigation stood in opposition to a document released by the Committee of Heads of Education Departments which ‘outlined the Nationalist Party Government’s approach to the curriculum’ (Lowry, 1995:106). The NEPI Report was more concerned than the HSRC investigation had been, about redressing the imbalances and inequalities in education and also looked more carefully at the context in which a curriculum is developed. This helped to address a concern which had been raised earlier by Mulholland (1981:1). He wrote:

At the present time, much educational research is devoted to subjects such as - how to improve pupil performance, teacher-pupil relationships, teacher-training, revision of the curriculum and analysis of the techniques of learning. [However, these investigations fail] to examine the underlying structures of society which affect, determine and possibly distort our quest for true education of the liberating kind

The NEPI report (cited in Kallaway, 1995:15) emphasised that:

[t]he curriculum is not a neutral or technical account of what schools teach; it is a contextual and historical settlement which involves political and economic considerations as well as competing interests. The curriculum itself embodies the social relationships of its historical context

These developments suggest a more conscious shift in the thinking surrounding history education, by expanding its scope from more narrow discussions on the content and practice of school history to include consideration of the context out of which these sorts of debates arise.

As negotiations towards political transformation in South Africa gathered pace, the HSRC and NEPI investigations also spurred on another set of discussions surrounding history education in the form of a series of his-
History conferences held at the Universities of Natal, Witwatersrand and Cape Town in the February, March and May of 1992. The conferences were organised by the History Education Group, which had been established in Cape Town in the mid-eighties by those contributors to the History Alive series who ‘wanted to continue their informal involvement’ with the more critical approach which the series had brought to history education (Kallaway, 1995:14). Lowry argues that ‘[t]he most important concern of those organising the conferences was to ensure that any changes to the history curriculum should reflect the changes happening in the rest of society’ (1995:112). It is significant that a very diverse group of people - teachers, academics, members of various political and educational organisations - from a range of different backgrounds chose to participate in the conferences, which brought together a much more divergent range of interests than had been present in the HSRC investigations. These history conferences, in anticipation of the political change and transition to democracy, discussed alternative approaches to school history education, including issues such as content selection, the role of skills formation in school history education and issues of multi-culturalism.

In 1993, National Party President F.W. de Klerk set up the National Education and Training Forum (NETF). Its purpose was twofold. The first was the urgent task of designing a new interim curriculum which was to be introduced to schools at the beginning of 1995; the second required the development of a new national curriculum which was to be in schools by 2005 (Hindle, 1996:4). The new foundation of the new curriculum was to be outcomes-based. Jacobs and Chalufu explain that ‘[a]n educational system based on outcomes gives priority to end results of learning, accomplishments of learning and demonstrations of learning’ (2003:99). Outcomes-based education curriculum theory first emerged in the United States in the late 1970s and early 1980s, and grew into a small movement over the 1990s (Jacobs and Chalufu, 2003:99). South Africa is one of the few countries to have adopted an outcomes-based curriculum.

This process of curriculum revision stimulated much discussion over the future role of history in South African schools. In 1995 the National Curriculum Development Committee took over the responsibilities of
the NETF. History as a formal subject fell away under the new ‘learning areas’ created under Curriculum 2005. Sieborger remarks that ‘[t]he learning area committee and other curriculum committees, were... formed on a stakeholder basis, with a majority of departmental officials (who were not appointed in any systematic way and served as representatives rather than experts)’. Sieborger writes that very few history teachers or history academics were actually involved in the process of revising the history syllabus, despite much enthusiasm and interest (Sieborger, 2000).

Consequently, Curriculum 2005 was not very well received by academics and history teachers. Referring to its potential to offer students ‘an expanded repertoire of knowledge and creative ways to overcome the old, staid subject divisions’, Cynthia Kros, an historian at the University of the Witwatersrand, wrote that ‘[t]here is much in Curriculum 2005 to quicken the pulse of the progressive educator’. But, she argued, History ‘may well be one of the casualties of the new curriculum’ (Kros, 2000:69). As the initial drafts of Curriculum 2005 filtered through towards the end of the 1990s, two main criticisms were levelled at the treatment of history. There was concern that at the GET (General Education and Training) level, History was lumped in with Geography under the general heading of Human and Social Sciences with very little time allocated to either subject in the overall structure of the curriculum. In addition the heavy emphasis on developing historical skills led a number of education authorities to reconsider the role of content in history education. The South African Historical Society perspective (1998:202) argued that it was:

historical skills cannot be successfully achieved outside a coherent historical context, which is at present lacking in the curriculum documents. We urge, therefore, that this outcome [HSS S09] be developed in future within the context of specific historical content material, to avoid the pitfalls of skills being ‘learnt’ in isolation

Cynthia Kros (2000, 88) argued that:

criticisms of ‘content’, meaning the kinds of detail, context, texture and evidence which distinguish History from other ways of understanding the world - leave the newly constituted ‘learners’ with no leverage to challenge established precepts
It would seem that in their eagerness to remove content bias from the syllabus, curriculum developers virtually removed content from the syllabus altogether. Spurred on by such dissatisfactions, the then Minister of Education, Kader Asmal, launched a History and Archaeology Panel in September 2000, to investigate:

- the quality of the teaching of history and evolution in schools
- the state of teacher training
- the quality of support materials (Department of Education, 2000).

The report argued that as far as the existing history curriculum was concerned, it ‘[d]id not effectively help to explain the formation of the present’, it was found to be ‘seriously disjointed’ and the Senior Certificate was described as ‘crowded and content-driven,’ placing time pressures on learners in this phase. Curriculum 2005 was found to be positive in the sense that ‘it shifts assessment quite radically, focussing on what the learner should get out of his or her education,’ but the report also argued, amongst other things, ‘[t]he absence of guidance on content is keenly felt’ (Department of Education, 2000).

This buzz of activity surrounding the development of history teaching at the turn of the century is perhaps an expression of a debate that has been evolving for over thirty years. It certainly highlights some of radical transformations which school history education has undergone since its unproblematised beginnings in the nineteenth century. But on the other hand, these debates have encouraged curriculum planners and history educators to view history as a subject with problems that need to be solved and, more specifically, problems that we have generally attempted to address from the top down.

There has been a very clear tendency amongst history education authorities to pursue lines of enquiry that will encourage a greater number of learners to benefit from the ‘values’ which the guided study of history at school can provide. From within the context of schools viewed as centres of teaching and learning, history educators aim to shape learners’ views, values and understandings of the past by helping them to become more ‘historically conscious’ in the present. As history educators and academics, we have focussed our attention on ways to improve history text-
books, history pedagogy, and the history curricula and syllabi, assuming that by addressing these factors, we would be improving the quality of school history education and thereby bettering the lot of the history learner. But all the while, the views and attitudes held by the learners towards history and the past appear to have remained largely unexplored. Very few researchers have actually concerned themselves with factors outside school history which also influence, shape and develop learners’ ‘senses of the past.’ Consequently, very few educators have tried to understand how learners, as individual agents, make meaning from their own past experiences, including their experience of various forms of past representation such as school history, national heritage and family stories. This observation is particularly relevant when considered in the light of my own preliminary findings (discussed below) which suggest that the practice of history education actually seems to have very little to do with how children understand, feel and learn about the past.

**History as taught and learnt in schools: a question of attitude**

In 1987, Nomathamsanqa Margaret Vena (1987:1) conducted an ‘Investigation into problems underlying the Teaching of History as a School subject in Transkei Senior Secondary Schools.’ The study arose out of her concern for the fact that ‘[t]he teaching of history in the Transkei is being sharply criticised from various viewpoints and its very place in the curriculum has been questioned’ as well as the seemingly widespread perception that:

> History is often the subject of the pupils whose real interest is elsewhere; academically pupils generally prefer a soft option. It is the subject of the dullards who merely wish to continue the familiar book-learning they have acquired at school

Vena distributed questionnaires to history college lecturers, standard ten history learners, history college student-teachers and history subject advisors to try to find ways to improve school history education in the Transkei. Her findings were similar to the problems found with school history as identified earlier by van den Berg and Buckland (1983).

However, she concluded that ‘[p]upils have shown positive feelings and
attitudes towards history. This is contrary to the view that has been held all along; that students do not like the subject’ (178).

A similar finding was recorded by Boateng Kofi Atuahene-Sarpong (1992:109-110). In his thesis he stated:

The result of this study reveals an interesting paradox. The problems associated with History teaching revealed by the study should be enough to take the ‘slightest interest’ out of the heart of history-loving pupils, but this was not so. Despite the problems...pupils showed marked interest and strong liking for the subject.

- The observations of Vena and Atuahene-Sarpong were born out in the results of my own research. This took the form of a pilot study with two practical research components: a survey questionnaire that mainly explored learners’ attitudes to and experiences of history as a subject at school and a set of semi-structured interviews that explored adolescents’ senses of the past as formed and used in the everyday. The questionnaire was distributed to a sample of 100 Grade 12 learners from a selection of local schools in the greater Durban area. The schools were of five different types and were purposely selected on the basis of their socio-economic orientation. They included:

- one township school (school A): an historically black school which still has a large majority of black learners, but some Indian learners also now attend the school. The learners at this school were largely from impoverished backgrounds.

- one ex-mission school (school B): a private Catholic school with a majority of black learners who were mainly from less impoverished backgrounds. Those interviewed said that their parents were white-collar workers.

- one ex-House of Delegates school (school C): an historically Indian school which, at the time when the research was conducted had a mixture of black and Indian learners. From those interviewed, it would appear that the parents of these learners were both blue and white-collar workers.
one ex-model C school (school D): an historically white middle-class school. Now a racially mixed school but still predominantly middle-class.

two private schools (schools E and F): historically, these two single-sex schools were largely attended by children of the white South African elite.

Of the 100 learners who answered the questionnaire, 271 stated that they currently took history as a subject to Matric. Seventy-three participants stated that they had not chosen history as a Matric subject. Roughly a fifth of KwaZulu-Natal’s Matric learners wrote history at the end of 2003, so my figure is slightly inflated. 49 girls and 51 boys participated in the study.

Twenty participants were also asked to participate in a semi-structured interview. Four learners were interviewed from each type of school. I specified that two of these interviewees (a boy and a girl) at each school be history learners, and two (a boy and a girl) non-history learners. This meant that across the spectrum of schools, I interviewed ten history learners and ten non-history learners, with five boys and five girls in each group. The analysis and findings were largely qualitative and exploratory in nature.

The findings of my research revealed that a number of learners, who had chosen not to take history as a subject to Matric, hated having to memorise dry dates and facts and ‘irrelevant content’. Many disliked writing long, complicated history essays, and some raised objections about boring or unenthusiastic history teachers. And yet, when asked if they enjoyed learning history, these learners responded positively. For example, one learner wrote: ‘I got to know a lot of interesting things about how things were in the past and how they have changed. I also got to know how many things were invented and who invented them’ (Q23). Another learner explained that ‘I enjoyed learning South Africa’s history and enjoyed the knowledge that I obtained’ (Q47).

One learner found inspiration in the past: ‘I find out [what] people of
an earlier period were really thinking and that gave me strength to be what I am because I knew that nothing is impossible’ (Q34) and another was full of praise for history: ‘It is an intriguing subject that I have always been interested in. There are so many aspects of it that I loved’ (Q53). Perhaps the most telling comments were from a non-history learner who revealed: ‘[I] enjoyed the “stories” about particular people in the past that were told to us. I only enjoyed it because I thought of the events as stories’ (Q54) and a history learner who explained that ‘history...displays basic human characteristics that [a student] can relate [to] and [try to] understand the thoughts and opinions of the time’ (Q41).

The findings presented here seem to suggest that the ‘problems’ of history as a school subject, as identified by academics and history educators, do not necessarily number among the most significant forces that determine how learners think and feel about the past. In some cases, a natural curiosity about human nature and the past can override poor teaching practice, and even where learners display an outright rejection of history, this rejection is often coupled with a disaffection with or rejection of their own personal pasts. This point will be developed in due course, but first, it is necessary to take a detour into the realms of academic history.

**Developments in the academy: History in the everyday**

Running parallel to, and informing the growing awareness of, practice of history teaching in the 1970s, 80’s and 90s, was a growing crisis and an increased awareness around, and questioning of, the practice of ‘professional’ history in the academy. In the words of Furedi (1992:152):

> During the 1960s, establishment values were ridiculed and rejected by an active minority of young people. This was the period where nothing appeared sacred. National traditions were mocked and authority became more and more questioned...For the first time there were no popular optimistic visions of the future. Science and modernity had lost its mystique.

As the grand narratives of modernity fell from grace, alternative narratives clamoured to be heard and civil rights movements, feminist marches and anti-war protests dominated the western streets. With these new narratives came new histories as feminists, ethnic and minority
groups and newly independent ex-colonial states struggled to find their own identities. The preeminent nationalist, political history of the great, white man suddenly found itself disputed.

In the 1970s and 80s, new areas of enquiry and specialisation emerged in western university history departments to cater for changing student interests (Kaye, 1991:21). But their emphasis on competing histories placed a question mark over the ability of historians to provide their readers with a true account of the past, and a new postmodernist philosophy was rapidly gaining strength. It suggested that ‘there is no final narrative to which everything is reducible, but a variety of perspectives on the world, none of which can be privileged’ (Rohmann, 2000:310).

Today, the Rankean aspiration that historians can tell their readers ‘how it actually happened in the past’, by providing them with an objective body of facts which has been scientifically obtained, ‘is generally considered to be unrealistic’ (Burke, 1991:5-6). As Keith Jenkins points out, a distinction must now be made between the past as an unknowable reality and histories which offer interpretations derived from examining traces of the past (Jenkins, 1991:49). Postmodernist philosophy reinforces the notion that everything is context-bound (Berkhoefer, 1995). Lowenthal explains, for example, that when we read an historical account, we are not aware of what has been excluded, or what simply went without saying at the time (Lowenthal, 1996:114). Thus the sources and texts on which historians base their accounts arise out of particular contexts in the past and we interpret these texts from our own subject positions in the present. In other words, historical documents and sources are constructed in a past reality which we can never really know or truly understand outside the text itself (Berkhoefer, 1995). This development has obviously also had implications for historians writing historical accounts in the present. They too are writing within a particular context, communicating a particular world view.

From the early 1970s to the early 1990s, academic history in the west found itself facing another far more tangible challenge than the ones which, over the same period, were being presented in the theories of postmodernism. The number of history students registering to study history at western universities appeared to be in decline. Furedi (1992:18) again wrote that:
historians on both sides of the Atlantic have long been preoccupied with what they regard as the crisis of their subject. Their concerns about the fragmentation and lack of direction in the study of history have gathered momentum over the past two decades, particularly in the USA, where historians have faced declining job opportunities...Historian James Turner noted that enrolments in history courses had plummeted and that faculties had vanished.

Although this appears to have been a temporary trend in response to political and economic conditions in the 1970s (Richard Evans makes this case for Britain in his book In Defence of History in 1997), and not a signal for the death of academic history, the ‘frustrating paradox’ pointed to by Harvey Kaye is that at the same time as the demand for history education and academic history was decreasing amongst the broader public, popular enthusiasm for the past was visibly increasing. In 1991, Kaye (1991:35) argued that:

historians have failed to attend to on-going changes and developments in the larger culture and, as a consequence, they have both lost their traditional (‘educated’) audiences and been out of touch with and unresponsive to the growing popular demands for the past which have been aggressively catered to by other interests.

These ‘other interests’ took the form of new ‘sites’ of historical production: heritage industries which sought to preserve, display and promote whatever vestiges of the past they could lay their hands on; the return of 1960s fashion to western retail clothes racks, Hollywood blockbusters retelling great epics complete with the latest special effects, and reality television shows where contestants are expected to spend a month living as they did, say, in Victorian times or the Iron Age. Despite postmodernist assertions that nothing is real except our position in the present, the making use of histories, it would appear, is very much alive.

Some western historians such as Patrick Wright (1985), David Lowenthal (1985 and 1996), Raphael Samuel (1996), Greg Dening (1996), Roy Rosenzweig and David Thelen (1998) have begun to investigate this swell of western enthusiasm for the traces of past. In 1985, Lowenthal wrote ‘The past is everywhere...Once confined to a handful of museums and antique shops, the trappings of history now festoon
the whole country’ (1985:xv). This longing for the past is described by Furedi (1992:18) as a symptom of a fear of uncertainty in the present and a loss of confidence in the progress of the future. He explains that:

The prevalence of an outlook that prizes the old and scorns the new implies a negative judgement on contemporary society. Nostalgia for the past, for the ‘good old days’, suggests a degree of disenchantment or at least lack of enthusiasm for life in the present.

In other words people in western societies began to turn to the comfort of their own homemade pasts to guard them from insecurities in the present.

In their respective books, influenced by postmodernist thought and drawing on the idea that history is ‘a heteroglossia, defined as “varied and opposing voices”’ (Burke, 1991:6), the historians named above discuss the different ways in which histories are made and used by ordinary people in their everyday lives: as collective or individual memory (Wright, 1985) and nostalgia for a different world (Lowenthal, 1985, 1996); as entertainment (Samuel, 1996) and performance (Denning, 1996); as a means of connecting with relatives and continuing tradition (Rosenzweig and Thelen, 1998).

South African historians have taken longer to turn their attention towards other forms of history outside the academy. The country’s long colonial past, which was followed by an apartheid regime that consolidated white domination and the exploitation of a largely black working class, saw the emergence of resistance or ‘struggle’ histories which grew up in opposition to white domination and preoccupied the minds of many South African historians. As Nuttall and Wright explain, ‘Particularly since the 1950s and the intensification of political conflict, intellectual energies have cohered around bi-polar stances which supported or opposed racial domination’ (2000:30). But with the democratic elections in South Africa in 1994 the need for ‘struggle’ histories has fallen. As the nation turns its head towards reconciliation, South African historians have found themselves with more time to pursue new opportunities. Spurred on by declining student numbers and a concern for the future of the profession, some South African historians have begun to turn their attention to forms of history
outside the academy. One of these new ‘sites’ is the making of histories in the public sphere inspired by the growth of a vibrant heritage industry in South Africa through which the nation is attempting to commemorate and remember its struggle for freedom against apartheid.

Against a background of increasing appreciation for the importance of history in the everyday, Raphael Samuel is one of the first to raise the question of how school children acquire historical knowledge. He bemoans that fact that ‘[s]o far as pedagogy is concerned, it allows no space for knowledge which creeps in sideways as a by-product of studying something else’ (Samuel, 1996:8). This could be extended to knowledge which creeps in after being exposed to other elements of history which are to be found in the everyday. Samuel (1994:6) asks, what about children’s theatricals, autobiography, stories, legends, songs, children’s games and riddles at school, graphics and television? He considers oral tradition which:

wells up from those lower depths - history’s nether-world - where memory and myth intermingle, and the imaginary rubs shoulders with the real. As a form of knowledge it is acquired higgledy-piggledy, in dibs and dabs, as in the proverbs or jokes which children learn from one another in the playground, or the half-remembered incidents and events which are used to fill in the missing links of a story (sic)

He (1994:12) also suggests that:

[w]ithin the school syllabus it might turn out that the significant history which children learn come not from the timetabled hours, or reading devoted specifically to the subject, but rather...[activities which entertain them] [m]odelling a Roman trireme, building a Saxon hut, or pretending to be an Arawak

This paper argues that by looking at ‘the whole spectrum of learning experiences which have no part in the official syllabus’ as Samuel suggests (1996:12), researchers might discover a new wealth of ‘unofficial’ historical knowledge which is made and used outside the school walls.

By following Samuel’s argument, the official historical consciousness which learners are expected to acquire through the study of history at
school may be of little significance when one considers the changing nature of historical knowledge and the vast array of other forces (outside of the institutions) which influence learners’ senses and understanding of the past. This process by which individuals make meaning of the past through their own experience is interpreted by this study as the activity of making history in the everyday.

**Senses of the past: a window on the present**

The findings of my research revealed a sharp disconnection between history as learnt at school and the blurred, hazy mix of impressions and facts; fuzzy memories and experiences; quirky, funny or interesting stories that constitute history in the everyday. For example, when asked to respond to the question: ‘What does history mean to you?’, the majority of participants seemed to work from the definition that history is ‘studying the past’ (Q48). Many used words or phrases such as ‘study’, ‘learn’, ‘understand’, ‘reminds us’, ‘connects the present with the past’, ‘teaches’, ‘knowing about’, ‘look back’. Some of the learners also made mention of some of the particular skills such as ‘analyse’, ‘learning to think deeply’ or ‘express our views’, which they thought they had learnt whilst studying history. A few learners thought that history is ‘events that have happened in the past’ and some learners mentioned that history is about those events that are relevant to the present or ‘help to predict the future’. The word ‘important’ was used quite liberally either to explain that the study of history is important, or that history is about important people and events.

On the other hand, most learners seem to understand ‘the past’ as ‘the events that happened before the present’ (Q32). For some ‘[t]he past was horrible, full of cruelty, killing of people. Leaders were cunning and roothless (sic). People lived with fear’ (Q2), for others, ‘[t]he past is all about the struggle for freedom’ (Q3). But interspersed with these comments about the more recent past (made particularly by black learners) was a tendency to talk about things that happened ‘long ago’ or ‘in ancient times’, times which seem distant and removed from their lives in the present. These comments were made by both black and white learners. The responses discussed above seem to indicate that the learners are very much conditioned into providing what
they think is the ‘correct’ or acceptable answer. Only a few (mostly black) participants deviated from what would appear to be school-taught definitions of ‘history’ and ‘the past’. Their views also reveal a strongly modernist top-down perception of history, which sees historians as official authorities on the past in contrast to Heller’s suggestion that ‘in everyday life we are all historians’ (cited in Wright, 1985:14).

My analysis of the distinction between history and the past became even more interesting when I asked some of the participants to describe the first thing that came into their minds when thinking about the past. Instead of citing events and time periods, many of the responses better matched the question: What do you feel when you think about the past? A rather shy history learner (quoted above) quietly explained, ‘I really do not care about [the past]; it happened, it happened, it was meant to happen... We just have to go on with the future, let’s just not focus on the past’. One of his peers agreed, ‘The more I think about history, I get sad every time, so I just think about the future now’. One learner from School F exclaimed, ‘I don’t know whether it’s just me, but I find it... frustrating mingling in the past and thinking about it too much’. And a particularly dissatisfied non-history learner from School A who had experienced quite a difficult childhood put her irritation across more assertively, declaring that ‘I think [the past] is total nonsense, a waste of time’.

This intensity of emotion contrasted quite strongly with sentiments of other interviewees from School E and School D who explained in a rather non-committal way that when they thought about the past, they thought about ‘events that have led up to the present’. When asked to name some of these events, they mentioned things like the two World Wars, the Russian Revolution, the Anglo-Boer War, the coming of settlers to South Africa. They also made reference to more ancient civilisations (like Egypt), as well as their own particular family histories.

Many of the black learners who participated in the study came from poor backgrounds and lived with parents or grandparents who had little by way of a book education. Consequently, the learners did not see their family as an authority on the past, and tended not to ask them questions about it, preferring to go to their teacher or history textbook. One boy
explained that he did not talk to his parents about the past because ‘they are not educated. I think they didn’t have a chance to study’. Many of these black learners (and more, particularly their parents or caregivers), have had extremely difficult lives and have experienced much suffering and hurt. Perhaps many of the parents of black learners find it too painful to talk about the past, or else the learners avoid the topic to avoid upsetting their parents. One boy, talking about his mother, said, ‘She usually urges me not to stick on the past, but to go on with my life and just be a better person.’ Nevertheless, conversations about the past seem to have taken place even in these circumstances. ‘Usually it’s just the happy stuff,’ said one learner. ‘Sometimes the stuff she [her mother] does is so fascinating cause she’s still old and she’s still in her ways about doing stuff so sometimes I just pop a question and she doesn’t mind really.’ Another girl explained:

Ja, I talk to my family, especially my aunt, she usually talks about like the things that they do, like they used to go and fetch water with their friends and it’s like, she always says, like, the teenagers of today, they are so different from the past, like, we were always willing to work so hard, we didn’t have everything so easy, and like, you always complaining, complaining about this and that, you should see the time we were young, you should come back, turn back the hands of time and actually experience the way we lived, you know, then you wouldn’t be complaining now.

Learners seem to enjoy hearing these family stories. One commented, ‘It’s quite interesting because it’s very nice to hear from a person who was there, you know, who experienced every bit of it, so it makes me want to find out more.’

White learners tended to talk less about the apartheid past than black learners and more about their settler ancestors. They also spoke about family traditions and quirky or rather dubious relations from the past who had some small claim to fame, of which their descendants were rather proud. One boy from School E, who seems to spend a lot of time talking to his grandfather about the past, revealed that ‘I enjoy listening to all those old stories and the sort of war stories and all that sort of stuff so it’s actually interesting just to hear from a different point of view and see here how things have changed, just like in town or in like sort of Na-
tal, how things have grown and sort of got bigger and better and all that sort of stuff’. White learners also tended to speak to their parents about English or British history in particular, and world history more generally. One girl explained, ‘My parents are quite into, like, history, well they not full on historians, but they do know a certain amount and I speak to them...I ’spose mainly about English history’. For both Indian and white learners these conversations about world history were often linked to ones involving current international affairs. A history learner commented that ‘I argue with my father about like, with the war in Palestine and Israel, we have a lot of arguments about that, but he’s not, he doesn’t really like to get to understand why, he just knows the events and like, argues about the events. He doesn’t like, see other people’s point of view’.

These conversations with family did not appear to be seen by participants as histories per se; they were more intimate, more precious than the hard, establishment histories that the participants encountered at school. For the white learners in particular, these spontaneous conversations about the past seem to be closely linked with their own personal identities and those of their families. Conversations tended to turn around observed differences between the past and the present, understanding present circumstances and perpetuating and explaining traditions. Despite the painful experiences of many learners’ families, conversations about the past also seem to be a source of much pleasure and comfort for the family members involved.

It is important to observe that, in many cases, learners’ attitudes to school history were in some way representative and reflective of where they were in their own lives in the present. For example, some learners enjoyed learning history at school because learning about the past gave them some sense of satisfaction or purpose in the present. For some of the black learners, the past was about learning about the African struggle for liberation against apartheid and remembering the courage and sacrifice of African freedom fighters. These learners felt empowered by black liberation and tended to be of the opinion that we must learn from the past and look to the future. They saw the past as a challenge to themselves to go out and make their mark on the world. For other learners (of all races), particularly the history learners and the non-history learners who enjoyed history, the past was a source of fascination because it was
considered different, yet familiar to the present. These learners used the past to compare it with their own lives and to imagine how they would deal with similar situations to those faced or experienced by people in the past. They tended to see the past as a source of life lessons from which they could draw to guide their own lives. They enjoyed school history because it explained to them ‘where they came from.’ Thus, in these cases, the past served as a foundation, a safety net, a source from which learners could draw support to ‘go forward into the future.’

However, for some participants, the South African past seemed to be a source of much irritation. A number of learners mentioned that in South Africa, the past was simply being used as an excuse to explain away problems in the present. This frustration is perhaps the sign of a younger generation who do not want to be saddled with the burden of the past. In this regard, white learners seemed to be the group who were most disgruntled with the past. By labeling the past as ‘boring’ or ‘a waste of time,’ these white (predominantly English-speaking) learners suggested that they did not feel in any way connected with the way in which the South African past is being viewed in the public sphere and school system today, that is, as something which needs to be corrected, redressed, rewritten. These learners, in particular, seemed to feel that they were being punished for the legacy of a past which was not of their own creation. Some of these learners were more outspoken, arguing that school history placed what they considered to be ‘too much emphasis on the South African past’ which some of them seemed to think had ‘very little to do with them really,’ they were ‘not even there,’ and history thus became ‘a pointless subject.’

A similar rejection of school history was observed amongst some of the black learners, particularly those from poorer backgrounds. For them the past was a source of oppression which had caused their parents and families much hardship and had resulted in much pain. For these learners, the end of apartheid offered new opportunities (particularly in education) which their parents and grandparents had not had the privilege of seeing. The past was sad, painful and over, the way to a better life was through hard work, good grades and a respectable profession. These learners also seemed to feel quite a lot of responsibility to make use of the opportunities which had not been afforded their parents and to res-
cue their families from their difficult circumstances. So although they were fairly positive about their future, past struggles and events, and the opportunities which these had delivered, placed quite a lot of pressure on the lives of these learners in the present and they tended to feel indebted to the leaders of the African struggle against apartheid. It would appear that, unconsciously, learners’ ‘senses of the past’ and their subject positions in the present were obviously sometimes partly supported and sometimes partly contradicted by official historical consciousness which they were expected to learn at school. This finding helps to support Allen (2000) and Nuttall and Wright’s (2000) assertions that learners may be avoiding school history partly because they see the subject in its current form as an ‘establishment tool’ (Allen, 2000) used by the state to mould the new nation into a particular historical consciousness.

But whatever their attitudes to history and the past, I was struck by the fact that many of the learners were perfectly willing, and sometimes quite enthusiastic to talk to me about the past. I would suggest that because they were in a position to speak authoritatively on their own views and opinions, some of the learners appreciated the opportunity that was afforded them by the interview to do just that.

This readiness for conversation about the past amongst learners who have chosen to reject history as a useful subject for Matric suggests that it is possible that the role and nature of history in schools could be understood in a completely different way. For those historians and history educators who recognise the role of ‘the past in service of the present’ (Chernis, 1990), learning more about adolescent’s senses of the past no longer shows us how little they know about the past, it tells us much about how they think and feel in the present. In other words, it would be valuable for historians and history educators to acknowledge that adolescents are just as much ‘producers’ of pasts as they are ‘learners’ of history and it would appear from the results of the practical research component of this study that, as adolescents, they need to be given the chance to express their own senses of the past, even if all they want to say is that the past is ‘rubbish’ (12).
Schools as sites where histories are made

In a report that outlined their findings on the quality of history education in South Africa, the History and Archaeology Panel wrote (Department of Education, 2000):

we have to recognise the fact that everyone has a form of historical consciousness. This historical consciousness is not crafted on a blank slate by teachers in schools, or by professional historians in universities. It is created in and by the family, the community, churches, the media and other areas of communication, interacting with individual experience. In this, the value of the formal study of history is that it aims to develop this latent consciousness into a conscious consciousness.

But the argument put forward in this paper is that it is necessary to look beyond the ‘problem’ of how to develop a “latent historical consciousness into a conscious consciousness”. It is equally important, I would suggest, to understand how histories are made and used by learners in the everyday; how these “latent consciousness” which learners bring with them to school, materialise and are formed and used (if at all) by learners in the first place? What unofficial histories and senses of the past are being produced everyday by the learners within our schools?

In the future, it is possible that institutional history as we have known it may not even exist, out-maneuvered by new ways of thinking about history. Running parallel to our search to find ‘solutions’ to the ‘problems’ facing school history education, what if we begin to think about school history in a completely different way? What if we begin to think of schools not simply as centres of teaching and learning history to mould the nation, or to provide learners with formal instruction in the ways of the academic historian, but as important sites of historical production alongside the many others that are now being taken seriously by an increasing number of historians (academic and otherwise) such as ‘heritage’, ‘popular history’ or ‘history in the everyday’. New approaches to understanding the nature of history suggest that it is useful to see schools as places where the younger generation congregate as learners and bring with them a whole host of perceptions, emotions, stories and anecdotes about the past which have very little connection with the his-
tory they learn at school but are valid histories in themselves, nevertheless.

Looking back over the history of history education in South Africa, I would argue that too often it has been dominated by the tyranny of the extreme. The wisdom of the idiom: “everything in moderation” rings true for me here: content should not be taught at the exclusion of skills and methodology; methodology should not be hammered at the exclusion of content; the importance of individual discovery and investigation should not be emphasised at the expense of teaching and formal instruction; and the “how to” of history teaching should not be explored without investigating how children and adolescents make their own histories; how they make sense of the past in their everyday lives.

References

Questionaires (Q) and Interviews (I)

One hundred questionnaires completed in March 2004 by a sample of Grade 12 learners at six selected schools in the Durban area. Twenty transcribed interviews. The interviews were transcribed between March and June of 2004. Twenty learners from a sample of Grade 12 learners at six selected schools in the Durban area were interviewed in March 2004. The completed questionnaires, the transcribed interviews and the original tapes from which they were transcribed are available from the researcher.

Unpublished works


Education.


**Published works (Journals & Books)**


**Internet sources**


Methodology
CREATE A USABLE SENSE OF THE PAST: WORKING WITH SOURCES

Edward Smuts
University of Stellenbosch

Introduction

It is occasionally said that history is what happened long ago. This is not true because the past is what actually happened. History is what people say happened in the past. History is constructed by people who study the past (Copeland 1998: 1). History is created through working on sources – both primary sources (those that have survived from the period being studied) and secondary sources (later interpretations of the period being studied). Historians look for evidence of what happened in the past. Then they make their own interpretations based on the evidence they have found. The evidence can come from a variety of sources. Historical knowledge is therefore the outcome of a process of enquiry. This is a process that we now call 'doing history'. This is a phrase that Jack Hexter started to use in his book on historical studies (Hexter 1971).

Historians operate in the following ways when investigating the past and constructing history. They pose questions of the past; collect sources which they interpret by organising, analysing, evaluating and extracting relevant information in order to address the question; construct history based on the evidence from the sources in order to answer the questions that they have posed; and communicate their findings in a logical, systematic manner (Dean 2002: 1-2).

At the end of the last century the teaching of history changed considerably (Catterall 1994). The focus moved to using both primary and secondary sources instead of only using school textbooks (tertiary sources) in the traditional way. Documentary evidence is the raw material that the historian works with. The interpretation of the past is constructed through a careful sifting of many documents of a diverse nature that can include official
government documents, diaries and memoirs, artefacts, maps, sketches, diagrams, oral testimony, photos, cartoons, statistical data, and so on.

2. **Construction of Knowledge in History**

A fundamental goal of teaching history should therefore be to teach learners to be historians. Learners should be taught how to construct knowledge in history instead of being passive absorbers of historical information. Furthermore, skills and techniques as well as knowledge and understanding can be assessed while learners empower themselves with their own learning. The learner's ability to construct historical knowledge – doing history – should therefore be the primary focus of the assessment.

Learners are brought face to face with the past through an investigation in order to present their findings. According to Nichol (1997: 66) they gain insights into the past by transforming the information (evidence) from their sources into a form that they can understand. The construction of knowledge needs to be based on the evidence and there need to be some accepted ways to interpret the evidence: looking at chronology; looking for change and continuity; cause and effect; similarity and difference.

The following diagram (Figure 1) and explanation\(^2\) clearly illustrates knowledge construction in history (WCED 2005: 4):
Methodology

Th us the cycle of enquiry comprises the following:

- **Asking questions** of the past, present and future. The questions can come from either the educator or the learners. All learning in History should start with a question. This also offers an ideal opportunity to focus on issues in society, e.g. democracy, critical citizenry, human rights issues, etc.

- **Collecting information/data** to answer the questions. Educators structure activities to guide learners in extracting evidence from the sources (primary/secondary) at an appropriate level. Learners can also discuss different sides to a story or different opinions about something.

- **Organising information** in e.g. tables, graphs in order to simplify the next processes

- Making deductions by **analysing evidence (information/data)**

- **Constructing an answer** / taking up a position based on the evidence.

- **Communicating or presenting the answers** in a variety of appropriate ways.

- **Applying the new insights** supported by the educators who guide them to see the relevance of the enquiry to their own world.

According to Copeland (1998:7-8), it is very important that educator intervention takes place at a number of stages during the process of
teaching, enquiry and construction:

- **Setting the key question:** The educator plays a crucial role in ensuring that the key question is well focused and that it will assist with the construction of knowledge. The aspect of the past to be constructed in the activity, such as difference, change, chronology, causation, will determine the choice of question. How did this event change the South African society? (change); Why do you think this event happened? (causation).

- Progression can be seen in both the growing demands made on the learner by the question(s) and also in the decision by the educator to allow the learners to set their own questions.

- **Selection of historical sources:** The aspect to be studied and the ability of the learners are both important factors to be taken into account when selecting appropriate sources for the enquiry. One source or several sources may be selected. The sources may be of similar type (all photos) or a variety (an artefact, a picture and a document). An appropriate selection of sources will allow the opportunity to construct meaning.

- **Define skills and concepts:** The educator must decide on the skills and the concepts to be applied in the activity which will allow the learner to make a construction. Providing additional information or asking leading questions during the activity may also be used as a means to help the learner.

- **Setting the means of communication:** The concept that is used will determine the appropriateness of the recording and communication methods: tables to organise information; Venn diagrams to show change and continuity; timelines to focus on chronology of events; etc. It is of vital importance to use the appropriate recording and communication method to make sure that the learner constructs meaning that relates to the concept.

Differentiation and progression will be seen in the type of communication the activity demands; drawing, role-play, talking, writing, etc.
Methodology

- Selection of means of assessment: The educator needs to assess the learner’s ability to form a construction. The best way to do this is through the recording and communication method.
- Creating opportunities to review: Firstly, the educator needs to review the student’s learning, by assessing the learner’s interpretation and communication. Secondly, it is vital that the educator creates the opportunity for the learner to reflect on what s/he has learned and how the present construction is different from previous constructions; this is important in understanding the historical process.
- Looking ahead: It is important to help the learner look ahead to the next phase of the process of construction. The educator does this by sharing the focus of the next activity. This will enable the learner to place his or her learning into a continuum.

Construction of knowledge in history takes place in the present even though it is about the past. We use evidence about the past in the present and we use our own experiences, interests and assumptions in our constructions. Our constructions of the past are therefore “a very ‘present’ activity” according to Copeland (1998: 10). Construction of knowledge develops the learners’ thinking skills and their insight into what may have happened in the past. It is through this process of construction that they are enabled to come to terms with their place in the World.

Learning history should present learners with dynamic and enabling skills and concepts which allow them to come to terms with the nature of the past and the present (Copeland 1998: 10).

3. Nature of Source Work

It is therefore evident that knowledge construction will have an effect on the nature of source work in history.

The diagram (Figure 2) below gives a clear indication of the manner in which source work needs to be conducted. It can be done not only during an examination and a test, but also in the classroom. Source work can be done individually or as group work. It is important that sources are given in question papers, tests and classroom activities. These sources
should be supplied by the educator for classroom activities or they may also be gathered by the learner or by the educator and learner.

The enquiry route needs to be followed, as explained in the diagram, regarding knowledge construction (Figure 1). The response by the learner can be presented in a variety of appropriate ways – visual, verbal and written format.

There are some important questions to ask about historical sources as illustrated in the diagram (Figure 3) below (DoE September 2005: 29).
The questions around the source help you to understand and use the information in the source. You will need to think about these questions when you also use other sources.

**Figure 3**

4. **What does this mean for teaching and learning?**

---

Methodology

A secret order sent out by the SS, August 1942:
Re: Use of hair cuttings
To the Commandants of the concentration camps...

...[The] hair of concentration camp prisoners is to be put to use. Hair is to be made into industrial felt or spun into yarn. Women’s hair is to be used for the manufacture of socks for submarine crews and...footwear for the Reichs-raileway.

It is therefore ordered that hair of female prisoners be disinfected and stored. Men’s hair may only be put to use if it is longer than 20mm.

Signed: Görlitz
SS-Hauptsturmführer und Generalmajor der Waffen-SS

Who wrote it?

When was it written?

To whom was it written?

Why was it written?

What does it say?

What does it tell us about the past?

Can we trust what it says?

Was the person there?

Is it biased?
In other words, whose point of view?

Is it reliable?
Is the information accurate?
It is far more interesting to work with original historical sources than reading from a textbook or listening to a lecture according to Barton (2005: 751). These sources can create personal connections to history, as students read the words written by living, breathing humans like themselves. Furthermore audio, visual and audio-visual sources and material artefacts can be popular additions to the classroom. Much the same could be said for historical fiction, games and simulations or role plays and dramas. What then are the implications and unique contributions of working with historical sources? What does this mean for teaching and learning?

We need to remember that in all cases the aim of working with historical sources is to guide learners in the process of constructing their own piece of history and to create a usable sense of the past. It is in this context that it is important that they know whether it is a primary or a secondary source and that they understand issues of bias and the reliability of sources. If we accept that, then there are several implications, all of which we are grappling with when we engage with source work in history.

- **The enquiry process or investigation needs to be directed by key questions.**
  Learners must be encouraged and taught to ask questions about the past. Educators and learning and teaching support materials (LTSM) need to provide questions for learners. Included in Figure 4 are two examples of key questions.

  Why did the South African Government impose the State of Emergency in the 1980s?
  Did the formation of NATO increase the tension of the Cold War in Europe?

- **Historical sources need to be provided and grouped.**
  The enquiry process or investigations must be set up using sources. Educators and learning and teaching support materials (LTSMs) must provide authentic sources for learners to find answers to the questions. It is also important to group a number of different types of sources (Figure 5) that focus on a topic. Use a key question to
guide the research/enquiry process.

What were the factors which influenced the process of decolonisation?

| WRITTEN SOURCE | PHOTOGRAPH | STATISTICS |

Figure 5

- **All sources need to be properly contextualised**

The more information given about a source, the better the questions that can be asked based on this source. The context-setting of a primary source includes the author/creator of the source, date, the event (e.g. a speech at a rally) while the context-setting of a secondary source should include the author, title and date of the book. The newspapers and the date published need to be identified for both written newspaper reports and cartoons. Identifying people in a cartoon or photo should form part of the context-setting. It is not a historical skill to ask learners to identify people. See the examples included in Figure 6.

**SOURCE 5A**

This is an extract from Turning Points in History Book 4 edited by Bill Nasson. It looks at the nature of Afrikaner nationalism and identity in the 1930s.

**SOURCE 2C**

This is a photograph of the Great Trek centenary celebrations in 1938. Thousands of Afrikaners greet the trek wagons as they make their way down Pritchard Street, Johannesburg, in December 1938. Note the Africans in the foreground. The centenary celebrations of the Boer trek came at a time when thousands of Afrikaners had trekked from the rural areas to the cities. The romantic
reconstruction of a brave and independent past, ‘The Great Trek’ struck a deep chord in many struggling to survive in the city, and helped to promote the Afrikaner nationalist movement.

**SOURCE 4B**
This is an article entitled ‘Houses of Hessian’ which was published in a local newspaper Umteteli wa Bantu, 8 April 1944.

---

- **A variety of sources should be used**
  Although it is possible to use only one source in an investigation, it is more usual to use more than this. If two or more sources are used they need to be selected in order to support, complement or contradict one other in the investigation. One should try to combine audio, visual, and audio-visual material, oral and written sources if possible to enhance the value of the investigation (Figure 5). Use fewer but lengthier sources to answer and interface with the key question. If the focus is on working with photographs or artefacts a number of the same type of sources e.g. photographs or artefacts should be used.

- **Sources need to have enough in them**
  Sources need to speak to the learners. Learners seem to be more attracted to sources of a more personal nature such as diaries, oral testimony or a newspaper report about what happened to people. Official government documents tend to be difficult reading matter for some learners. Sources that are two and three sentences in length (Figure 7) should be avoided. Sources need to have enough in them so that significant questions may be asked and also need to be a reasonable length in order for learners to be able to do something meaningful with them (Figure 8).

**SOURCE 6C**
Soviet Russia set up communist governments in all the countries they controlled. The following extract from a BBC
Remarks on Figures 7 and 8

Figure 7 is a source that was included in the National History HG Paper 2 November 2003. It is properly contextualised, but very short. The dots indicate that parts of the source have been left out and broken into very short quotes to form a source. This source does not have enough in it on which to base significant questions and, furthermore, there is not very much in the source with which learners can do something meaningful.

Figure 8 is a source that was written by a news reporter about residents and students in Soweto during the Soweto Uprising in 1976. It is a lengthy source, but has very interesting reading matter. This very rich source tells about the fears of the residents and it gives a clear indication of the mood of the students. There is a great deal in this source on which significant questions may be asked and it is also a source that can be used on its own for something meaningful.

SOURCE 4A

This is an extract from a book entitled People on the boil which was written by Harry Mashabela – an African news reporter – reflecting on the 1976 Soweto Uprisings. Read the extract and answer the following questions.

Something was burning inside a side street above. We could only see dark smoke shooting into the air. I ran up the road to see what it was.

‘Get back’, a band of students a distance away shouted. I stopped almost instantly, looking at them. They waved at me to get back. There was no other way. Defiance would spell trouble, I thought. As I retreated I had a
brainwave. Glancing to see whether they watched, I jumped into a yard, then into another, joining an elderly woman. ‘Oh, our children, what are they doing?’ She shook her head in disbelief. A van belonging to the West Rand Administration Board (WRAB), the notorious regional authority governing Soweto, was on fire. Pupils had set it alight. She did not know what happened to the poor driver. He must have escaped, she said somewhat wistfully. She seemed stricken with fear, fear of what might happen as a result of what was happening, I thought. I wondered whether she blamed the children or the police for what was happening.

‘P-o-w-e-r!’ shrill voices pierced the air for the umpteenth time. I got back, waited outside. I went into the house of Dr Matlhare. I was still phoning inside the house, talking to the news desk at the office, when the servant banged the door, shouting. ‘Come out; they will kill us. They are burning the house,’ she screamed plaintively. Without thinking, I also shouted into the telephone: ‘I’m phoning from Dr Matlhare. They are burning the house,’ I hung up, running behind the servant, out of the house.

A mob of youngsters lingered in front of the house. ‘It is his car,’ the servant mumbled, pointing at me. And the mob surrounded me. ‘Is that your car?’ someone shouted, pointing at a Volkswagen parked near the motor-gate.

‘No, it’s not mine. It belongs to The World newspaper and I work for The Star.

‘It’s a lie; We’re burning it if it is not yours, can we?’
‘If you want you can burn it. It’s not mine.’
‘It belongs to the police, we understand.’
‘You can burn it if you want, but it isn’t a police car;
Methodology

- **Questioning in activities should keep various aspects in mind**
  A key question and sources should form the basis of an activity that encourages an investigation. The question should furthermore provide the opportunity in class for individual and paired work, discussions and debate. It is also important that the nature of the question should help to develop language and communication skills. These are important skills and need to be taught continuously.

  Try to avoid technical questions about sources that are not related to the ultimate aim of creating an extended piece of writing in history. Questions about sources are only useful if they help learners to construct the history at the end of the set of sources. The type of questions included in Figure 9 are in themselves of little value.

- Is this a primary or a secondary source? Give reasons for your answer.
- Is there enough evidence in the source about the event? Substantiate your answer.

Learners must be encouraged to make judgements based on evidence and defend their judgements or point of view on sources. Question 3 in Figure 8 is a very good example. Learners must also be able to recognise and understand different points of view in sources. This skill will help them to construct a piece of extended writing. All the questions within an investigation need to ensure that the main key question is answered in the end.

Figure 8 continues
Appendix A includes various sentence beginnings to source-based questions. It is a useful tool to help with setting questions. Questions in an investigation should include various levels of questioning (Figure 10) from extracting evidence, through the steps to using the source to create a piece of extended writing, however short that piece might be.

### LEVELS OF QUESTIONING (DoE 2002):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Level 1:</td>
<td><strong>Extract evidence</strong> from sources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level 2:</td>
<td><strong>Straightforward interpretations</strong> by using evidence from one source and broader knowledge to show an understanding of the period/event/issue.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level 3:</td>
<td><strong>Straightforward interpretations</strong> by using evidence from more than one source and broader knowledge to show an understanding of the period event/issue.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level 4:</td>
<td><strong>Complex interpretations</strong> often involving more than one source. These questions look at aspects such as bias, reliability, usefulness, the use of organising concepts (similarity and difference; cause and consequence; chronology; change and continuity) to explain contrasts, comparisons, etc., empathy and extended writing in history.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Investigations need to focus on skills and concepts.

  Working with sources develops a number of key history skills; therefore the enquiry process (LO 1 in GET and FET: ask, acquire, organise, analyse, and communicate) should be followed. They can be grouped into four broad areas: analysis, evaluation, synthesis (including judgement and extrapolation) and communication.

By using these key history skills one would be able to determine similarity and difference, continuity and change, cause and consequence, chronology and time, bias, empathy, reliability and other concepts (LO 2 in GET and FET).

- **A classroom-based activity and an examination question need to be structured properly and to have a clear layout.**

  The classroom-based activity or examination question should be...
based on a key question and sources should form an integral part of the activity or question. It is also very important that the questions on the sources link to the assessment standards and key question. These questions about the sources should be varied and should end with an extended writing question. Extended writing could require learners to use their own knowledge as well as aspects of information from or about the sources.

The following example (Figure 11) of the layout is taken from the NCS Subject Assessment Guidelines (DoE September 2005: 28).

Figure 11
5. **What is the scope of assessment of source work?**

It is accepted that history is a process of enquiry into past events leading to the writing of history. This has become the focus of history teaching in the last decade. The learners’ ability to construct knowledge and to apply the related historical skills and concepts needs therefore to be the focus of assessment in history.

Content plays an extremely important role in history and, in the National Curriculum Statement, it is the context for the learning outcomes and assessment standards. In the National Curriculum Statement, assessment activities will be derived from the learning outcomes and the assessment standards, but the content will provide the context for assessment. With this in mind, a relevant assessment strategy needs to be chosen. The choice of assessment strategies is a subjective one, unique to each teacher, grade and school and dependent on the teacher’s professional judgement. It is important that the strategy chosen is appropriate for the specific learning outcomes being assessed and should emphasise the learner’s individual growth and development (DoE April 2005: 20).

Aspects of the learning outcomes will be used in all work done in the history classroom. The selection and combination of assessment standards (included under the learning outcomes) will not only define the nature of the activity, but also the focus of the assessment. Assessment should therefore be criterion-referenced so that the learner’s ability to construct knowledge is assessed.

The history teacher needs to use the assessment standards to develop assessment criteria (See Figure 12) which may then be organised in assessment tools or instruments such as checklists (See Figure 13), rating or assessment scales (See Figure 14), holistic rubrics (See Figure 15) and analytical rubrics (See Figure 16).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ASSESSMENT STANDARD 11.1.1</th>
<th>ASSESSMENT CRITERIA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Identify issues within the topic under study (e.g. imperialism) and ask critical questions about the issues.</td>
<td>Learner is able to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• identify issues within the topic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• ask critical questions about the issues</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 12
Methodology

CHECKLIST

| I have identified issues within the topic. | Yes/ No |
| I have asked critical questions about the issues. |   |

Figure 13

RATING SCALE

| Learner is able to | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| Identify issues within the topic. |
| Ask critical questions about the issues. |

Figure 14

1 = not at all  2 = to some extent  3 = to a great degree  4 = completely

HOLISTIC RUBRIC to assess the learner’s ability to take and substantiate a relevant point of view

| LEVEL 1 | Did not make a choice. or Made a choice, but has not justified the choice in a way that relates to the evidence in the sources or shows an understanding of the situation/event/issue. | Marks: 0 – 3 |
| LEVEL 2 | A relevant point of view has been chosen. Valid reasons for the choice have been given. The justification, the use of evidence from the sources and own knowledge show to a certain extent an understanding of the situation/event/issue. Shows an awareness of a certain attitude or belief as being typical of a certain period or place. | Marks: 4 – 8 |
| LEVEL 3 | A relevant point of view has been chosen. Logical, clear and valid reasons for the choice have been made. The justification relates very well to the situation/event/issue. Evidence from sources and own knowledge has been used effectively to show an understanding of the range of attitudes within a person or group being typical of a certain period or place. | Marks: 9 – 12 |

Figure 15

The holistic rubric gives a global picture of the standard required. It assesses the overall impression at the end of a process that needs to be assessed. A holistic rubric is therefore very much ‘an end of the road’ assessment instrument.
The analytical rubric should give a clear picture of the distinct features that make up the criteria. It is a developmental assessment instrument and it assesses specific points. It can show one the present level of competency of the learner as well as what the learner still needs to do to improve. The analytical rubric consists of scoring criteria (the points for assessment), scoring levels (the range of assessment choices) and the criteria descriptors (these describe expectations for each criterion).

It is evident that source-based work should be assessed in a holistic manner by using assessment criteria that are organised in an appropriate assessment tool. It helps the assessor to move away from focusing solely on content and advantages learners because it focuses on the process of enquiry.

Teachers need to use these tools to collect evidence of learner performance. These tools need to be in place prior to the learner participating in any of the history activities which involve the assessment of learner performance. It is crucial that a teacher shares the assessment tool(s) for the activity with the learners before they do the required activity. The assessment tool clarifies what both the learning and the performance
should focus on. It becomes a powerful tool for self-assessment.

It is still important to mark source-based answers by using ticks and a conventional marking guideline to determine whether the requirements of the question have been addressed. In order to get a holistic view of the learner’s competence regarding the application of historical skills and concepts it is necessary to use an assessment tool to allocate an overall mark. In marking all source-based questions credit needs to be given to any other valid and relevant viewpoints, arguments, evidence or examples (backed up by evidence). In the allocation of marks emphasis should be placed on whether the requirements of the question have been met or not. These assessment strategies also provide opportunities for rewarding the demonstration that learners have applied their own knowledge.

6. Conclusion

The effective use of original sources requires careful attention to their educational purposes. Learners need to learn how historical knowledge is constructed and to use evidence to reach conclusions about issues that face them as citizens. In this way they will also learn historical content. They must therefore always use sources within a context of enquiry. Such enquiry requires that learners develop and pursue meaningful questions, that they make informed choices about the evidence that can be used to answer those questions, and that they gain experience drawing conclusions from evidence (Barton 2005: 753). The learner’s performance in relation to the selected assessment standards should therefore be the primary focus of the assessment while working with sources.

It is evident that historical sources should certainly be a centrepiece of the history classroom, because they are the foundation of historical knowledge. By working with sources in an effective manner learners are enabled to create a usable sense of the past.

References

1 Senior Curriculum Adviser: History until July 2005; since August 2005 lecturer at the Department of Curriculum Studies, Faculty of Education at the Stellenbosch University and since November 2005 External Moderator: History at Umalusi.
APPENDIX A ON SOURCE-BASED QUESTIONS

Examples of sentence beginnings of questions

1. What differences are there between Sources A & B?
2. Explain the importance of...
3. What point is the cartoonist trying to make?
4. Do you agree with the comments?
5. How useful is Source A to an historian studying...?
6. What message is the cartoonist trying to convey in Source A?
7. Describe in your own words...
8. How useful are the headlines in Source A?
9. Using Sources A & B explain the differences between... &...
10. In your own words explain...
11. Does Source A give a reliable view of...?
12. What do Sources A & B tell you about conditions during...
13. Explain the effects that find...
14. Which would be more useful to an historian studying...?
15. Decide how important...
16. What happened at...?
17. Compare Sources A & B. What different views do they give of...?
18. What does Source A tell you about the effects of...?
19. How reliable is Source A?
20. What attitude to...is shown by Source A?
21. How effective is Source A in getting the message across?
22. Is Source A a reliable view of... (e.g. on the birth of South Africa’s democracy)?
23. Why was there growing opposition to...?
24. Explain the main events that took place...
25. Why do you think the newspaper printed this story?
26. What point is the artist trying to make in Source A?
27. What image of... (women) do you get from Source A?
28. What differences are there between these 2 versions of...(Sources A & B)?
29. According to Source A, how serious were their problems that...?
30. How reliable is Source A as a view of...?
31. Does Source B give a reliable view of...?
THE USE OF THE DBD (DIGITAL BOOK DISK) FOR EFFECTIVE TEACHING IN HISTORY

Hennie Steyn and Michelle de Kock

North-West University (Potchefstroom Campus)

Introduction

The primary significance and purpose of History Education is to provide present day individuals with ‘experience in a nutshell’ and to assist these individuals to understand the complexity of the present world. To serve this role, History Education depends on information transfer about yesterday. Therefore, it is important to take cognisance of the development of communication, and particularly the ICT-revolution, that is characterising the daily lives of modern individuals. This article will introduce the DBD (digital book disk) as affordable and robust electronic media to integrate the different communication genres and thus enriched the reporting on the history, the days of the past. This will enhance the relevancy of and meaningful learning in History Education in present day schools. The aim of the article is not to provide a step-by-step explanation of the development of the DBD as concept (because of the Intellectual Property and commercial considerations).

When a report is given, in the format of an article, on the development of new technologies, it is necessary to explain which methods that were used during the development. Usually in planning a research project, the decision is made before hand about which research methods are going to be used. However, in the case of the development of this new technology, a process of iterative and systematic critical reasoning was followed. Based on the critical reasoning, it was through a mixed (and not necessarily initially decided upon) application of several (applicable) scientific methods and processes, such as observation, analysis and synthesis, induction and deduction, that the development and refinement of the idea took place and resulted in the development of a new technology, namely the DBD (Stoker, 1961: 62-90; Mouton & Marais, 1989: 102; Mouton, 1996: 77-78; Harden & Thomas, 2005: 258) (Insert 1).
Several research projects, to test the outcomes of the previous mentioned development work, were executed (Van der Westhuizen & Richter, 2004, 2005, 2006a, 2006b; De Sousa; Richter & Nel, 2006; Golightly, 2006, Steyn & Dreyer, 2005). In these studies, the research methods typical of the quantitative as well as the qualitative research paradigms were used. The results of each of these projects provide further information to improve the features of the DBD, as concept. All the projects confirm the successful applicability of the DBD in teaching and learning. However, it was not through the research methods that the quality of outcomes of the research and development project was assured, but the quality assurance was found in the level to which the DBD support the provisioning of effective teaching and learning.

Insert 1

Methods of research

- Critical reasoning is an important research instrument when creating new knowledge or technologies, because “... it is what experts ... engage in when they are doing some of their best work” (Bensley, 1998: 3). Critical reasoning is described as reasonable, reflective thinking that is focussed on deciding what to do and that involve the relevant evidence in order to reach a sound result (Ennis, 1987: 9). Critical thinkers must have the following characteristics, namely: knowledge of reasoning; a set of cognitive skills involved in reasoning; knowledge that is relevant to the particular problem or issue and a set of dispositions to think critically, eg the tendency to reason critically in approaching a question (Bensley, 1998: 5-6). The research methods of analysis, synthesis, induction and deduction are useful instruments in critical reasoning.
The methods of analysis and synthesis are actions of reasoning in order to know. Analysis is the method through which the ‘parts/elements/sections’ of a ‘totality’ are identified, described and/or characterised with the optimal aim to acquire knowledge about the totality and/or the parts. The analysis exercise provides an opportunity to focus on the ‘totality’ as well as on the characteristics of the ‘parts’. Synthesis is the method to combine the parts of a totality in a unit in order to acquire knowledge about the totality and/or the parts (Stoker, 1961: 85; Walsch & Downe, 2005: 204-205; Potter, 2004: 75-85). The synthesis exercise provide opportunity to link (perhaps in a different way) the parts in such a way that resulted in the better understanding or functioning of the ‘totality’.

Deduction is the process through which knowledge about the particular is ‘afgelei’ from the general knowledge and induction is the process through which knowledge about the general is ‘afgelei’ from the particular (Stoker, 1961: 80; Larossa, R. 2005: 853). These are also important tools in critical reasoning because the relation between the features of individual ‘objects’ and the generic features of the ‘class of objects’ provides valuable information.

Observation is the process through which knowledge about a particular object or situation or setting is acquired through the careful systematic engagement of the researcher with/in the particular research field/object (Cresswell, 2003: 185).

Characteristics of Education

- **Education and the education system**
  Education can be defined as the planned activities of educators to support learners to acquire the required competencies (knowledge, skills and attitudes) to prepare themselves for their different roles in life (Steyn, Steyn, De Waal & Wolhuter, 2002: par 2.3.2).
  The education system is generally accepted as the major vehicle to distribute effective, organised education throughout a particular country. Therefore, the primary task of the education system is to provide in the real education needs of the inhabitants of a particular country (Insert
2). In the education system the capacity to provide effective teaching and learning should be provided while simultaneously increase the productivity in education. The education system should provide the opportunities to change education according to the (modern) teaching and learning needs of the education clientele and thus include modern teaching practices into the education environment.

**Insert 2**
The structure of the education system (Steyn, Steyn, De Waal & Wolhuter, 2002: fig 1.1)

- **The traditional view about education**
  Education, or effective teaching and learning, was traditionally viewed as the face-to-face interaction between the educator and the learner. During this interaction the educators teach/support the learners regarding the acquisition of the required outcomes. The educator provides the learning aims and the learning materials and, in the class, provides the context, explains the new information, provides information not in the learning material and provides opportunities for problem solving and re-inforcement (Insert 3). Education was also generally viewed as teacher directed, linear, sequential activities, starting at the provisioning of the learning material, followed by the class meeting and ending at assessment (Insert 4). Transfer of information was primarily through the spoken and the written word. However, the teaching and learning scene has changed completely.
- **The modern view about education**

According to modern theories and practices, education is provided in a learning environment that does not function linearly. Teaching and learning is not a linear activity, but is rather a self-guided tour at the hand of a road map, eg a study guide, and a compass, namely the support provided by educators to the learners. Three main elements in the design of relevant learning activities are the learning sources, the
learning tasks and the support mechanisms. Learners do not only interact with the educator but the interaction is multi-dimensional and with several sources, such as the educator, peer groups, experts and different types of expert information (Insert 5).

Insert 5
The modern teaching and learning environment (Monteith & Dreyer, 2005)

- **Modern education and communication**
  According to Rossouw (2006), the developments in the history of mankind can also be illustrated by the history of communication. Communication developed from an era where only the logosphere was used, to the second era during which the logosphere and the graphosphere were used up until the present era characterised by the use of the logosphere, the graphosphere and the video sphere (Insert 5).
  One of the primary prerequisites for effective teaching and learning is quality communication. The quality of communication used for the transfer of (new) information will co-determine the success of modern education. Therefore, it is of paramount importance to use and integrate the modern types of communication in order to realise the mod-
ern way of effective History Education.

Insert 6
Eras in communication (Rossouw, 2004)

The digital Book Disk (DBD) for information transfer in History Education

- **Introduction**
The integration of the three types of communication, namely the spoken word, the written word and the virtual hypermedia, is generally called e-communication. The computer, the Internet and e-books are presently accepted as the primary media for e-communication. However, the computer infrastructure required for the use of e-communication is expensive, fragile, susceptible to infection by viruses and the computer programmes used are constantly changing. These obstacles are the reason why a discussant from the Chicago University, USA, stated at the Conference of the Book (Oxford, September 2005) that the e-book will not be generally accepted until the ‘paper-back version’ of the e-book has been developed.

- **Features of the DBD**
Due to the fact that television and the DVD may be regarded as common property in the world as well as in South Africa, even in the squatter camps where electricity, television and DVD-players are commonly
available (Insert 7), it was decided to use the DVD-basis for the DBD and not the CD with computer programmes as basis. Because the underlying programming of DVD does not change often, the DBD can be shelved for longer periods than a CD, the use of which is limited due to ever-changing computer programmes. In addition, the DVD-basis is not susceptible to computer viruses. The DBD can be read by means of any DVD-player on any television. However, the use of portable DVD-players is preferred (Insert 8). Therefore, the DBD may perhaps be seen as the paper-back version of the e-book.

The structuring of the information on the DBD was primary determined through the iterative application of analysis and synthesis. These provide a mechanism to isolate particular features of the backbone of the DBD as well as the different types of inserts and correct identified contextual, format and technical problems. The combination of the different parts of the DBD into a user-friendly unit could also constantly been addressed. By using induction and deduction throughout the process to evaluate the individual DBD’s, as tested in individual projects, against the generic features, as becoming clear in the combination of all the projects, constant development could take place. Therefore, the format of the DBD consists of the text enriched with different types of inserts (Insert 9). The text is used as backbone of the DBD because it enables the readers to, at their own time, scroll through the DBD while the inserts provides for the enriched information.
The use of the DBD (digital book disk) for effective teaching in History

Insert 7
Photo of squatter camps with electricity

Insert 8
Photo of portable DVD-player
The text
The DBD is text-based, which implies that the text forms the back-bone of the DBD. The text on e-material should be different than on paper; it should be short and focus on the core of what one wishes to transfer. Moreover, one does not explain or argue in the text as one would do on paper. Explanations, arguments and enrichment of the text are provided by means of the different inserts. The page length on a DBD is short and paragraphs should preferably not run over to the next page. Therefore, one has to write paragraphs consisting of no more than 140 words. The individual inserts can be one of the following: Text, photos, animation, graphs, tables, power points and videos.

The inserts
Different types of insert may be used to further illustrate, demonstrate, explain and enrich the (back-bone) text. The inserts are also particular the place to use the logo- and the videospheres. The following are typical examples of inserts:

Text inserts
Seeing that the text, as backbone of the DBD, should be concise and one-dimensional, further explanations may be provided in text format (Insert 10).
Insert 10
Text inserts

Text inserts should however also, as in the case of the backbone/central text, not be of an elaborate nature, because people reads differently on the electronic media. Large sections of text should be provided on paper, because that is the advantage of paper-based text. Readers read large pieces of text easier on a paper-based medium.

- **Photo inserts**
The saying goes: ‘A photo speaks a thousand words.’ Photos may be used for various purposes, for example to explain and illustrate the structure of an unknown building in a foreign country or to elucidate the characteristics of a rare painting (Insert 11).

Insert 11
Photo of unique building
Animation inserts
The animation inserts are very powerful tools to illustrate and explain the functioning of real life objects. The animations are also a direct integration of the logo- en videospheres.

Video inserts
The video inserts also serve as powerful tools to illustrate, explain or provide readers with more information on an unknown object or particular real life situation. Another advantage of videos is that they can be rewound by the viewers to have another look. Congruent to the viewing patterns of modern TV viewers, it was clear that the video clips should not be too long and should relate to the intended viewer market. The video inserts can be broadly divided into two types, namely the teaching video and the information video.

The teaching video refers to specific videos manufactured to assist learners in reaching the learning outcomes. The teaching videos may be presented in the format of single conversations, dual conversations or multi-conversations. The single conversation is usually used when the teacher or lecturer teaches. In this case, he/she may
use the power point or document camera during the presentation, similarly to what he/she would have done during a class presentation. The dual conversation can be used in a situation where the teacher explains a particular topic to a learner, whereas the multi-conversation can be used in a situation where more than two experts for example discuss a particular issue.

- The information video refers to ‘general’ videos obtained from, for example, a television news programme, or specific manufactured videos. These videos usually explain or illustrate real life situations or objects. The real advantage of these videos is that one is able to effectively link learning material with real life applications.

**Important**

It is important to remember that the different types of inserts serve a particular aim, namely to add extra information and to enrich the learning material of the learners. Therefore, the inserts should be chosen wisely in order to form part of the back-bone text of the DBD and in order for each insert to effectively fulfil its particular role.

**Pre-request regarding the compositioning of the DBD**

As a result of the completed and current research regarding the application of the DBD in teaching (cf. Golightly, 2006; De Souza, Richter & Nel, 2006; Van der Westhuizen & Richter, 2005 & 2006; Potgieter; Steyn; Roeloff se; Basson; Steyn & Nel, 2006) as well as of the development of the DBD, the following prerequisites for the composition of the DBD are evident:

- The contents of the text as well as the inserts should clearly relate to the level of development and particular interests of the target group.
- Text, as well as inserts, should be concise in terms of length and contents and should focus on the aim of the DBD. For example, a video insert should not be longer than five minutes. If a longer video insert is required, it is better to divide it into smaller clips and link it to different parts of closely related text.
The technology should be user friendly and should operate without hitches.

The outlay of the DBD should relate to the needs and general preferences of the target group. Learners in the Foundation Phase, for example, prefer a different kind of letter font, background colour and page layout and also appreciate a distinct kind of humour in the videos.

Real life inserts seem to be preferred and have more effect (similar to reality TV) than, for example, videos that are formally video-taped in a studio. However, the aim of the DBD will determine the types of insert.

It is important to vary the types of insert used in a particular DBD.

The DBD and meaningful learning

It must be remembered that the DBD is an e-book, and not a computer document. Therefore, the DBD is not interactive in the same way a computer programme is interactive. The DBD also does not replace the paper-based book (Insert 12), but fills a unique niche, namely to provide a concise and enriched transfer of information by means of a single basis (the DVD-disc). Particularly relevant to teaching, the DBD also provides guidance to learners regarding their responsibility to learn the particular contents in order to acquire the relevant competences.

Insert 12
Paper-based text (Steyn & Dreyer, 2005)
The need to read will always remain and will be determined by the needs of the readers. The following are examples of such paper-based material:

- Long argued reports: It is easier to read long text on paper and presently it is more user friendly to scan this paper-based material than on e-format.
- Short executive reports: Because of the cost and accessibility factors, it is easier to print and access a short report on paper than putting it on the electronic media.
Flyers and advertisements: Flyers and advertisements on paper will be more effective, for example, amongst a crowd at a fair. On the other hand, a traveller will prefer an SMS-message to locate a B&B in a foreign city.

The research results currently available on the effectiveness of the DBD regarding meaningful learning clearly supported the relevant literature on the influence of multimedia on meaningful learning (cf. Mayer, 2001). The research indicates that the DBD, as multimedia source, increases the quality of verbal and visual information transfer and promotes the retention of the information (Insert 13).

The use of the DBD clearly supports the principles of the constructivist theory on learning. This may be summarised as follows (cf. Schunk, 1996: 208; Ram, 1996: 89; Ertmer and Newby, 1996: 1-24):

- The DBD supports the individual learners in developing their own concepts based on their prior knowledge as well as new information.
- The learners can better manage their own learning because of the availability of rich information as well as the guidance provided on the DBD by the educator.
- The autonomy of the learners is developed because they can scroll through the DBD and read/view as they wish.
- The use of the DBD supports the usage of alternative sources of information.
- The learning content is more relevant to real life situations than information on paper-based learning material due to the fact that video clips may, for instance, be used.
The pre-requisites as result of the said research, relates to the following design principles in the literature (cf. Mayer, 2001: 186, 191; Mayer & Moreno, 2003:44; Weinstein & Meyer, 1994: 16) and can be summarized as follows:

- Better transfer occurs when learners receive verbal and visual information.
- Related verbal and visual information should be closely linked.
- The core (cause-and-effect explanation) information should be used without extraneous verbal or visual information.
- The different types of information should be integrated (in such a manner that it addresses the visual as well as auditory channels of the human information-processing system).
- The integrated verbal and visual information should be easy to store and to revisited.

**Conclusion**

History teaching should be alive in order to support the value of History Education. Therefore, it is of importance that the information transfer includes all the types of present day communication, namely the inclusion of the logosphere, the graphosphere and the videosphere. The DBD fills this role and should be used to enrich History Education and at the same time supports meaningful education.

**References**


POTGIETER, FJ; STEYN, PJ du P; ROELOFFSE, J; BASSON, R; STEYN, N & Nel, J. 2006. Factors affecting a primary school teachers’ acceptance, use and integration of ICT in the Natural and Social Sciences classroom. NWU, Potchefstroom.


VAN DER WESTHUIZEN, C & RICHTER, BW. 2004. “Challenges in Secondary Education Training that need to be met by South Africa in an ICT dominated world”, International Geography Union (IGU)

VAN DER WESTHUIZEN, C & RICHTER, BW. 2005 “DVD Supportive Training for Geography Teacher Students as an interim for ICT in developing countries”, EIS-TA’05, July 14-17 2005, Orlando, Florida, USA.


AN EDUCATIONAL TOUR OF THE HECTOR PIETERSON MUSEUM* FOR HIGH SCHOOLS DEVELOPED BY LEARNERS AND TEACHERS USING OBE PRINCIPLES

Michaela Carr & Heather Barclay
Roedean School, Park Town

Abstract

As South African history is being rewritten, contested and reveled, so museums are being opened, revamped and developed. The classroom must follow suit. This paper documents the integration of the Hector Pieterson Memorial and Museum in Soweto and the teaching of History using OBE principles of the RNCS. The project was developed as a practical solution to a frustration experienced by both the Museum and visiting school groups. In the first instance, it provided the opportunity for grade 10 learners from Roedean School to practise investigative and analytical skills and to extend their historical knowledge and critical thinking skills. Secondly, the tools created, namely a teacher’s newsletter, detailing the museum tour; a publicity pamphlet for the museum’s scholastic groups, and a tour booklet specifically designed for learners, were created. Thirdly, the project was learner-centered and activity based, with a practical application to the working world: the learners had to work with a variety of professionals other than their teachers and make their products educationally viable.

Introduction

The Hector Pieterson Museum newsletter provides teachers with information about the Learning Outcomes and suggests pre and post-tour activities. The pamphlet provides practical information regarding opening times and directions to the Museum. The tour booklet acts as reinforcement and extension of the Curriculum 2005 syllabus for Human and Social Sciences for Grade 9 History: Apartheid in South Africa. A dedicated web page was also developed by the learners for consideration.

* The spelling of Pieterson/Peterson varies from publication to publication
by the Museum. The project was also intended as a Community Development initiative, aiming to instill the Developmental Outcomes enabling learners to “participate as responsible citizens in the life of the local community”. The concept of these types of partnerships needs to be brought to the attention of schools nationwide. All are invited to utilize this project as a model to develop other initiatives. Certain museum outings can be a “hit or miss” affair. Teachers dream of the “hit” and dread the “miss”. A museum outing should result in a memorable and educationally valuable day.

Constraints and perceptions

At a Human and Social Sciences conference early in 2005, Ali Khangela Hlongwane, Chief Curator of the Hector Pieterson Museum, lamented the fact that too often the museum experienced a “go see” attitude by schools. Most of the time, he said, teachers brought large groups or learners of all age groups to the venue, and without prior notice. The already understaffed museum guides had to do their utmost to accommodate everyone. Furthermore, he said, teachers and learners lacked direction in viewing the exhibits and their aim seemed to entail a quick walk through the building to then head for a more “entertaining” venue like Gold Reef City. More crucially, he added, not all museum staff were educators, nor were they not always aware of the demands of the Curriculum.

The Museum - School Project launched

The Curator’s comments inspired a joint project between The Hector Pieterson Museum and Roedean School. A plan was submitted to the School Principal and the Museum Curator. It contained the aim of the project, its time frame and other practicalities: small groups of learners to work on four specific themes: History, Memory, Architecture and Bias.

It was agreed to allow Grade 10 learners to really drive the process under the guidance of their teachers and the Museum personnel. The project would be learner-centered and activity based, with a practical application to the working world. Furthermore, it would form part of the School’s Community Development Program. It would aim specifically to instill the Developmental Outcome enabling learners to “participate as responsible citizens in the life of the local community”, and the Learning Outcomes
and Critical Outcomes would focus on the Curriculum 2005 syllabus of
Human and Social Sciences for grade 9 History: Apartheid in South Africa.

The process started by inviting all the grade 10 learners to an introductory
talk. The outcomes, the proposed themes, working methods and time
frame for the project were put forward. Four days were to be set aside in
the holidays for work on site and a series of afternoons were to be made
available during term to complete the project.

If parental approval was given, volunteers had to motivate their interest.
Thereafter, participants had to sign a contract binding them to the
project.

Twenty eight girls signed up. They divided themselves into five groups
and brainstormed ideas regarding their theme of choice. They attended
a series of talks: their art teacher provided input on graphics and
pamphlet presentation; the Curator, his Education Officer and guides
provided input on the needs and focus of the Museum; the architect who
designed the building provided information regarding its conception
and intention. The girls watched videos on “The History of Soweto”
and “Where is Mbuyswa?” to gain more knowledge on the history they
were investigating. At the Museum, they were given a tour by Hector
Pieterson’s sister, Antoinette Sithole, who also provided her first hand
accounts of the events of June 16 1976. Antoinette also accompanied the
girls and teachers on the same route she and fellow students had taken
from the schools which had participated in the march.

Thereafter, learners, teachers and museum personnel spent three days
at the Museum in the school holidays working on the tour material.

The tour criteria were clearly specified:

- material had to be suitable for grade 9 to grade 12 learners.
- the entire tour was to be no longer than two hours, including
twenty minutes for reflection and feedback.
- each theme had to include the following:
  - a skill: observation, investigation, critical thinking which could
    occur by means of an activity.
  - knowledge: as a skill in this case, Apartheid in South Africa.
Methodology

- a value: focus to build citizenship and foster empathy.
- the themes’ contents had to be presented within a maximum of five points.
- a photograph was essential for each exhibit.

The fourth day was spent at Roedean School putting the tour content, layout and photographs into a cohesive package on computer. Wording and images were debated by all. Thereafter, the tour was submitted to the Museum for comment, together with quotes for its final production by graphic design companies. The most telling criticism by the Curator was the absolute need to avoid any political slant in the word choice of the texts. The adults worked shopped the final copy for submission to the printers.

The fifth group of girls produced a dedicated web page for educational school tours. (It is not operational as yet as the Museum is in charge of editing it to its requirements.) They also compiled the teacher brochure. Their aim was to publicize the Museum and to facilitate teacher co-ordination with the RNCS and to develop a “museum-going culture” in schools.

At the launch of the products, the tour was tested on learners from a variety of schools.

10 000 copies of each product were printed. A few months later, The Museum requested the booklet be translated into Afrikaans, IsiZulu and Sesotho by the Roedean staff. This has been done.

The result of the exercise was an affirmation that OBE really did work, if carefully planned with an applicable focus in mind. Not only did the girls develop various academic and interpersonal skills, but their teachers for whom group teaching is not the norm, grew through the process as well.

The concept of these types of partnerships needs to be brought to the attention of schools nationwide. All are invited to utilize this project as a model or as an inspiration to develop other initiatives.
AN ANALYSIS OF GRADE 10 HISTORY ASSESSMENT TASKS

Carol Bertram
University of KwaZulu Natal

Abstract

This paper examines the nature and scope of the assessment tasks that three Grade 10 history classes were required to complete in 2005. Data were collected from three different secondary schools located in different socio-economic areas in KwaZulu Natal. Three tests from each school are analysed using Bloom’s revised taxonomy in terms of knowledge dimension and cognitive process. The findings show that the assessment tasks across the schools differ substantially in both the level and the range of cognitive demand required of learners. While the study cannot make strong claims about causal explanations for the differences, the data do support an explanation of curriculum continuity in the historically advantaged sector in that previously white and Indian schools have been using evidence and source-based teaching and assessment for a number of years.

Introduction

This paper reports on a small part of a larger PhD study which aims to trace the recontextualising of the history curriculum through the levels of the pedagogic device (Bernstein, 1996). The wider context is that of a new curriculum being introduced in 2006 in Grade 10 of the Further Education and Training (FET) band. I have collected data from the various levels of the pedagogic device, such as interviews with the writers of the FET history curriculum, an analysis of the history curriculum document, interviews with Grade 10 textbook writers, participant observation of the four-day KZN provincial training workshop for teachers, observation of history lessons in three case study schools, interviews with the three history teachers in these schools, group interviews with learners and the collection of learners’ assessment tasks. School-based data were collected in 2005 and in 2006.
The focus of this paper is an analysis of the learners’ assessment tasks. The paper first describes the present curriculum and assessment policy position in the subject of history, outlines the use of the Revised Bloom’s taxonomy as a tool of analysis and then presents the findings of this analysis.

**Assessing history in South Africa**

The overwhelming focus of the teaching and learning of history in South Africa has traditionally been on understanding history as a body of information to be learned. Since the early-1980s, there has been a shift in some education departments (notably the Natal Education Department and Department of Education and Culture: House of Delegates) to understanding history rather as a process of finding out about the past (Sieborger, Kallaway, Bottaro, & Hiscock, 1993; van den Berg & Buckland, 1983). This notable shift was informed by the Schools Council History Project in England which pioneered this ‘new’ approach to history learning in the mid-1970s. It was argued that students need to be able to study the past as historians did, using primary and secondary sources, examining evidence, being able to empathise with people from past times and attempting their own explanations (Schools Council History 13 -16 Project, 1976). The focus is on understanding history as interpretation, as a construction, rather than simply as indisputable facts.

This approach to history learning is clearly reflected in the new National Curriculum Statement for History (Grade 10 -12), (Department of Education, 2003).

Learners who study history use the insights and skills of historians. They analyse sources and evidence and study different interpretations, divergent opinions and voices. By doing so they are taught to think in a rigorous and critical manner about society and

The first three Learning Outcomes reflect the process by which historians (and learners) investigate the past. They develop historical enquiry, conceptual understanding and knowledge con-
While the NCS for FET history strongly advocates the ‘history as enquiry’ approach, this approach is also mentioned in the Interim Core Syllabus (1996) which is the current (2006) syllabus for Grade 11 and 12. Under the Aims, the syllabus reads

Thus History, in addition to its content, is also a mode of enquiry, a way of investigating the past which requires the acquisition and use of skills. (my italics)

This approach to learning history requires that assessment must change so that students are not only tested on the factual information that they can remember. They also need to be assessed on whether they can read source material critically, how they use evidence that is presented to them and whether they understand historical procedures and concepts (Sieborger et al., 1993). Since 2003, the Senior Certificate examination has been ‘more attuned to the new interpretive syllabus goals’ and has ‘made a move towards more skills-based questions in the source-based section of the paper’ (Umalusi, 2004). This is significant as assessment is the key indicator of whether curriculum change is actually taking place.

The study

The key question for this study is “what are the nature and the cognitive demand of assessment tasks completed by Grade 10 history learners?” Data were collected in three secondary schools in the third term of 2005. The schools represent a purposive sample of three co-educational high schools in KwaZulu-Natal. The purpose was to select three schools that represented a range of schools in terms of their previous administration and the socio-economic status of the learners, using school fees as a proxy measurement of this. Each school represents a case study, and although may be typical of other similar schools, essentially can only represent themselves. Five consecutive Grade 10 history lessons in each school were observed, the teachers interviewed, some learners interviewed, and all the assessment tasks collected that learners had completed up to that point in the year.
Grade 10 was chosen as this is the grade in which the new curriculum was to be implemented in 2006. This study focuses only on the assessment tasks that were collected. These assessment tasks were collected in 2005, the year before the new FET curriculum was implemented. Thus they cannot be evaluated using the criteria established by the new curriculum, but do give us some insight into how these teachers might make the transition to the demands of the new curriculum.

Schools and their history teachers

Enthabeni High School was previously administered by the Department of Education and Training. The school is located in a rural area, about 20kms from the nearest town. The staff and learners are all black African. The fees are R150 per annum. There are 821 learners registered in 2005. No teachers are funded by the School Governing Body. The only person employed by the SGB is the security guard. The matric pass rate was 86% in 2003 and 88% in 2004. The majority of learners lives in the area and walk to school. According to the principal, only 10% of the parents are working. He estimates that more than half of the learners stay with their grandmothers.

Mr Mkhize worked as a private, unqualified teacher for three years before he went to university. He studied for a BA, taking sociology and history as a minor subject. On completing his BA, he did a Higher Diploma in Education. He trained to teach Tourism, Geography and Zulu. He also has an Honours degree in Human Resource Management and is considering furthering his qualifications in education. Before starting at Enthabeni, he had taught at rural schools in Northern Zululand for 4 years, teaching History and Life Orientation. He started teaching at Enthabeni at the beginning of 2005, thus has been there only 10 months at the time of my observation.

Lincoln High was previously administered by House of Assembly and is located in a middle class, mostly white suburb. The staff is still mostly white, although the student body is racially diverse. The school is highly sought after by parents. The matric pass rate has been 100% for a number of years. The fees are R 7000 per annum. The school has 1200 learners with a total staff complement of 48 teachers. Of these, 12 are paid
Mrs Lawrence has been teaching at Lincoln for 18 years, first as an English teacher and then as a History teacher. She has a BA and an HDE, but trained to be an English teacher rather than a history teacher. She did one year of History in her BA. For many years she had an equal load of English and History, but now only teaches History to Grade 9, 10 and 12. She is the History HoD, and the head of Grade 12.

North Hill High was previously administered by the House of Delegates. The majority of the staff is Indian, but the learner body is now approximately 80% black African and 20% Indian. The matric pass rate has been between 98% and 100% over the past three years.

The fees are R 700 per annum. The school has 1125 learners and a total of 39 teachers, of whom seven have salaries paid by the School Governing Body. According to the principal, amongst parents there are few professionals (except most of the Eastern Cape children have parents who are teachers), many are unemployed and most would be working in shoe factories, as supermarket workers etc.

Mrs Naidoo has been teaching at North Hill for four years and previously taught at a senior primary school for 4 years. She trained to be a senior primary school teacher through a distance education institution. She also did a Further Education Diploma in Management and is currently studying for a B.Ed. Hons part time. She did not study history in her diploma, nor did she take it as a matric subject. She started by teaching Human and Social Sciences at North Hill and then moved onto to teach Grade 10 history, which she has taught for three years.

**Analysing the assessment tasks**

The assessment tasks are firstly described in terms of their scope, and then three tests from each school are analysed using the categories generated by the revised Bloom’s taxonomy. In South Africa there is somewhat of a revival of using Bloom, spearheaded by the quality assurance body, Umalusi. The revised version of Bloom’s original (1956) taxonomy, developed by Anderson et al. (2001) provides a useful analytical tool to
identify the forms of knowledge and cognitive demand of the assessment tasks which learners have been required to complete. The major change from Bloom’s original taxonomy has been to separate the knowledge dimension from the cognitive process dimension. The knowledge dimension consists of four levels: factual knowledge, conceptual knowledge, procedural knowledge and metacognitive knowledge. Likewise the cognitive process dimension also consists of several levels, each level representing more demanding and complex cognitive processes. These two dimensions intersect to form a grid for categorizing learner assessment tasks (see Table below):

**Table 1: Scope of the Grade 10 History assessment tasks**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Essays</th>
<th>Tests</th>
<th>Source-based tasks</th>
<th>Investigative reports</th>
<th>Empathy</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Enthabeni</td>
<td>5 (but only one on a history topic)</td>
<td>3 (short answers, True/False)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Jan to Oct 2005)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Hill</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5 (short answers, source-based, definitions, empathy)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Jan to Sept 2005)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lincoln</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5 (multiple choice, source-based questions and empathy)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Jan – Aug 2005)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Like the original taxonomy, the revised taxonomy is assumed to have a hierarchical nature, in that a more advanced level subsumes the levels below. For example, it can be assumed that a person operating at the application level has mastered the cognitive demands required for working at the knowledge and comprehension level.

The main levels in the knowledge dimension are:

- Factual knowledge – The basic elements, terminology and details that students must know to be acquainted with a discipline or solve problems in it.
Conceptual knowledge – Knowing the interrelationships among the basic elements within a larger structure that enable them to function together. Knowledge of classifications and categories, principles and generalizations and theories, models and structures.

Procedural knowledge – How to do something, methods of enquiry, and criteria for using skills, algorithms, techniques, and methods.

Metacognitive knowledge – Knowledge of cognition in general as well as awareness and knowledge of one’s own cognition (Anderson, 2005)

The main levels in the cognitive process dimension are:

- Remember – Retrieving relevant knowledge from long-term memory. Sub-levels include recognizing and recalling.
- Understand – Determining the meaning of instructional messages, including oral, written and graphic communication. Sub-levels include interpreting, exemplifying, classifying, summarizing, inferring, comparing and explaining.
- Apply – Carrying out or using a procedure in a given situation. Executing and implementing are sub-levels.
- Analyze – Breaking material into its constituent parts and detecting how the parts relate to one another and to an overall structure or purpose. Sub-levels are differentiating, organizing and attributing.
- Evaluate – making judgements based on criteria and standards. Sub-levels are checking and critiquing.
- Create – Putting elements together to form a novel, coherent whole or making an original product. Sub-levels are generating, planning and producing.

The scope of the assessment tasks

Learners’ tasks were collected from Lincoln in August 2005, from North Hill in September 2005 and Enthabeni in October 2005. North Hill and Lincoln learners had written more assessment tasks than the learners at Enthabeni, despite the fact that the assessment tasks were collected from Enthabeni a month or two later than from the other schools.

The type of assessment and the number of assessment tasks that the
learners had done was very different in the three schools. At Enthabeni, the learners had written 3 tests, 2 short homework tasks and written 5 essays. However, only one of these essays was on the history syllabus (the French Revolution). The other four were on general current affairs issues, for example “Discuss how South Africa’s holding of the Soccer World Cup in 2010 will benefit South Africa” or “Briefly discuss the clash/dispute among ANC members based on the dismissal of Jacob Zuma, fair or unfair.” The learners had not been exposed to any empathy or source-based questions.

At North Hill, learners had written 5 tests and these did include source-based questions and empathy-type questions. They had written 3 essays and 4 short homework tasks. These were either definitions of terms or source-based questions.

Lincoln learners had been assessed through the widest range of tasks. They had written a 10 page investigative report entitled “Who killed Jack the Ripper?”, 3 essays, 5 tests (which included source-based questions and empathy questions) and 3 short homework tasks which required writing in a different kind of genre (for example, write a letter as soldier who has deserted Napoleon’s Russian Campaign, or write a newspaper article about the death of Louis XVI).

Analysis of the assessment tasks

Three tests from each of the three schools were analysed using Bloom’s Revised taxonomy to establish the cognitive demand and the knowledge level of each of the questions in the test. The tests comprised on average 10 questions and were out of 25 to 50 marks. Each question was coded using the taxonomy grid (see Table 2 below).
### Table 2: Comparison of tests written at Enthabeni, Lincoln and North Hill, 2005

#### The cognitive process dimension

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>A. Factual knowledge</strong></td>
<td>(E) French Revolution 100%</td>
<td>(L) Jack the Ripper (28%)</td>
<td>(L) Napoleon (2%)</td>
<td>(L) Napoleon (4%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(E) Treaty of Aliwal North 100%</td>
<td>(L) French Revolution (14%)</td>
<td>(L) French Revolution (12%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(E) Industrial Revolution 100%</td>
<td>(L) Napoleon (10%)</td>
<td>(L) French Revolution (10%)</td>
<td>(L) French Revolution (20%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(L) Jack the Ripper (28%)</td>
<td>(N) Apartheid (66%)</td>
<td>(N) Congress of Vienna (100%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(L) French Revolution (26%)</td>
<td>(N) French Revolution (83%)</td>
<td>(N) French Revolution (83%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>B. Conceptual knowledge</strong></td>
<td>(L) French Revolution (14%)</td>
<td>(L) Napoleon (10%)</td>
<td>(L) French Revolution (10%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(L) Napoleon (10%)</td>
<td>(N) French Revolution (10%)</td>
<td>(L) French Revolution (20%)</td>
<td>(L) French Revolution (30%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(N) Apartheid (16%)</td>
<td>(N) Congress of Vienna (100%)</td>
<td>(N) French Revolution (26%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(N) Congress of Vienna (100%)</td>
<td>(N) French Revolution (83%)</td>
<td>(N) French Revolution (83%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Yesterdays & Today No 1, May 2007*
The percentages in the table show the percentage of marks in a test that fell into a particular category. For example, for the French Revolution test at Enthabeni, 100% of the marks fell into the Remember Factual Knowledge category, whereas as Lincoln, 28% of the marks of the French Revolution test fell into that category.

### Examples of coding

Questions that required learners to give definitions and multiple choice questions were coded as Remember Factual Knowledge.

Examples of how other questions were coded are given below.

**Example 1**

Learners were given a cartoon of dark-skinned child on a ‘Europeans Only’ beach pulling down his costume to show a policeman that he is in fact a white child. The question is:

*Explain the message being sent out by the baby in Source B. (4)*

(North Hill test on Apartheid)

This question was coded as Understand Factual Knowledge, since it seemed that learners were required to use their knowledge about Separate Amenities legislation (factual knowledge) and explain or make sense of the cartoon in the light of that knowledge.

**Example 2**

Learners are given an extract from a contemporary newspaper account of the Storming of the Bastille. The question is

*Is the source biased in favour of or against the Revolution? Quote from the source to substantiate your answer. (4)*

(Lincoln test on The French Revolution).
This question was coded as *Evaluate Procedural Knowledge*, since it seemed that learners were required to make a judgment about the source, and to do so need to draw on their knowledge of the procedure of evaluating historical sources.

**Example 3**

*Imagine you were living in the Apartheid Days. Write a diary entry on how you feel about the natives Resettlement Act of 1954.* (5) (North Hill test on Apartheid)

**Cognitive demand of the assessment tasks**

It can be seen in Table 2 that at Enthabeni all the questions (100% of the marks) in each test focus on remembering factual knowledge. The tests at North Hill have a slightly greater spread across the cognitive processes. However, in two of the tests (Congress of Vienna and French Revolution), at least 90% of the marks were allocated to questions that required that learners remember factual knowledge.

Lincoln had the greatest spread of marks across both the cognitive process and the knowledge dimension. This was the only school where procedural knowledge was tested, in questions that required learners to analyse or evaluate the source material.

**Use of source based questions**

The new FET curriculum requires that learners learn to think like historians and analyse source material in critical ways. The Interim Core Syllabus (which was in use in Grade 10 in 2005) also suggests that history is a mode of enquiry. Enthabeni learners were not exposed to any source work at all. Although the North Hill teacher did make use of a number of sources, the questions that were asked on the sources were generally comprehension-type questions, or were questions that did not in fact refer to the source at all. The source appeared to be there simply as a prompt, or simply because it is a source. So on the surface, it takes on the form of ‘progressive’ history teaching, however the substance is not there. Siebörger et al (1993) make a similar point in their analysis of
National Senior Certificate exam papers in 1989, where a poorly constructed source-question consists of a graph which seems to serve a decorative, rather than information-giving purpose. Saxe et al (1999) refer to a similar finding in examining mathematics teachers’ assessment practices in the context of educational reform. Some teachers were able to grasp the new *form* that was required, not the *function*. So here too, the assessment task takes on the form of a source-based question, but in fact is merely a prompt for recall-type, or comprehension questions. An example at North Hill is a picture of the leaders meeting at the Congress of Vienna, which is labeled Source A. However, none of the questions—which follow actually require the learners to engage with the source at all.

All of the questions simply require learners to recall factual information. The picture appears to serve a decorative purpose only. The questions are:

- Why did the great powers meet in Vienna?
- Name the great powers and the countries from which they came.
- List three principles followed by the Congress.

In a second example from a North Hill test, learners are given a picture of a ‘dompas’ and are asked to name any five pieces of information that was contained in it. In this example, learners are in fact engaging with the source, but at a very low cognitive level. They are simply reading off information such as “name and surname”, ‘race’, ‘language’ etc. Learners are not required to engage in any kind of analysis of the source. So although the question has the appearance of being source-based, it requires learners to simply retrieve information.

The source-based questions at Lincoln were different in that some of the questions required learners to actually engage with the source as an *historical document*. For example, learners are given the evidence of a woman which was given at the inquest of Annie Chapman, a victim of “Jack the Ripper” and have to answer the following question *‘How reliable do you find this source as evidence in identifying the main suspect?’*

Questions that required learners to write an empathy response were coded as *Create Conceptual Knowledge* (B6). Learners are required to create a letter or newspaper article or diary entry that draws on their
knowledge of the links and relationships between their historical knowledge.

*Explain your response in a paragraph 4-5 lines long.* In another test, learners are given an extract from a contemporary newspaper article about the storming of the Bastille. One of the questions asks them to establish whether the source is biased in favour or against the Revolution. Lincoln is the only school where source-based material is used in a way that requires learners to analyse and evaluate source evidence. North Hill shows the appearance but not the substance of the ‘history as enquiry’ approach and Enthabeni is still firmly located in the ‘history as fact’ approach.

**Discussion**

As already mentioned, these tasks were collected in 2005, before the assessment demands for the new FET curriculum were in place. Thus I will not evaluate them using criteria established by the new curriculum. What the analysis does show is which of these schools will find it easiest to meet the challenges of the new curriculum. Lincoln is essentially already meeting, and probably surpassing, the assessment requirements of the new curriculum. The assessment tasks at North Hill show the appearance, but less of the substance of the evidence-based learning that characterizes the new curriculum. And Enthabeni is simply nowhere close. Even setting aside the fact that Enthabeni learners had not been exposed to any source-based material or empathy questions, the questions that they were required to answer were all simply recall questions based on factual knowledge.

The obvious question is: why are there such stark differences in these three History classrooms? Is it the school context, the resources, the learners or is it the qualifications, experience and competence of the individual teachers? The data do not allow this kind of causal analysis. However, it is easy to understand these differences in terms of the legacy of inequality in South African schools. Much has been written about the continuing inequalities in the broader school system regarding issues like integration (Soudien, 2004) and school fees (Fiske & Ladd, 2004). There are also recent studies which show how these inequalities
are reinforced through pedagogy and knowledge at the micro-level in the classroom (Green & Naidoo, 2006; Hoadley, 2005).

In terms of history in particular, it is interesting that it was noted already in 1993 by Siebörger et al., that in the Natal Education Senior Certificate examination paper of 1988 about “a quarter of the marks is allocated to assessing historical skills related to the use of the sources, and there is a pleasing sense of debate in some of the questions” (1993: 218). This is almost 20 years before the implementation of the National Curriculum Statement. The Joint Matriculation Board, the NED and the House of Delegates are singled out as examiners who are assessing the new approach to history successfully both by Siebörger et al. (Sieborger et al., 1993) and the Umalusi report a decade later (Umalusi, 2004). Thus, both North Hill and Lincoln have a history and a ‘head start’ in understanding and implementing the ‘new’ approach.

Harley and Wedekind (2004) suggest that the new curriculum represents curriculum continuity in the historically advantaged sector. They show that the new curriculum looks remarkably like the curriculum advocated by the Natal Education Department in the 1980s. The data presented in this study show the same trend and point to these historical continuities. In his evaluation of OBE implementation in Grade 1 classrooms, Jansen (1999) alludes to the fact that the implementation (and non-implementation) strategies employed by teachers reflect back the inequalities across the post-apartheid education system.

Another question raised by the study is to what extent the nature of the learners impacts on the cognitive level of engagement. Do the North Hill and Enthabeni teachers simply not ask higher level questions because they know that their learners would struggle to answer these kinds of questions? The Lincoln learners are middle-class, bringing with them a particular kind of cultural capital (Bourdieu, 1986) that is valued by the curriculum, and the majority have English as their mother tongue. At Enthabeni particularly, learning history in English is a major stumbling block, with learners reporting that a good history teacher is one that can explain concepts to them in Zulu so they can understand the concepts. These kinds of questions require further investigation and exploration.
Conclusion

This paper has described how the assessment tasks in three different secondary schools differ both in terms of their scope and the cognitive demand. While it is not possible to answer causal questions about exactly why these differences are present, the explanation of curriculum continuity seems plausible. Unless there is some type of intervention in the schools where current practice is far away from the ideals of the new curriculum, the current patterns of advantage and disadvantage will unfortunately simply continue. An analysis of assessment tasks set in 2006 will reveal to what extent these three schools are adjusting their assessment requirements to reflect the requirements of the new FET curriculum.

References


In the beginning.... Where to start in history teaching?

Rob Siebörger
University of Cape Town

This paper originates in two separate professional experiences I had last year. The first occurred while I was presenting workshops to curriculum advisers and teachers on the *Turning Points in History* series of booklets and CD. It was that, on more than one occasion, I was confronted by strident disagreement when I said that one had to begin with the content (“Content and contexts for the attainment of the Assessment Standards”), not the Learning Outcomes and Assessment Standards when planning to teach history. The second took place when I disagreed with the majority of the members of a committee about the way in which unit standard qualifications should be constructed in history. I maintained that when one studied history, the historical content had to be foregrounded, rather than the method, “skill” or purpose of studying the history.

In both cases I argued that planning that began with the outcomes and assessment standards/criteria was antithetical to history – that if one began with them one ended with something that was not history. As I explained in e-mails I wrote at the time, “it’s never the skills that make the history, it’s the history that is explored, developed etc. by means of skills”, and “[i]t does not work successfully to write content in the form of outcomes, and it does not work to make the outcomes on their own decide what the content should be” (Siebörger 2005a and b).

How did the problem arise?

A reconstruction of the curriculum history of history in England provides insights into how outcomes [referred to as Attainment Targets in England] and assessment standards [Levels in England] have been developed in history and into their relation to the content knowledge of history.
In 1971, at the height of the popularity of the objectives movement in curriculum development and lesson planning, Jeanette Coltham and John Fines wrote *Educational Objectives for the Study of History. A suggested framework*. Their definition of an objective very closely resembles present descriptions of learning outcomes, namely, that it describes “what a learner can do as a result of having learned; ... what an observer... can see the learner doing so that he can judge whether or not the objective has been successfully reached. And... indicates what educational experience he requires if he is to achieve the objective.” (1971: 3-4). They divided the objectives for history into four aspects: the motivational behaviours of learners (A), the acquisition of skills and abilities (B), the content of historical study (C), and the results, or satisfaction, gained as a result of studying history (D), and they showed in a diagram how these aspects related to each other (1971: 4-5). As noted by the Historical Association Curriculum Development Project, the important contribution made by Coltham and Fines was that they “laid out for the first time a full set of objectives against which pupils’ attainment in history might be assessed” (2005:14).

Developments soon after this moved in a direction that Coltham and Fines would not have foreseen. The Schools Council History Project, which was set up in 1972, produced a radically changed curriculum for history for 13-16 year olds. The curriculum endeavoured, first, to make history a useful and interesting subject for adolescents through the type of content selected, and, secondly, to improve the methods of teaching and assessing history through understanding the nature of history as a discipline and using what it called “historical skills” to develop abilities such as analysis, judgement and empathy. The skills they identified, based on Coltham and Fines’ (B), were: 1 Finding information; 2 Recalling information; 3 Understanding evidence; 4 Evaluating evidence; 5 Making inferences and hypotheses and 6 Synthesis (SCHP 1976: 41-42). While Coltham and Fines had shown how all the objectives for history (A, B, C, D) are related to each other, an unfortunate consequence of the popularity of the Schools Council approach to history (also referred to as “the new history”) was that “skills” came to be seen as opposed to “content”, and books were published on “skills” which had no content basis – as if history skills could be taught by themselves. This di-
chotomy between skills and content was entirely false, as the purpose of developing the skills was for assessment, and, “[a]t no point have those who advocate the assessment of historical skills denied or downplayed the importance of historical content” (Historical Association 2005:15).

The next significant event was the development of the National Curriculum in England in 1989. A History Working Group was given the task of recommending a framework for school history. They were required to “propose attainment targets [or outcomes] grouped within profile components and supported by programmes of study” (DES 1990:5). The particular difficulty they faced was how to satisfy the government of Margaret Thatcher that their curriculum framework emphasised the importance of acquiring a sound knowledge of British history and to ensure that this knowledge could be assessed. Simply put, the government wanted ‘the facts’ of history to be taught and assessed, while the Working Group believed that historical knowledge was much more complex than this, and included knowledge as ‘information’ (basic fact, dates, etc.), as ‘understanding’ (evidence about facts and how to explain it), and as ‘content’ (the subject matter, period or theme). The Working Group’s solution and final recommendation was as follows:

...we have concluded that the best, and indeed the only, practical way to ensure that historical knowledge as information is taught, learned and assessed, is by clearly spelling out the essential historical information in the programmes of study and assessing it through the attainment targets. The programmes of study carry the same statutory force as the attainment targets and teachers are required to teach the knowledge contained in them. The attainment targets measure pupils’ ability to demonstrate their acquisition of that knowledge expressed through their historical understanding and skills (DES 1990: 7-8).

So, the Working Group produced a curriculum comprising programmes of study that provided the details of the content in units (e.g. Victorian Britain; The Roman Empire, etc.), and four Attainment Targets, which were history skills (Understanding history in its setting; Understanding points of view and interpretations of history; Acquiring and evaluating historical information and Organising and communicating the results of historical study) (DES 1990:115). Since 1990, almost all countries that have introduced outcomes-based history curricula have followed this pattern, and
the RNCS for GET and NCS for FET history are designed in the same way.

The problem, thus, arises from a misunderstanding that history skills are more important than historical content knowledge itself. The purpose of outcomes and Assessment Standards in history is to ensure that the history is properly assessed, not to define what history is studied. I find no comfort at all in that I warned of this potential problem in March 1997, when I wrote (Siebörger 1997):

Within the present parameters of OBE one can no longer justify geography and history in terms of their specific skills or outcomes - they have become generic. We are forced now to say that the reason why they have unique, essential value is because of the content they convey.

**What happens when planning history lessons**

A lesson taught by Angeline Naidoo on slavery at the Cape to Grade 7, excerpts of which are included in Siebörger, Weldon and Dean (2005), serves as an example of planning in history.

In this case the teacher began by considering what would be appropriate for Grade 7s to learn about Cape slavery (part of the History Knowledge focus, Department of Education 2002: 60), given that a maximum of three hours of class time would be available. She next checked to see what resources she had at her disposal to teach the lessons. Then she had to decide how to introduce the topic, what to focus upon and how to conclude it. The following table illustrates these decisions:
Table 1: Content knowledge planning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appropriate content knowledge</th>
<th>Resources</th>
<th>Sequence of lessons</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• What it was like to be a slave</td>
<td>• Cape Town telephone directories</td>
<td>• Introduction: Names of slaves – what it was like not to have own name — telephone directories. 40 mins.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• How slaves were treated</td>
<td>• Picture of slave auction</td>
<td>• Experience of treatment — auction — study picture 40 mins, drama 40 mins.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Resistance by slaves</td>
<td>• Improvised drama of auction</td>
<td>• Example of resistance — Galant 60 mins.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>•</td>
<td>• Story of Galant (1825)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Having established what history the lessons would cover, the teacher turned to the Learning Outcomes and Assessment standards to provide guidance on methods of teaching the lessons and on how the history could be assessed. She reviewed the Grade 7 Assessment Standards to choose appropriate ones and then considered what assessment activities she could use, as illustrated in Table 2, below. (Note that the Learning Outcomes and Assessment Standards in history are designed to be used in conjunction with each other, and teachers need to combine Assessment Standards in assessment activities rather than use them individually.)

It is clear from this example that the choice of Assessment Standards and assessment activities is dependent on the content knowledge chosen by the teacher. The history taught, therefore, provides the context in which the Assessment Standards are employed. This is both a strength and a weakness. The strength is that, as the Learning Outcomes and Assessment Activities are derived from the nature of history as a discipline (as seen from Coltham and Fines and the SCHP above), as long as one teaches history systematically one will find many opportunities to do justice to all the Assessment Standards set for a grade. The weakness is that choosing which Assessment Standards and assessment activities to use is not necessarily an easy activity and requires insight and experience of a teacher. (This is why good textbooks are essential as models to help train teachers to see how they can make the best choices.)

Table 2: Assessment Standard planning
What would happen if one were to plan lessons beginning with the Assessment Standards instead of the content knowledge? At first glance, this would not seem to constitute a major problem, as the Learning Outcomes and Assessment Standards have been carefully constructed to convey the key processes involved in doing history. The NCS History Learning Programme Guidelines explain that

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Possible Grade 7 Assessment Standards for the lessons</th>
<th>Assessment Standards selected</th>
<th>Key questions</th>
<th>Assessment activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>LO 1 Historical enquiry</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Compiles and organises information from a number of sources to obtain evidence</td>
<td>Uses information from sources to present well-thought-out answers to questions</td>
<td>How important are people’s names? What effect did auctions have on the lives of slaves?</td>
<td>Pupils put themselves in the position of someone (slave, owner or someone else) in the story and write a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Uses information from sources to present well-thought-out answers to questions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>LO 2 Historical knowledge &amp; understanding</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Describes reasons for and results of key events and changes</td>
<td>Explains why certain aspects of society in different contexts have or have not changed over time</td>
<td>In what ways are some people still treated as if they are slaves?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Explains why certain aspects of society in different contexts have or have not changed over time</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>LO 3 Historical interpretation</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Recognises that value systems influence the way events are interpreted</td>
<td>Recognises that value systems influence the way events are interpreted</td>
<td>Why is a slavery system not allowed today? Can we understand slavery properly if we don’t know what it was like?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Yesteryear & Today No1, May 2007
there is a cycle of historical enquiry in the first three Learning Outcomes, as follows (and the same may be observed in the RNCS):

**Learning Outcome 1**

- posing/asking questions of the past
- collecting sources which learners interpret by extracting, organising, analysing, and evaluating relevant information in order to address the question. Relevant sources can be located either by teachers or learners, depending on the context of the enquiry.

**Learning Outcome 2**

- using the conceptual framework in historical analysis and interpretation

**Learning Outcome 3**

- constructing an answer (piece of history) to questions raised based on evidence from the sources
- communicating findings in a logical, systematic manner (Department of Education 2005a: 13).

There are, however, two very serious consequences of such an approach. One is that, if it were to be adopted, it would completely destroy the logic, sequence and emphasis intended in the design of the content curriculum. (It is worth noting here that both the RNCS knowledge focus and NCS content and contexts have drawn praise internationally for their innovation in the discursive manner in which the content knowledge is presented and for their attempts to transform the understanding of school history in South Africa.) Not only would one lose the benefit of the thought, research and consultation that has gone into the knowledge focus/content and contexts of the curriculum, but there would also no longer be any sense of a national curriculum, as each school and teacher would choose the content according to which Assessment Standardsthey wished to work with at any time. (This would also make it almost impossible to provide common resources such as textbooks and other learning materials.)
An equally critical consequence is that one could end up teaching what cannot be described as history (it might be “Integrated studies,” or similar). Implicit in the nature of history is that one studies the past for the sake of the past. Investigation and enquiry (or weighing evidence, interpretation, analysis and communication, etc.) are not undertaken for their own sake, but in order to be able to reconstruct what happened within a particular context and time in the past.

Discussion

History is, to the best of my knowledge, one of the only Learning Areas/subjects that has no content knowledge in its Assessment Standards (apart from LO 4 in the NCS, the Heritage outcome) - Life Sciences follows a similar pattern. Planning in history, therefore cannot be approached in the same way as planning in other subjects.

It is regrettable that the Learning Programme guidelines for history for both the RNCS (Department of Education 2003b) and the NCS (Department of Education 2005a) are ambiguous on the issue of whether planning in history begins with content knowledge or the Assessment Standards, as the following table illustrates.

Table 3: Planning procedures in the History Learning Programme guidelines

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quotations that support planning that begins with content knowledge</th>
<th>Quotations that support planning that begins with Assessment Standards</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RNCS Social Sciences History (Department of Education 2003b)</td>
<td>(a) This Learning Area emphasizes the construction of knowledge by encouraging learners to ask questions and to find answers about society and the environment in which they live at the same time developing the principle of social justice. The enquiry approach provides an approach to questioning, investigating and finding answers... p. 22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(a) The Learning Outcomes and Assessment Standards for History and Geography set out in the Social Sciences Learning Area Statement will be your starting point in designing a Learning Programme. The knowledge focus can then be divided into topics or themes around which teaching and learning can be focused. p.36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In the beginning... Where to start in history teaching?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(b) 2.4.1 Broad Principles of Working with Learning Outcomes and Assessment Standards: LEARNING OUTCOMES — Knowledge Framework which creates the context — ASSESSMENT STANDARDS. p.23</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(c) In both, History and Geography it is expected that any learning activity will draw Assessment Standards from all of the Learning Outcomes since these are considered to be integrated. For example, in dealing with the History topic Early African civilisation (Egypt/Nubia) in Grade 5, you would need to consider what knowledge focus/concepts you need to cover. p.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(d) As outlined above, you should select relevant Learning Outcomes and Assessment Standards for each topic. p.37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NCS History (Department of Education 2005a)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(a) Planning for the teaching of History in Grades 10 to 12 should begin with a detailed examination of the scope of the subject as set out in the History Statement...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Clarify the Learning Outcomes and Assessment Standards.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Study the conceptual progression across the three grades.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Identify the content to be taught. p.24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As can be seen from the above information, it appears that at a crucial point in the both the RNCS and the NCS Learning Programme guidelines, teachers are advised to begin with Learning Outcomes and Assessment Standards, but whenever practical examples are given about how planning should be done, reality returns and the advice is that content knowledge must be decided before the Assessment Standards. The Subject Assessment Guidelines for NCS History leave no room for ambiguity, however, and clarify the intentions of the Department in the
following explicit statement:

In the National Curriculum Statement, assessment activities will be derived from the Learning Outcomes and Assessment Standards and the content will provide the context for assessment. Planning will begin with the allocation of content [my italics] (Department of Education 2005b: 7).

The issues raised here are not new or unique. They were addressed by Denis Shemilt in 1980 in the landmark evaluation study of the Schools Council History Project, which established the success of the project. Shemilt pointed out the following regarding the planning of lessons: “Well-prepared teachers encountered few problems, but it is important to note that more planning is needed than may first appear”, and “the critical operation is the organization of time and materials around [the] objectives. There are many ways in which this may be done. The teacher may, for instance, underscore conceptual lessons as they appear in the story; or he may first establish a synoptic overview of the factual narrative…” (1980: 80). He provided an example of how a teacher planning lessons on the history of Medicine would first decide how to allocate and sequence the content knowledge and then would need to detail the specific objectives [Assessment Standards, in our case] that he wished to include.

I conclude with a comment about the second of the experiences related at the beginning of the paper. The issue raised on that occasion was that it was inappropriate to give history units titles that were “skills” rather than descriptions of content. In other words, that units should have titles like “Investigating the history of trade unions in South Africa”, rather than “Investigating continuity and change”. The concern was the same as the concern with lesson planning, as the reason given for the “skills” titles was that the titles of units should correspond to their outcomes. The consequences of such an approach are also the same, as without a content description in the title of the unit there is effectively no content framework for the history and no context in which the outcomes and assessment criteria can be attained.
R Siebörger

In the beginning... Where to start in history teaching?

References

1 A technical reason for why the misunderstanding that one begins planning with content knowledge not learning outcomes and assessment standards has occurred is that in the Grade 10-12 National Curriculum Statement for History, the Content and Contexts for the Attainment of Assessment Standards is mistakenly placed after the Assessment Standards, whereas in the Grade R-9 Revised National Curriculum Statement for Social Sciences, the Knowledge Focus is correctly before the Assessment Standards, as it is in England’s National Curriculum.

2 G Weldon, who chaired the NCS History committee, explains that, “in both documents [the RNCS and NCS Learning Programme guidelines], the contradictions came when generic sections were inserted into the subject and Learning Area documents during the editing processes”. An example of the inappropriateness of this procedure in the NCS History Learning Programme Guidelines is the statement, “[t]he content is identified by analysing the ASs of each LO”[!] (Department of Education 2005a: 18). She also states that an explicit ‘History Planning Route’ was dropped from the Guidelines before their publication. It had included the following: 1. Content Focus topic; 2. Learning Outcomes and Assessment Standards; 3. Key Questions... (Weldon 2006).


Methodology


Siebörger, Rob (2005a) E-mail to Anne Oberholzer, SAQA, 26 January 2005.

Siebörger, Rob (2005b) E-mail to members of the Historical Studies Standards Generating Body, 28 January 2005.


Weldon, Gail (2006) Personal communication, 18 September
THE “HOW TO” OF HISTORY TEACHING WITH AND THROUGH MUSIC IN THE GET PHASE

Mev Liesl van der Merwe
Noordwes-Universiteit

Introduction

Music is a fundamental aspect of every human culture. To understand a past or present society one has to know something about that culture’s music, song and dance. Music fulfils the basic human need for self-expression. Music and dance can also act as a vehicle for communication, for example, like drumming on gumboots do (Rosie Turner-Bisset, 2005:123).

Theories of cognitive psychologists such as Bruner, Goodnow and Austin support the idea that knowledge and skills are synergistic and are established through integration, interrelationships and interconnections, which increases learning. Integration makes lessons more applicable and learners are more motivated to learn and participate (Amdur, 1993:12). Gardner’s multiple intelligence theory also suggests a curricular design that is less fragmented. I believe that integration promotes deeper understanding and develops skills such as analyses, synthesis and evaluation, but I am also in favour of integration with integrity. Music and the arts as a discipline must still have its own and equal place in the curriculum.

- Learning through the Arts

Artists-in-the-schools program called Learning Through the Arts (LTTA) was established in 1995 by The Royal Conservatory of Music (Toronto, Canada). The initiative grew out of a response to the need to expand learning opportunities for young people in schools (Elster, 2001:11) At the end of the third year teachers have made a concerted effort to use the arts daily in all areas of curriculum and had an overwhelming positive response to the effects of LTTA. Their testimonials indicated that, amongst other things, the arts:
Methodology

- teach creative thinking, problem solving, risk taking, team work and communication;
- reach a greater number of students than other curricular areas;
- have the power to give every child an opportunity to be successful;
- motivate;
- meet the needs of every learning style; and
- help those who have a low attention span and who struggle at school to excel (Elster, 2001:12).

According to Goldberg (2001:22) learning through the arts is a method that encourages learners to express their understanding of history through an art form. For instance, learners can become characters, each with different perspectives, who could have been living in a certain time. Learners have to create a mini-musical depicting the meeting of the characters and create call and response songs reflecting their debates. Learning with and through the arts might lead to a desire to learn about the arts, which is an added bonus.

- **Learning with the arts**

Learning with the arts occurs when the Arts are introduced as a way to study history. Learning with the arts might be an effective method to teach about civil rights when learners are introduced to songs of the Civil Rights Movement, for example, the book Sing for Freedom: The Story of the Civil Rights Movement through its Songs (Carawan & Carawan, 1990). The learners examine the lyrics of the songs, which provide another perspective on the Civil Rights Movement (Goldberg, 2001:22).

- **Discipline-Based Arts Education**

Disciplined-based arts education (DBAE), funded by the Getty Center for Education in the Arts, is a conceptual framework, which insures that all students are involved in study of the arts as a part of their general education. It also serves as an innovative approach to integrate the arts into the curriculum within the structure of a typical school day. DBAE means that students study musical, theatrical, dance and visual works of
art from the following four discipline perspectives: production, history, aesthetics and criticism and establishes these disciplines as valuable in themselves (AIEA, 2006) (Amdur, 1993:12).

DBAE curriculum enhances learners’ expressive creativity and appreciation of art through instruction in these related disciplines. Some Art educators feel that DBAE undermines and detracts from the importance of studio art, although others feel it is a good way to integrate arts into the general classroom and it can be effective for the content classroom such as social studies, because the framework includes understanding ways that art effects and is effected by culture, as part of the overall arts education (Logan, 2005:20).

- **Other developments in arts integration**

Since 1920 correlation of art with other studies in the elementary curriculum was being explored. Two subject areas often used for correlation with art were history and geography (Freyberger, 1985:7). With the release of A Nation At Risk in 1983 in America much more focus was placed on the basics, which did not necessarily include the arts. With the implementation of No Child Left Behind the United States entered an era marked by standardised tests and emphasis on core knowledge with reduced time allocation to the arts. Integrating the arts into the core curriculum is one physically conceivable way to incorporate the arts into the school day (Logan, 2005:13). In 1993 Leon Winslow wrote a book directed to the new trend of integrating the arts on all levels of education (Freyberger, 1985:7).

The editor of the organisation of American Historians’ magazine of history, Kevin Byrne (2005:1), realised the need to bring history alive in classrooms and he suggests music, in his July 2005 volume: “Teaching History with Music”, as a tool to do so (Byrne, 2005). There is even a website Voices Across Time: American History Through Music http://www.voicesacrosstime.org/ dedicated to teach history with music in America. It is clear that music has been used to teach history in America, but what about South Africa?
Why should one teach history with and through music in South Africa? And how could one use music in teaching history in South Africa?

**Why should one teach history with music?**

- **Emotional experience of history**

Firstly, music can give the learner a multidimensional, perceptual, and interactive experience of history. Music reflects the emotional experiences people had during and following historical events (*Listening 1*). Learners feel more connected to the time, the people and their struggles (Goldberg, 2001:98). This “emotional experience” of history through
music sustains and passes on the memory of events. Through the melodies, harmonies and phrasing, songs give insight into the feelings and nuances of people and cultures that cannot be found in a more journalistic report (Goldberg, 2001: 96). “Songs contain the world’s repertoire of personal accounts of life experiences, including children’s songs, songs about love, courtship, marriage, customs, beliefs, events, religion, struggles, survival and so on.” (Goldberg, 2001:96).

- **Musical artefacts as historic documents**

Secondly, music plays a central part in all cultures and therefore musical artefacts could be studied as historical sources and evidence that provide insight into different cultures of the past and the present. Songs could be analysed, interpreted and compared with other sources related to the same topic to find out what life was like in another time and place. The texts of songs could be treated as historical documents especially if they represent historical events (*Listening 2*). Art examples drawn from music provide the history learner with primary sources to examine (Goldberg, 2001:95). Songs reflect human complexities in their most personal and authentic form. Songs remind us of the multiple perspectives on history.

- **Recreating or enacting events through song and dance**

Thirdly, music and dance are ideal vehicles to use in recreating or enacting actual events. Learners could also compose new songs and create dances to comment on historic events. Through music learners are engaged in constructing a product that demonstrates their knowledge and understanding of history.

Through the re-enactment of the song tune or dance, learners can gain access to the minds and emotions of people from the past (Rosie Turner-Bisset, 2001:124). When the learners become the characters they study, through song and dance, they become more in touch with the subject material. It also motivates the learners to work with for instance biographies, which might have been dull otherwise. The song and dance also makes the learners’ presentations much more interesting for the other learners in the class and they are more likely to remember details.
of the subject material and be interested in following up on the subject (Goldberg, 2001:100).

- **Inclusive history teaching**

The way in which each learner learns is individual and idiosyncratic, related to personality and cognitive development (Rosie Turner-Bisset, 2001:124). Two of the most important theories in this context are Bruner’s theory of mental representation and Gardner’s theory of multiple intelligences. Bruner (Rosie Turner-Bisset, 2001:124) states that there are three ways of representing the world mentally: enactive, iconic and symbolic. Music is a powerful form of enactive and symbolic representation. Gardner (Rosie Turner-Bisset, 2001:124) introduced the notion that there are eight kinds of intelligence: linguistic, musical, logical-mathematical, spatial, bodily kinaesthetic, interpersonal, intrapersonal and naturalist (Rosie Turner-Bisset, 2001:125). Learning in an integrated manner is multifaceted, because it draws upon learner’s innate intelligence by awakening linguistic, mathematical, spatial, kinaesthetic and musical modes. This permits learners to conceptualise and understand by using their strength areas to compensate or overcome weaknesses in other areas. It also motivates children, sustains their interest and improves their self-esteem (Bloomfield, 2000:108).

This integrated method of teaching history ensures inclusive history education, because more learners’ learning strategies are taken into account - especially the students who have a predisposition towards musical intelligence would benefit from this. Gifted students get the opportunity to demonstrate skills through more challenging tasks like presenting history through music and dance.

- **Teaching history with music in the NCS**

The final reason is in some ways the least important, though its statutory force would seem to render it the most important reason for inclusion of music. The NCS of Social Sciences requires it. Music can be studied as social experiences over time (Grade 3 knowledge focus). Other knowledge focuses such as world religions, early civilization, provincial history, and national symbols would not be facilitated in depth without
studying the music as well (Listening 3: National anthem).

Learning outcome 1 from grade 4-6 also requires the learners to convey the answer through, among others, music and dance. Music of the past and the present could also be compared with each other (Grade 4 LO 2: AS 3 & Grade 5 LO 2: AS 3 & Grade 6 LO 3: AS 3). A songwriter gives his or her perspective on history and this could be compared with other sources so that learners may realize that there can be more than one version of the same event (Grade 4, 5 & 6, LO 3: AS 1).

How could one teach history with music?

Three different ways of linking disciplines or intelligences will be discussed and evaluated: connection, correlation and integration.

- **Connection (Parallel discipline designs)**

“Connection is the most popular, most used and least meaningful way of linking disciplines.” (Snyder, 1996:18). Through connection, learning about history takes place through music, but there is no musical goal. With a connection, music is the servant of another discipline. It is a very powerful teaching tool but not a substitute for music education or integrated curriculum. Connection is a causal or logical relationship or association interdependence, a contextual relation. With connection, materials from music, like songs, are used to help teach a concept in history. Connection is the way most classroom teachers use music, because it requires no musical understanding and very little skill (Snyder, 1996:19).
Connections according to Snyder (1996:18):

Connection looks like:

```
            concept or skill from one discipline

            materials or concepts from another discipline(s)
```

History

How societies in Africa experienced and reacted to colonialism.

Music

Material: Johnny Clegg
“Third world child”
- **Correlation (Complementary discipline units)**

Correlations can be made between two or more disciplines through shared materials or topics. Two different subject teachers use the same material and different concepts are emphasized. However, no plan is made to develop important ideas across disciplines. A correlation could be when the music teacher uses the song “Third world child” to analyse the rhythms and composing techniques used in this song and the history teacher uses the song to teach about colonialism. Teachers working on correlations work with materials rather than themes (Snyder, 1996:19). Through correlation the skills and concepts of each discipline can be addressed. Correlation, although more defensible than connection, are still not part of an integrated curriculum.

In correlation a relationship is established between two fields or areas (Freyberger, 1985:8). Correlation is usually between subject matter from the fields represented by school subjects rather than directly with the subjects themselves (Winslow, 1939:32). Correlation involves a relation that each implies the other, an interdependence of variable quantities.

Correlations according to Snyder (1996:19):

Correlation looks like:

![Correlation Diagram]

...
Between some of the organising principles of the learning area Arts and Culture and the History outcomes of the learning area Social Sciences there are inherent correlations in the National curriculum statement:

- **Integration (Interdisciplinary units)**

True integration works with a broad theme or concept that cuts across disciplines, so each content area or intelligence can explore the theme in a meaningful way (Snyder, 1996:19). The integrity of each discipline is maintained. Application and synthesis of ideas between disciplines are encouraged. Integration provides more meaningful experiences (Freyberger, 1985:6). Integration is the composition of a whole by adding together or combining separate parts into a whole.
Integration according to Snyder (1996:19):
Methodology

Concept connections:

Christine Gutierrez (2000:357) confirms that interdisciplinary integration is necessary because of the complexity of history knowledge. This interdisciplinary approach is possible through thematic, interdisciplinary and team teaching. At Jefferson High School in South Central Los Angeles they call this the Humanitas approach, where the humanities are integrated with the social sciences, natural sciences, fine arts, and, at times, mathematics. The teachers here work together for critical inquiry and interdisciplinary exchange. They meet three times a week and discuss teaching issues, student work, and larger intellectual issues. They constantly search for the most recent materials in all fields and they explore best practices. For example, when they do weapons of war: technology,
art and history merge to teach the technology of weapons and the effects of weapons of war which are often heard of in poetry, prose or song (Listening 4). They agree that each discipline should still be distinct, discreet and taught by a teacher with excellent subject knowledge of a specific discipline and that not all the curriculum can or should be interdisciplinary.

Music educators Wiggins and Wiggins (1997:38-41) believe that integration should take place on the bases of conceptual connections rather than content connections. Learning processes and affective responses could be connected through theme-based units that address cognitive and affective connections (Grauer et al, 2001:4).

Practical classroom examples

There are numerous songs written in response to historical events or relating to periods and characters in history (Goldberg, 2001:98). For the Intermediate Phase folk songs are an important source of appropriate songs. Folk songs were composed by ordinary people for ordinary people. Traditional folk songs encompass a wide range of songs. There are strong links between storytelling and folk songs. Ballads tell a story and the drama in the song can be mimed, spoken or executed through expressive movement. A song or ballad may be divided into different scenes and all learners, including those with literacy difficulties can access the meaning of the song and its historical content. To experience historical content through one genre and express it in another, requires learners to be actively engaged (Rosie Turner-Bisset, 2001:125).

Suggestions when using songs in the history classroom

Rosie Turner-Bisset (2001: 137) gives the following suggestions when using songs in the history class:

- Choose songs around a theme to which historical content is related so that the song becomes another source of evidence to use alongside others;
- Extract information from the songs as texts;
- Let the learners compare different sources side by side to aid comparison of what the different source types are saying;
Methodology

- Sing and play songs purely for enjoyment;
- Ask questions about the songs such as why was the songs written and who might have written the song;
- Ask the learners to create and add their own verses; and
- After performing a dance ask the learners what the dance tells us about the people who lived at that time.

- **Using songs to obtain the three history outcomes**

Songs can also be used to obtain the three history outcomes:
- Learners could use songs as sources to enquire about the past and the present
- Learners could create songs and dances to demonstrate their historical understanding and knowledge.
- Learners could interpret songs and the history the songs are commenting on.

- **A practical activity**

Grade 9 learners could listen to the song “Asimbonanga” by Johnny Clegg and answer Byrne’s music interpretation sheet to obtain learning outcome 3 “Historical interpretation”, assessment standard 2: “Constructs an interpretation based on sources, giving reasons for own interpretation”.

Johnny Clegg (2003): “Thirteen years ago, in 1986, South Africa was in a state of emergency and it was a very intense cultural struggle that was being waged. And we were part of that and this is a song that we wrote for truly one of the greatest South Africans in history: Nelson Mandela. And we would like to open the show tonight with a tribute to him.”

**Song:**

**Asimbonanga (Mandela)**

**Chorus:**

Asimbonanga
(We have not seen him)
Asimbonang’ um Mandela thina
(We have not seen Mandela)
Laph’ ekona
(in the place where he is)
Laph’ehleli khona
(in the place where he is kept)

Oh the sea is cold and the sky is grey
Look across the island and into the bay
We are all island till comes the day
We cross the burning water.

Chorus...

A seagull wings across the sea
Broken silence is what I dream
Who has the words to close the distance
between you and me?

Chorus...

Steve Biko/Victoria Mxenge/Neil Aggett

Asimbonanga
(We have not seen him)
Asimbonangi umfowethu thina
(We have not seen our brother)
Laphi ekhona
(in the place where he is)
La wafela khona
(in the place where he died)

Hey wena
(hey you)
Hey wena nawe
(Hey you and you as well)
Sizofik a nina la’
Siyakhona
(When will we arrive at our true destination?)
Nelson Mandela (2003) directly after this song was sung: “Well, it is music and dancing that makes me at peace with the world and at peace with myself…”

**Byrne’s (2005:1) music interpretation sheet:**
1. Identify the tone or mood of the music.
2. List three things that you heard in the song that you think are important.
3. Why do you think those were important parts of the song?
4. What audience do you think the song was made for?
5. What evidence helps you to know this?
6. List two things the music tells you about all, one or two of the following topics:
   a. South African history
   b. Society
   c. Culture
7. Read or listen to the lyrics. Write a paragraph about what you think the artist is trying to say to his/her audience

**Practical classroom examples**

Songs, which connects with specific history knowledge focuses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Knowledge Focus</th>
<th>Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grade R &amp;</td>
<td>• Stories about the learners’ own life, the way of life of his/her family and</td>
<td>• Thanda – love (Hetta Potgieter); Sibathathu (Afrika Collage); Fiela (Afrika Collage); Wasdag</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 1</td>
<td>other families and aspects, which changed over time.</td>
<td>(Rykie Pienaar).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Social experiences across times (for example games, toys in own and other</td>
<td>• Stone game from Ghana (Afrika Collage); Teddiebeer (Rykie Pienaar); I came to try this game –</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>societies).</td>
<td>Brazil (Games children sing around the world).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 2</td>
<td>• Social experience across time (for example, house, food and clothes in</td>
<td>• Pounding song (Laurie Levine: Music in South Africa); Hungry man (Laurie Levine: Traditional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>different societies).</td>
<td>music in South Africa); My kleertjies (Rykie Pienaar).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Objects and personal belongings which the learners value.</td>
<td>• Ons gaan ry – my perdjie en my fietsie (Rykie Pienaar).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Grade 3
- Stories about interesting people (women and men, boys and girls, common people, famous people) in different times in the history of South Africa and the world.
- Stories from the past and the present in South Africa and the world about respect for and violation of children's rights.
- Social experiences over time (for example, works of art, music and dance in different communities).

Grade 4
- The history of the local area or district: oral history and tradition: find out about place names, names of rivers, mountains and other landmarks and indigenous environmental practices.
- Learning about leaders in all areas of life: what makes a leader good or great and stories about South African and world leaders over time.
- The history of travel and transport over time ...

Grade 5
- Provincial history: provincial government and symbols.
- Sacred music in antiquity [link](http://www.rakkav.com/kdhinc/pages/sacred.htm);
The biblical musical instruments [link](http://www.rakkav.com/kdhinc/pages/instruments.htm); Synaulia: sounds and music of the antiquity [link](http://www.soundcenter.it/synauliaeng.htm)
- Die vierkleur van Transvaal (J.S. de Villiers: FAK)

Grade 6
- The history of medicine: indigenous medicine and traditional healing.
- Democracy in South Africa: What is democracy?
- Democracy in South Africa: national symbols like the national flag and national anthem.
- Healing trance song (Laurie Levine: Traditional music in South Africa).
- One man one vote (Johnny Clegg).
- National anthem.
Methodology

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade 7</th>
<th>Grade 8</th>
<th>Grade 9</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dutch settlement, slave trade in the Indian Ocean and slavery at the cape - 17th and 18th century.</td>
<td>The South African War: who was involved and how were their lives influenced?</td>
<td>Human Rights during and after the Second World War: Nazi-Germany.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The fight for human rights and against colonialism in Africa.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Apartheid in South Africa: How it influenced people’s lives.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Suppression and the increase of mass-democratic movements in the 1970s and 1980s: external and internal pressure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Constructing a new identity in South Africa in the 1990s: negotiations before 1994, the first democratic elections and the South African constitution.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The nuclear age and the Cold World: Hiroshima and Nagasaki: the changing nature of war.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conclusion

In the new millennium the need has arisen to produce learners who can adjust to increasingly rapid changes through creative and critical thinking. Music stimulates and develops a learner’s creativity. In the current media age communication is visual, aural and kinaesthetic. Music and dance help students to communicate in these “languages”. Higher level of thinking, for example, creativity, ability to analyse and synthesise information, ability to plan and organise tasks are all possible when using music to teach history.
References


LOGAN, E.L. 2005. Integrating the Arts into Middle School Social Studies
Methodology

Curriculum. “Master’s of Arts in Education”, Williamsburg: College of William and Mary School of Education.


THE VISUAL MEDIUM IN THE HISTORY CLASSROOM

Sven Zimmerman
Balieu College, Johannesburg

The discussion I am going to have today is nothing unique and has been used in many History classrooms and other subjects’ classrooms.

However I do not think it has been explored as a teaching medium in a great deal before and it is this that I would like to present today.

The generation of pupil being taught today is a pupil who is firstly challenged by new strategies and secondly inspired by the visual medium. The old “chalk and talk” approach does not inspire (not that I think it ever inspired) or motivate the pupil of the 21st Century.

I will present two different visual medium examples:

- The use of a dramatized History film, ALL QUIET ON THE WESTERN FRONT in Grade 8
- The use of the overhead projector for a focus on APARTHEID SOUTH AFRICA, in Grade 9.

All quiet on the western front:

The Grade 8 Curriculum in the new learning Area of Human Social Sciences, calls for a focus on World War One and particularly the conditions and horrors of this particular war.

On reviewing this need I decided to find the best visual representation of this possible, it is easy to present pictures and give graphic descriptions but I do not think these strategies will be clear enough in portraying these horrors.

I was drawn to the film, All quiet on the western front, as I remember seeing it as a child and how it had quite a profound impact on me. The version I saw was the colour production produced in 1979 and produced by Norman Rosemont and starring Richard Thomas, Ernest Borgnine,
Donald Pleasence and Ian Holm. Even though presented from a German perspective, the film based on the book by Erich Maria Remarque has portrayed the following events which I think all pupils of History need to know about when studying World War One:

- The transformation of a group of young men from glory and adventure seeking to war weary cynical old men.
- The use of nationalist speech to encourage enlistment.
- The physical hardships presented in the actual trenches, the rats and lice, the mud and the corpses and constant bombardment.
- The futility of going “over the top” into no man’s land and being killed for a few meters of land.
- The loss of friends
- The various types of weapons used to kill from machine guns to flamethrowers.
- The psychological and emotional impact on ordinary young men when having to kill other young men.

The process:

The intention was to not just simply show them a film filled with blood and gore but to try and get them to empathise with those who have had to live through an unpleasant experience like World War One and Trench Warfare.

I needed to develop an exercise that kept the necessary outcomes of enquiry, understanding and interpretation in mind and encourage the pupils to try and empathise with the soldiers presented in the film, *All quiet on the western front*.

The activity which was eventually formalized was a two part activity:

- A diary consisting of four 100 word entries, similar to the type of diary Paul Baumer (the leading character and narrator in the film) would have produced.
- A reflective piece whereby, the pupil will present his/her feelings and emotions on observing the horrors of war, in words.

Finally this was to be packaged in a creative and unique fashion present-
ing as best the area and theme being studied.

The two components and the presented package will each be assessed with the use of an assessment rubric which will be presented to the pupils beforehand to encourage transparency and preparation.

**The actual activity with rubrics and instructions is attached.**

Due to the length of the film, it is just over two hours in length and to prevent unnatural breaks due to 50 minute lessons and only two of these, separated by a number of days in a seven day cycle. I decided to utilize the school’s activity week which has been put together for grade camps and day excursions.

I proposed a History day whereby the Grade 8 pupils would be presented with the activity as an entire grade and then as an entire grade they would watch the entire film in the school auditorium. Once they had viewed the film and after a ½ break they would then board buses to go to the South African Military Museum in Saxonwold where they would be given a second activity worksheet which would draw their attention to actual artifacts and displays from World War One, giving them an opportunity to see the weapons, uniforms and machines from the actual period under study.

This proposal turned out to be successful as it gave me an opportunity to interact with all the grade 8 pupils by:

- Presenting the activity to them and explaining all aspects of the activity.
- Encouraging the pupils to take notes throughout the viewing of the film and explaining to them that the notes have relevance as the film is examinable.
- Pausing the film and committing on various scenes and their relevance to the pupils’ understanding of the period.
- Being present to facilitate any concerns or questions.

This Activity Week was at the end of the term and therefore the pupils were given a deadline date for the second week of the next term (5
Methodology

weeks), more than enough time in which to complete the activity.

The finished product will be presented in September and I will attach or present some of the really good assignments.

My final comments on this assignment are:

- I believe the film was a success as the horrors and tragedies really affected some of the pupils when conversing with them after the film. The girls in particular made reference to the absolute waste of youth and the tragedy of war.
- The timing was perfect as the History Day, in the Activity Week was successful as it gave the grade 8s great exposure through the visual medium and the artifacts.
- It covered a number of assessment standards in the Revised National Curriculum:
  - LO1-Enquiry skills – AS1 –evaluating sources
  - LO1-Enquiry skills-AS2-presents an original idea as part of an answer.
  - LO1-Enquiry skills-AS3-communicates knowledge and understanding by constructing own interpretation and argument.
  - LO2-demonstrate historical knowledge and understanding-AS3-explains changes in a wider historical and environmental context.
  - LO3-interpret aspects of History-AS2-constructs an interpretation based on sources.
  - LO3-interpret aspects of History-AS3-analyses issues which influence the way History has been written.

- It created the perfect spring board for a focus on World War One, as once they return to the classroom and study the causes and effects and outcomes they will have a visual representation of the period in their minds thanks to the film and the museum visit.
- The pupils have been presented with meaningful resources on which to base their understanding of this period.
APARtheid SOUTH afRICA:

The Grade 9 curriculum in the Learning Area of Human Social Sciences, calls for a study of the apartheid period in South African History.

On reviewing this need and listening to the pupils concerns about having to study this period once again. (It seems as if this has been a focus of study every second year in the senior phase of their schooling. This in itself could be the grounds for some research as it concerns me that an important period like this in South African History is being “done to death” and therefore it will lose its relevance through shear lack of interest on the pupils’ side). I decided to try and come up with a unique approach to this period of study which could bring another element into the area of study.

I decided utilize a visual medium as I wanted to breath some life into the period and at the same time provide them with some significant skills development.

The strategy I was drawn to was a verbal presentation utilizing the overhead projector, as this was a resource that they all had access to so leveling the field and encouraging them to develop the skills of research, interpretation and presentation through the use of a visual medium.

The plan was presented to them on an instruction and activity information sheet with the assessment instructions and rubric present.

The activity consisted of having to research two photographs which they feel symbolize the apartheid period or the period of transition from apartheid to Democracy.

Once they had identified the two photographs they had to:

Firstly present a written motivation for each with a brief description of the actual photograph and relevant aspects of the photograph in words.

Secondly select one of the photographs and then present on a trans-
Methodology

Transparency to the class in which they interact with the presented photograph and provide a brief verbal motivation and description.

The activity with instructions and rubrics is attached.

This strategy was successful as it covered a number of needs:

- Brought a visual slant to the apartheid period.
- Encouraged the pupils to research a very focused symbol of the apartheid period.
- To present this focus they had to have a very good understanding of the apartheid period and the period of transition.
- Allowed the pupils to work on their skills of research, interpretation and presentation.

The main problem encountered was the area of research and it seems if this is a common problem throughout a number of subjects.

In this particular activity two problems were encountered in the fact that a number of pupils really do not go to too much trouble in finding relevant photographs to symbolize the period.

Firstly a number of pupils used the same photographs found on the internet through entering the word “apartheid” into the Google search engine.

Secondly, some pupils used photographs from other periods of hardship i.e. Israeli-Palestinian conflict and starvation in 19th Century India as the photograph of focus. This showed a lack of research skills as they did not broaden their net of resources available.

In conclusion and reviewing both tasks I did find the pupils far more stimulated and keen to get on with the task. The end result of the Grade 8, All quiet on the western front, task is yet to be seen but judging from the interest and comments passed during the viewing of the film, I can confidentially say that they will generally be very sound assignments and my objective should be achieved: The pupils having a fair understanding of World War One and the impact on the young person of that
period. The Grade 9 apartheid assignment, I am able to comment on as it has been completed and I do have some copies here. This assignment was unique to the pupils in the sense that it was the first time that they were all forced to use the same medium i.e. the overhead projector and therefore this definitely showed up those who have strong preparation and presentation skills and those who do not. The two areas that need to be addressed are the need for improved research skills (a problem area through out the school and therefore a whole school strategy is in the process of being developed) and improved presentation skills (this will be addressed in conjunction with the English department). I do believe both tasks were successful. Therefore I will look to presenting the same tasks next year with the areas of attention addressed.

Appendix A

“All quiet on the western front” History segment

This assignment is based on the film All quiet on the western front, which is based on the book by Eric Maria Remarque.

You will watch the film with the intention of seeing the horror and tragedy of war.

Once you have completed watching this film, you will have a short assignment to do, so you must pay close attention and make notes if necessary.

This is examinable so pay attention, make notes if necessary and keep all your notes.

Due Date: 5 -12 September

Mark allocation: 60 marks
Assignment  60 Marks

Your assignment consists of two parts:

1. Paul Baumer’s Diary
2. Your personal reflections

1.  **Paul Baumer’s diary:  4 x10 = 40 Marks**

You are expected to watch the film very carefully and using the scenes presented to you and the trench display at the South African Military Museum, produce four ½ page diary entries.

This is a empathy exercise, whereby you must imagine yourself as being one of Paul Baumer’s friends who survived the war.

You need to call on your knowledge of World War One and Trench Warfare in particular and produce four different 100 word diary entries portraying the horror and tragedy of war.

You may make reference to some of the scenes and characters in the film *All quiet on the western front*, but it must be in your own words and it must be unique. In other, words you must create your own scenario which might be similar to the experiences of Paul Baumer and his friends but it must make reference to your experiences.

2.  **YOUR REFLECTIONS:  10 MARKS**

You are expected to reflect on your observations from the film and your observations at the museum.

To reflect means to comment on your feelings about the horrors and tragedy of Trench warfare and the experiences of soldiers like Paul Baumer and his friends.

Your reflection should be ½ page in length (no more than 200 words)
### 3. Presentation: 10 Marks

Your diary and reflection must be packaged in a unique and creative fashion, keeping in mind the period of time and the horrors of war.

#### Marking Rebrics

**Name:**

**Diary**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>0-29%</th>
<th>30-39%</th>
<th>40-49%</th>
<th>50-59%</th>
<th>60-69%</th>
<th>70-79%</th>
<th>80-100%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Content</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Limited or vague or copied</td>
<td>Limited and no reference to film or display</td>
<td>Deals with some horrors and tragedies and limited use of film or display for any ideas</td>
<td>Makes some reference to film and display when commenting on horrors and tragedy of war</td>
<td>Good use of film and display to develop diary entries on horrors and tragedy of war</td>
<td>Very good reference to horrors and tragedies throughout the diary entries. Some originality</td>
<td>Outstanding. Unique and deals with a number of horrors and tragedies with excellent use of film and museum display.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reflections and feelings</strong></td>
<td>No reference to feelings</td>
<td>Limited reference to feelings</td>
<td>Some references</td>
<td>Uses 1st person and attempts empathy through use of emotive language</td>
<td>Fair attempt at empathy and emotive language</td>
<td>Very Good empathy and good use of 1st person but does not sustain emotive language</td>
<td>Excellent empathy, one really believes that this individual exists. God use of 1st person and emotive language</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

/40
**Methodology**

### Reflection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0-29%</td>
<td>0-2 ½</td>
<td>Limited in commentary and reflection. No reference to opinions and feelings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-39%</td>
<td>3-3 ½</td>
<td>Some commentary and reflection but no personal observations or feelings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40-49%</td>
<td>4-4 ½</td>
<td>Average in all aspects of commentary and observations and feelings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50-59%</td>
<td>5-5 ½</td>
<td>Fair attempt on observations. And good commentary but no reference to personal opinions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60-69%</td>
<td>6-6 ½</td>
<td>Good attempt in comments and observations but limited personal opinions and feelings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70-79%</td>
<td>7-7 ½</td>
<td>Reflects on horrors and tragedies and presents personal opinions and feelings well.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80-100%</td>
<td>8-10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Presentation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0-29%</td>
<td>0-2 ½</td>
<td>No effort to package</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-39%</td>
<td>3-3 ½</td>
<td>Limited effort at packaging</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40-49%</td>
<td>4-4 ½</td>
<td>Some appropriate packaging but very common</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50-59%</td>
<td>5-5 ½</td>
<td>But common too much packaging</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60-69%</td>
<td>6-6 ½</td>
<td>Some packaging. And an attempt at being unique. And some originality and unique.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70-79%</td>
<td>7-7 ½</td>
<td>Reflects on horrors and tragedies and presents personal opinions and feelings well.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80-100%</td>
<td>8-10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix B
Grade 9

History Assignment

Instructions:

- The assignment is based on two photographs from the apartheid period.
- You are expected to select two photographs which you believe epitomize (represent) the apartheid period and the change to a democratic South Africa and then present a clear motivation for your selection.
- Your motivation must be presented under the sub headings presented below.
- Each of your motivations must be short and concise; each must be approximately 100 words each.
- Your motivations must be presented on a separate piece of paper with a copy of each photograph and the motivation under each.
- You must then select one of the photographs and then present on a transparency to the class in which you interact with the presented photograph and provide a brief description and motivation.
- Your presentation must be 3 minutes in length.
- In this assessment you are being assessed on Learning Outcome 1 – The pupil is able to use enquiry skills to investigate past and present. Assessment Standard 5 – The pupil communicates knowledge and understanding by constructing own interpretation and argument based on the historical sources; uses information technology where available and appropriate
- The mark allocation is 30 marks:
  - 20 marks for written presentation - 2 photographs with motivation x 10 mark each.
  - 10 marks for presentation
Written component
Headings for each motivation

Remember you are doing two photographs

- Introduction – brief background to photograph 2 marks
- Description of photograph – Illustrate 3 important aspects of photograph. 3 marks
- Motivation – Your reasons (5 reasons) for selecting the photograph. 5 marks

10x2 = 20 marks

Maring grid
Presentation:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name:</th>
<th>Grade:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mark</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presentation</td>
<td>Too short</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reads entire speech</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No interaction with photo</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Description and motivation | Vague description and no motivation | Vague description and vague motivation | Good description but weak motivation | Limited description but a good motivation | Clear and complete description and motivation |

TOTAL:

LEARNING OUTCOME 2 MARKS:
Inleiding

Regionale de Schryver, ‘n hoogleraar in geskiedenis aan die Universiteit van Leuven verwys na die omvang en verskeidenheid van dissipline geskiedenis wat die veelsydigheid en ingewikkeldheid van gemeenskappe weerspieël.1 Die dissipline bestaan uit ‘n veelheid van objekte wat aan die hand van verskeie metodes nagevors en bestudeer kan word. Dit berus op ‘n pluriforme grondslag wat aan die dissipline sy vele aangesigte gee.2 Plaaslike geskiedenis maak deel van hierdie veelheid en verskeidenheid uit.

Aan die begin van die negentiende eeu het geskiedenis in die Weste, as geesteswetenskap, sy beslag gekry. Daar is hoofsaaklik op die internasionale en nasionale politieke gebeure en figure klem geleë wat tot gevolg gehad het dat die politieke faset voorrang geniet. In hierdie benadering, “geskiedenis van bo,” die ander fasette van ‘n gemeenskap, soos die ekonomiese, kulturele en religieuse op die agtergrond gedwing en die gewone mens en dié se allerdagse doen en late het nie in die geskiedskrywing gefi gureer nie. Reaksie teen hierdie tipe geskiedskrywing het reeds teen die einde van die negentiende eeu na vore gekom, toe die Duitse kultuurhistorikus, Ebert Gotheim, die monopolistiese aansprake van die politieke geskiedenis gekritiseer het en daarop gewys het dat politiek maar ‘n enkele faset van ‘n samelewing is en dat al die ander komponente van ‘n samelewing ook bestuderingswaardig is. Volgens hierdie benadering het die gewone mens die hoof objek van die historiese onderzoek geword. Die gewone mens se gedrag en belewenis moes aan die hand van stukture waarinne dit plaasvind ontleed en verklaar word. Hiervolgens kon die lewensomstandighede van die massa, die bowe individuele, die anonieme, die sosiale prosesse en strukture van ‘n samelewing geanaliseer word.3 De Schryver verwys na hierdie geskiedbenadering as ‘n “beskavingsgeskiedenis” en beklemtone dat die doel
hiervan is om via ’n “nie-politieke geskiedenis” by ’n “totale” of “integrale” geskiedenis uit te kom.

Ek is van mening dat in die samestelling en aanbieding van geskiedeins leerplanne op sekondêre skool, veral in die vroeër bedeling, die politieke faset tot ’n groot mate beklemtoon is. Dit blyk asof in die samestelling van die meer resente leerplanne daar’n daadwerklike poging is om groter variteit in die samestelling van die leerplan daar te stel. Ek is egter nie so seker of by die werklike aanbieding van die leermateriaal die variteit altyd teenwoordig is nie en of dit nie maar nog steeds na die aanbieding van politieke of administratiewe geskiedenis neig nie. Hierdie inhoud, die politieke is trouens makliker bekombaar as dié van die ander lae van ’n gemeenskap se geskiedenis en ek dink dat met die aanbieding van plaaslike geskiedenis hierdie ander lae dalk net blootgelê kan word, daarom dan hierdie referaat oor die onderig van plaaslike geskiedenisop sekondêre vlak. Waarom my verwysing na Laudium vir voorbeelde van bronnie materiaal? Om dat dit vir my ’n uitdaging was om te gaan kyk of die voorbeeldige waar- na ek verwys prakties bekombaar in ’n studie area soos Laudium is.

Plaaslike geskiedenis is...

 Alvorens die spesifieke bronnmateriaal vir plaaslike geskiedenis bekyk kan word, is dit nodig om net kortliks te verwys na die aard van plaaslike geskiedenis deur te let op interessante beskrywings van hierdie genre in die geskiedeniswetenskap. In die vaktaal en vakliteratuur word die term plaaslike en streekgeskiedenis met ’n verskeidenheid begrippe soos plaaslik, lokale, stedelike, streeks-, landelike, omgewings- en alledaagse geskiedenis omskryf. Die diverse en uiteenlopende aard van plaaslike geskiedenis bemoeilik ’n presiese definieëring van die begrip. In die Urban Yearbook van 1974 word plaaslike geskiedenis omskryf as: “...the study of man’s past in relation to his locality, being determined by an individual’s interests and experience.” J.W. Kew voorheen verbonde aan die Universiteit van Suid-Afrika (UNISA), omskryf die begrip as volg:

Local history can be defined as the history of a town, district or any unity smaller than the nation-state, with clearly defined territorial limits or in which inhabitants are so far united in thought and action as to feel a sense of belonging together.
Carol Kammen, ’n Amerikaanse plaaslike historikus beskryf die aard van plaaslike geskiedenis en die feit dat dit nie in isolasie geskryf moet word nie, as volg:

I see local history as the study of past events and of people or groups in a given geographical area - a study based on a wide variety of documentary evidence and placed in a comparative context that should be both regional and national. .... Local history is the study of the human condition in and through time.\(^7\)

Die Engelse gerekende plaaslike historikus, W.G. Hoskins, omskryf dit as die historiese studie van die ontstaan, ontwikkeling, stabilisering en [soms] disintegrasie van ’n gemeenskap in ’n bepaalde geografiese gebied.\(^8\)

Plaaslike geskiedenis het sosiaal-, kulturele- en akademies-opvoedkundige waarde, omdat dit gemeenskapsgerig is en identiteit, trots, lojaliteit, samehorigheid en ’n historiese bewussyn by die bepaalde gemeenskap kan aanmoedig.\(^12\) In die artikel “Writers of small histories: Local historians in the United States and Britain,” verwys die Amerikaanse plaaslike
geskiedskrywer, L. Bisceglia, na die waarde van plaaslike geskiedenis as “the cohesive strands binding communities together.” Deur plaaslike geskiedenis kan 'n gemeenskap terselfdertyd bewus gemaak word van sy spesifieke omstandighede sowel as sy plek in die nasionale geskiedenis. Hierdie bewuswording kan begrip vir verandering en ontwikkeling van 'n bepaalde samelewing tot gevolg hê. Dit verbreed en verryk nie net 'n spesifieke nasionale historiografie nie, maar ontwikkel ook 'n algemene historiese kennis en perspektief van 'n bepaalde plek of streek. Vervolgens wil ek baie kortlik verwys na die plaaslike geskiedenistradisie in Westerse historiografie en na enkele voorbeelde van Suid-Afrikaanse plaaslike geskiedenis verwys.

In Engeland, wat die langste plaaslike geskiedenistradisies het, word daar op intensiewe en stelselmatige wyse plaaslike en streekhistoriese nagevors. Engelse plaaslike geskiedskrywing (local history) het die loop van vyfonderdjaar ontwikkel van topografie, of plekkunde, waar Engeland as 'n enkele lokaliteit hanteer is, tot die skryf van parish histories wat oor die kleinste lokaliteite in Engeland handel. Christopher Saxton, 'n Tudor-kartograaf van die sestiende eeu, het in 1574 begin om individuele kaarte van Engelse en Walliese graafskappe op te trek. Die eerste nasionale atlas is in 1579 gepubliseer en word as 'n mylpaal in Engelse en Walliese kartografie beskou omdat dit die basis vir voornegentiende eeuse kartografie gevorm het. 'n Faksimilee daarvan is in 1930 uitgegee en die kaarte word steeds deur plaaslike geskiedskrywers gebruik, omdat dit besondere detail oor Engeland en Wallis bevat. Die volgende ontwikkeling was die skryf van graafskapsgeskiedenis (county history). Die Victoria history of the counties of England is 'n reeks wat oor Engelse plaaslike geskiedenis handel. Dit het in 1899 deur private inisiatief ontstaan en word sedert 1932 by die Institute of Historical Research van die Universiteit van Londen gehuisves. Die aanvanklike doel van hierdie reeks was om Engelse graafskapsgeskiedenis op 'n wetenskaplik wyse te skryf of te herskryf. Tans is die geskiedenis van Engelse graafskappe in verskillende stadiums van voltooiing. Dit blyk dat, ten spyte van Engeland se lang plaaslike geskiedenis tradisie, daar selfs nog in die een-en-twintigste eeu 'n behoefte aan die skryf van plaaslike geskiedenis bestaan. In Frankryk het plaaslike en streekgeskiedenis ook aandag geniet.
Volgens Saunders word Franse streekgeskiedenis veral vanuit 'n sosiale en ekonomiese invalshoek geskryf. Emmanuel Le Roy Ladurie se publikasie, *Les paysans du Languedoc*, wat in 1966 verskyn het, word beskou as 'n uitstaande historiese navorsingswerk wat 'n “totale” geskiedenis van die Middeleeuse Franse Provinsie Languedoc se kleinboer-gemeenskappe (peasant societies) gee. Dit maak onder andere van verskeie statistiese bronne soos grondbelasting (compoix) en tiendes (tithe) gebruik om die evolusie binne die landbougeskiedenis te weerspieël.

In 1977 verskyn John Day se Engelse vertaling *The peasants of Languedoc*. Die vertaler het die totaliteit van dié geskiedenis as volg beskryf; “His [Ladurie] works combines elements of historical geography, demography, and history; and of psychohistory in a single construction, baptized a great agrarian cycle.” Volgens hom blaas Ladurie lewe in ekonomiese statistiek met talle verwysings na voorbeelde van spesifieke families. Hy is ook van mening dat die publikasies 'n besonderse bydrae tot die Franse historiografie lever.

Die Amerikaanse plaaslike geskiedskrywers het van die toonaangewendste werke in dié genre gelewer. Dit is veral ten opsigte van koördinasie van navorsingsaktiwiteite en voorligting aan navorsers waar die VSA die res van die Westerse wêreld voor is. Deur middel van die American Association for State and Local History slaag hierdie geskiedskrywers daarin om individue, instansies en verenigings wat in die skryf van plaaslike geskiedenis belangstel byeen te bring.

'Een Insiggewende artikel wat in 1990 verskyn het, begin met 'n kort oorsig oor die stand van plaaslike en streekgeskiedenis in die Westerse en Suid-Afrikaanse historiografie. In hierdie artikel kom Saunders tot die gevolgtrekking:

> South African historiography has not yet been enriched by a series of substantial histories. In this, it lags far behind the historiography of countries such as the United States, Canada and France. In Britain so much smaller in size, a strong tradition of local history developed.

Daar het tot en met die laat 1970s 'n groot leemte in die Suid-Afrikaanse historiografie ten opsigte van akademies verantwoordbare plaaslike en streekgeskiedskrywing bestaan. Hierdie leemte is reeds in 1970 deur...
C.M. Bakkes, die destydse direkteur van die Instituut vir Geskiedenisnavorsing van die Raad vir Geesteswetenskaplike Navorsing (RGN), gedi- dentifiseer. In Junie 1970, in ’n verslag oor die stand van geskiedenis geskiedenisnavorsing in die RSA, merk hy op dat daar ’n behoefte aan ’n gesaghebbende werk van ensiklopediese omvang oor die geskiedenis van die Suid-Afrikaanse gehuggies, dorpe en stede bestaan.25 Een van die vernaamste redes vir hierdie toedrag van sake was dat die politieke benadering tot geskiedskrywing voorrang geniet het. Selfs toe die sogenaamde “people’s history” bedryf is, is klem steeds op politieke aspekte geplaas.

Plaaslike geskiedskrywing word egter vanaf die einde van die negentiende eeu in Suid-Afrika geskryf. Hierdie publikasies kan wissel van inligtingstukke tot opdragskrifte wat tydens die een of ander feesviering gepubliseer is.26 Baie van hierdie publikasies is tot ’n mate met ’n bepaalde leserspubliek in die oog geskryf en kan gevolglik eng wees. Hierdie geskrifte het egter ’n plek in die breë Suid-Afrikaanse geskiedskrywing. Hulle noodsaaklikheid binne die raamwerk van ’n bepaalde historiografie is deur van Jaarsveld as volg beskryf:

Mense wil graag weet wie hulle is, hoe hulle op ’n plek gekom het en hoe dit ontstaan en gegroei het. Daar is belangstelling in die ontwikkeling, vooruitgang en modernisering van ’n gemeenskap vanaf moeilike tot voorspoedige tye. Mense wil graag weet hoe plaaslike bestuur, landbou, handel, kerk en skool gegroei het. By ’n eeupees herdenking is ’n boek oor die ontstaan en vooruitgang van ’n dorp en sy omgewing uitses noodsaaklik.27

Al die publikasies voldoen egter nie aan die akademiese vereistes wat deur Saunders en ander Suid-Afrikaanse historici aan plaaslike geskiedenis gestel word nie. Baie van hierdie publikasies was, soos in die geval van die vroeë Westerse manuskrpie, antikwaries, en ’n blote opstapeling van feite. Die meeste Suid-Afrikaanse publikasies was wit-sentries, omdat die begin van ’n dorp se geskiedenis met die kom van die wit setlaars gelyk gestel is.

Ek wil net kortliks na ’n paar voorbeelde van plaaslike geskiedenisse verwys as potensiele bronne. Uit Piet Snyman, voorheen verbonde aan die RGN, se pen het vyf publikasies oor vier dorpe van die Noord-Kaap: Postmasburg, Olifantshoek, Daniëlskuil en Kuruman, verskyn28.
In 1988, met die viering van Pietermaritzburg se honderd-en-vyftigste bestaansjaar, is die gedenkskrif *Pietermaritzburg: 1838 - 1988, a new portrait of an African city*, uitgegee. Drie-en-seventig skrywers het bydraes gelewer en het gewissel van onderafdelings wat deur erkende historici geskryf is tot die herinneringe van inwoners van die stad. Die eindprodukt is deur die resensent A. de V. Minnaar as “a plotted history which deals with the myriad of influences which have shaped Pietermaritzburg into what it has become today” beskryf.

Tot en met die middel sewentigerjare het daar weinig stedelike geskiedskrywing verskyn. Die aanslag van die Nieu-Marxiste op Suid-Afrikaanse historiografie het tot gevolg gehad dat stede se geskiedenis aandag begin geniet het, maar die klem is hoofsaaklik op die twee industriële gebiede, die Witwatersrand en Kimberley, geplaas. Werkswinkels wat deur die Geskiedenisdepartemente van die Universiteite van die Witwatersrand en Kaapstad in die laat 1970's gehou is, het die leemte tot 'n mate beheer, en het gepoog:

> to offer to ordinary people an understanding of their historical predicament and to enable the historian to take a city and explain its present condition in terms of the forces that have made it.

### Soorte plaaslike geskiedenis

Sedertdien het heelwat streeksgeskiedenis bydraes uit die pen van verskeie streeks historia van histories Afrikaanse sowel as Engelse Universiteite versyn wat met groot vrug in plaaslike skole gebruik kan word. In die Suid-Afrikaanse historiografie kan daar twee tipes stedelike geskiedskrywing onderskei word. Die eerste is soms antikwaries en Eurosentries van aard en inhoudelik word die klem gewoonlik op die lewenswyse en kultuur van die stedelike elite geplaas. Die meeste reeds gepubliseerde stedelike geskiedenis is in hierdie styl geskryf. Die tweede benadering is meer analities en krities van aard en daar is ‘n klemverskuwing wat die inhoud betref. Die vraagstukke wat onder die loep geneem word, is beleid en bestuur en die invloed van hierdie belede op die minder gegoede gemeenskappe van ‘n stad. Die fokuspunt word die “gewone” mense, hulle leiers en hoe hulle in die stedelike gebiede probeer oorleef het. Ek is van mening dat die
tweede tipe hom veral leen om op skoolvlak aangepak te kan word.

’n Besondere publikasie wat bogenoemde leemte oorbrug, is *The people’s city: African life in Twentieth Century Durban*, wat onder redaksie van Paul Maylam en Ian Edwards van die Natalse Universiteit, die lig gesien het.35 Die publikasie bestaan uit elf essays waarin historici en sosioloë verskeie fasette van die alledaagse lewe in een van die belangrikste hawestede in Afrika beskryf. Vir die eerste keer is Durban se minder geegoede klasse se geskiedenis geboekstaaf en word die lief en leed van die stedelike swart werker verken. Die boek val in drie gedeeltes uiteen. In die eerste gedeeltes word die alledaagse lewe van Durban se mense nagespeur. Die eerste en tweede gedeelte word op ‘n treffende wyse met ‘n “hoofstuk” getiteld “The people’s city: An essay in pictures” geskei. Die tweede deel fokus op die werkers van die hawestad en daar word onder meer na werkersunies verwys. ‘n Besondere essay is R Posel se “Amahashi: The Ricksha-pullers of Durban,” wat ‘n kort oorsig en vertolking van die Ricksha-trekker se rol in die stad se publieke vervoerstelsels gee. Dit bevat onder meer ook statistieke oor die bedryf gedurende die tydperk 1895 tot 1985.36 Die derde en laaste gedeelte van die boek handel oor die omliggende swart woongebiede. ’n Getroue en sinvolle rekonstruksie van ’n plaaslike geskiedenis kan slegs plaasvind indien daar voldoende bronmateriaal beskikbaar is. Alvorens met die skryf van ’n plaaslike geskiedenis begin kan word, moet ondersoek ingestel word na die beskikbaarheid, toeganklikheid en bestuderenswaardigheid van die bronmateriaal. Indien die aanvanklike bronneverkenning gebrekkig is, sal dit ‘n oppervlakkige of selfs skewe geskiedvoorstelling tot gevolg hê.31 Omdat plaaslike geskiedenis ’n “totale” geskiedenis is, moet moet soveel moontlike primêre en sekondêre bronne gebruik word. Die aard van plaaslike geskiedenis leen homself tot ’n multi- en interdisiplinêre bronne-ondersoek en die inhoudsmateriaal van buurdissiplines sal met vrug gebruik kan word.

**Bronnemateriaal vir plaaslike geskiedenis**

Volgens die fokus op die bronmateriaal wat vir die skryf van plaaslike geskiedenis gebruik kan word, en watter van die materiaal in die praktyk werlik maklik bekobbaar is deur na beskikbare bronnemateriaal in Laudium te verwys.
Sekondêre bronne, soos indekse, bibliografieë, onderwerpwoordeboeke, ensiklopedieë, atlasses, nasionale en algemene geskiedenis publikasies beid raamwerke en riglyne waarbinne en waarvolgens plaaslike geskiedenis nagevors kan word. Jaarboeke, almanakke en kronologië bevat inligting ten opsigte van die hoofstroom politieke, sosiale en ekonomiese ontwikkeling waarbinne 'n plaaslike geskiedenis ont- 
vou.37 Bruikbare, spesifieke inligting aangaande 'n plek en sy inwon-
ers kan uit “histories-ongewone” bronne soos streeks- en dorpskaarte, dorpsplanne, plaaslike telefoongidse, skoolanaleboeke en sensusverslae verkry word.38 Vaktydskrif-artikels, gedenkskrifte, familiegeskiedenis en kommissieverslae bevat gewoonlik relevante en intressante in-
ligting.39 Bestaande plaaslike en streeks-geskiedenis kan dien as voor-
beeld hoe 'n spesifieke plaaslike geskiedenis aangepak kan word, maar ook die slaggate waarop 'n voornemende plaaslike historikus bedag moet wees, uitwys. Deur al bogenoemde as potensiële bronmateriaal te verwys, kan nuwe horisonne ten opsigte van insameling van in-
ligting ontsluit word, temas kan vanuit verskillende invalshoeke ontleed word en uiteindelik 'n vollediger geskiedenis, 'n “totale” geskiedenis, tot gevolg hê.40 ‘n Foto-geskiedenis van 'n bepaalde plek wat met vrug gebruik kan word. ‘n Voorbeeld van so 'n fotogeskiedenis is Simon's Town a post card history 1900 - 1913, waarin Simonstad se geskiedenis deur middel van poskaarte wat teen die einde van die negentiende eeu gedruk is, visueel weergegee word.41

Ongeïnterpreteerde tabelle en statistiek is gewoonlik mensverwydered, maar kry 'n nuwe aangesig sodra dit met die verloop van mense se lewens binne hulle plaaslike milieu in verband gebring word. Stuart Sprague, van Morehead State Universiteit in Kentucky in die VSA, skryf die vol-
gende aangaande hierdie spesifieke eienskap van plaaslike geskiedenis:

Local History has an immediacy that national history lacks. We can see it and interview people about it. For example, when we view the 1930's from the local level, the New Deal becomes human, concrete and understandable...42

Primêre bronnenavorsing is onontbeerlik vir die skryf van plaaslike geskiedenis. Amptelike argivale dokumnte rakende 'n spesifieke plek is 'n goeie vertrekpunt. Ander argivalia soos dagboeke, joernale, hofvers-
slae, akterekords, privaatversamelings en fotoalbums sal met groot vrug
Die meeste plaaslike historici is dit eens dat mondelinge oorlewering ’n belangrike en ryk bron vir enige plaaslike geskiedenis is. Hoskins wys daarop dat persoonlike herinnering (reminiscence) as bron nie gering geskat moet word nie. Hy waarsku egter terselfdertyd dat, omdat die menslike geheue feilbaar is, herinneringe teen bestaande geskrewedokumentasie getoets moet word. Mondelinge getuienis moet altyd aan dieselfde streng eksterne en interne kritiek as enige geskrewe bronnemateriaal onderwerp word om die betroubaarheid en geloofwaardigheid daarvan te bepaal. Wanneer die Suid-Afrikaanse voorkoloniale geskiedenis van ’n spesifieke plek nagevors word, is dit van groot belang dat die mondelinge oorlewering /oral evidence van die vroeë inwoners (Steen- en Ystertydperkmense) as verwysingsraamwerk gebruik moet word.

Vir na-kololoniale plaaslike geskiedenis die notules van dorps-, stads-, kerkersade, enige ander vereniging en sportorganisiese van ’n spesifieke plek is een van die die rykste bronne van inligting. ’n Bron soos kerkersadnotules gee die navorser ’n blik op die sosiale, kulturele ekonomiese toestande van ’n sekere sektor van ’n spesifieke plek, gedurende ’n bepaalde periode. Byvoorbeeld, as dit ekonomies goed gaan met ’n spesifieke groep van ’n gemeenskap, bv. die wit lidmate van die Nederduits Gereformeerde Kerk, word hierdie welvaart in die kerk se finansies weerspieël. Kry dieselfde groep egter geldelik swaar word dit weer in die kerk se finansies weerspieël.

Plaaslike publikasies, soos koerante en nuusbrieue, waarin op ’n daaglike of weeklikse basis verslag gedoen word oor sosiale, ekonomiese, kulturele en politieke fasette van ’n gemeenskap, tel onder van die rykste bronne vir plaaslike geskiedenis. Hierdie publikasies berig oor die gewoontes en die lief en leed van ’n bepaalde gemeenskap. Die ontwikkeling van plaaslike leiere- en sportfigure is gewoonlik breed-voeriger as die van nasionale koerante. Die ontwikkelingsgeskiedenis van ’n dorp of stad word in berigging oor die bou, verbetering en sloping van geboue en die ontwikkeling van infrastruktuur vasgevang. Die geskiedenis van sensimentaanpassings van ’n gemeenskap lê verskuil in naamsveranderinge van strate, en geboue, plekname. Plaaslike advertensies bevat inligting...
wat lig kan werp op die ekonomiese, sosiale en kulturele fasette van 'n bepaalde gemeenskap.46 Uit bogenoemde kan afgelei word dat plaaslike publikasies onontbeerlike bron vir die skryf van plaaslike geskiedenis. Plaaslike geskiedenis se potensiële bronmateriaal is veelvuldig en divers en het soveel “aangesigte” as die veelheid van sy moontlike bronmateriaal. In die artikel “The many faces of local history” beskryf Sprague hierdie eienskap as volg: “The subject range of local history is literally limited only by one’s curiosity and imagination.”47

Verwysings

1 R de Schryver, Historiografie vijfentwintig eeuwen geschiedschrijving van West-Europa, Historiografie, p. 353.
2 FA van Jaarsveld, Moderne geskiedskrywing opstelle oor ’n nuwe benadering tot geskiedenis. p. 1.
3 Ibid., pp. 9, 10 en 14.
4 R de Schryver, Historiografie, p. 353;
5 FA van Jaarsveld, Moderne geskiedskrywing, pp. en 11.
8 WG Hoskins, Local history in England, p. 2. (Vry vertaal.)
9 Ibid., p. 12.
16 Gebruik term parish history, gemeente geskiedenis nie dieselfde nie, daar bestaan ’n gelykwaardige term in Afrikaans nie.
Methodology

18 E-pos terugvoering J. Eccles op ’n navraag: Jacqui.Essles@sas.ac.uk, 28 Maart 2003.
24 Ibid., p. 131.
26 Voorbeelde van ’n geleentheidsskrif: Anon, Machadodorp Poskoetsfees 9 Januarie1952 i.v.m. die van Riebeeck-Fees (1952); H Borman Carolina 1886 -1986, 1986.
27 FA van Jaarsveld, “Aanbeveling”, M de Beer, “Keimoes en omgewing ’n kultuurhistoriese verkenning”.
30 V Bickford-Smith, *Ethnic pride and racial prejudice in Victorian Cape Town*, voetnota 4, voorbeeld van publikasie oor Witwatersrand en Kimberly word aangehaal, p. x.
31 Ibid., p. x. voetnota 8, aangehaal en verwys na, BM Stave, “In pursuit of urban history, conversations with myself and others: a view from the United States”; *South African Historical Journal*, (15), 1983, pp .10-33; p. xii.
C Jooste

Flaaslike geskiedenis as ‘n genre vir sekondêre geskiedenisonderrig met verwysings na spesifieke bronmateriaal beskikbaar in Laudium

35 P Maylam I Edwards (red.), *The people's city: African life in twentieth-century Durban*,


38 C Kammen, *On doing local history*, p. 43.


43 W Marwick, *Basic problems of writing history*, pp. 31-33.


46 MM Miller, "How to collect and write local history", Boekbespreking C.C. Eloff *Contree*, 3 Januarie 1978, pp. 31 en 32.

47 SS Sprague, "The many faces of local history", pp. 817-818.
The History educator
History Teaching, Learning and Junior Certificate (JC) Examination Results in Lesotho, 2000-2006: Implications for Teacher Education

Mary Ntabeni

University of Lesotho

Abstract

This paper addresses the status of History teaching and learning in Lesotho which is at its lowest ebb. Very few schools teach the subject and the poor Junior Certificate (JC) examination results exacerbate the situation. An analysis of the examiners’ comments in the last seven years points to poor and/or lack of essay writing skills among the candidates as one of the main reasons behind the high failure rate in JC History. In recognition of the situation’s implications for ‘quality’ teacher education, this study proposes (1) rigorous pre- and in-service training in the teaching of History essay writing, and (2) vigilant monitoring that ensures constant practice and dedicated delivery of the required skills by trainees to JC History learners in order to improve the examination results.

Introduction

In Lesotho, History is the most unpopular subject in the Social Science group that also includes Development Studies, Geography and Religious Knowledge. For example, the number of schools teaching History dwindled so much that in 2006 - out of 230 and more Lesotho Secondary and High Schools - only 17 were still offering the subject mainly because their Principals have a major in History. Several reasons have been advanced for this disastrous state of affairs but those commonly quoted have to do with policy making and the candidates’ poor examination results.

As could be expected, in Lesotho, as elsewhere in the world, the issue of examination results in general - and those of the core subjects in par-
ticular - is of great concern. In the case of the Lesotho History teachers, the real struggle is to attain – let alone maintain - good results in an atmosphere where, up to 2007, government was not promoting the subject enough, and parents continue to discourage their children from doing History because of the high failure rate in a subject they already regard as valueless. In other words, on the basis of the Junior Certificate (JC) examination results, it would seem that there is no ‘quality’ teaching and learning of History in Lesotho. This, in turn, leads to an urgent need to determine what the real problem or contributing factor is and how it can be solved.

The aim of this study, therefore, is to present the findings that are taken from the examiners’ commentary on the 2000-2003 JC History examination results and the performance patterns in 2004-2006. Based on those findings, the paper draws conclusions regarding the poor performance of JC History candidates, and makes recommendations for better results. The study’s main suggestion for improvement is the acquisition of cross-curricular essay writing skills in all History-teaching Secondary Schools and teacher-education institutions in Lesotho, namely, the National University of Lesotho (NUL) and Lesotho College of Education (LCE). In other words, this strategy of improving JC History results has to target both pre-and in-service teacher education.

Conceptual Framework

In recent years and at various forums, there has been an overwhelming quest for quality education for all and in all subjects. For example, members of the Lesotho History Teachers Association (LHTA) are convinced that History is being made a scapegoat of a situation where JC candidates consistently perform poorly in three out of the four core subjects: English, Mathematics and Science, the exception being Sesotho. Thus, the Association is determined to make sure that what the country lacks in the numbers of History candidates is compensated by effective History teaching that delivers impressive examination results. In other words, given a choice between quality and quantity in their subject, the teachers have openly declared - and passionately so - that they would rather have the former every time. This is why since 2000, the Associa-
tion has kept its own record of the History results for each school in order to monitor and maintain the signs of gradual improvement which has been quite phenomenal in some schools.

Sharing the sentiments of the LHTA’s strong desire for quality in school History, in 2004, the new Head of Language and Social Education (LASED) in the Faculty of Education at NUL called for a concerted effort by all teacher educators to help the Lesotho JC (and COSC) candidates to obtain good results. Similarly, the theme - ‘Quality Education and Research locally, regionally and internationally’ - of the biennial BoLeSwaNa (Botswana, Lesotho, Swaziland and Namibia) Symposium of Educational Research that was hosted by Namibia in July 2004 - started everybody thinking about and aiming for quality in the teaching and learning of the respective subjects, with special emphasis on initial teacher training.

In addition, the themes of both the forty-seventh (47th) session of the International Conference on Education and World Day of Teachers in 2004 called for the pursuit of quality education: ‘Quality Education for All Young People: Challenges, Trends and Priorities,’ and ‘Quality Teachers for Quality Education: Training for a Stronger Teaching Force’ respectively. What is even more interesting about the two themes is the act that Workshop #4 at the International Conference on Education was devoted to ‘Quality education and the role of teachers; the same idea that came to mind when the BoLeSwaNa theme was first announced. Coincidentally, in the foreword of the newly formulated Lesotho Policy on Teacher Education and Training (2005), it is stated that ‘The prime thesis of this policy framework is that the competency and professional dedication of the teacher and the trainer determine the ultimate quality of education provided.’ Then, in December 2006, at the 16th Conference of Commonwealth Education Ministers (16 CCEM) held in Cape Town, parallel groups of ministers, teachers and the youth reflected on the theme: ‘Access to Quality Education: For the Good of All.’

A dictionary definition of quality is ‘the standard of something when compared to others like it; how good or bad something is; a high standard or level….’ In the context of education, it is possible that there are as many definitions as there are authors on the subject, but the over-
all denominator in all of them will be the pursuit of and factors that fulfill what is good, better, best, or otherwise in the process of teaching and learning. Hawes and Stephens demonstrate best the complexity of defining quality education in their use of one very illuminating analogy called ‘the quality wheel’ which is meant to unpack quality teacher education. In that ‘wheel’ they identify people trainers as a very crucial factor in achieving quality education, and have accordingly devoted a whole chapter to this factor.6

Therefore, for the purposes of this study, the quest for quality is not only in Lesotho’s History education in general, but also in teacher training and History essay writing skills in particular.

**Methodology**

The study is a qualitative analysis of data collected from a seven-year documentation of JC History examination results, particularly the introductory section of the 2000-2006 pass lists compiled by the Examination Council of Lesotho (ECoL). The process involved combing the documents and highlighting in Table 1 below the various concerns that ECoL’s documents have identified as contributors to poor performance in school History over the years, while Table 2 highlights the patterns of performance. The paper then suggests the initiatives that NUL’s and LCE’s teacher educator(s) could implement at the initial and in-service teacher education levels in order to help the schools improve their poor History results.

**Data**

The tables below capture the core information taken from the pass lists of the ECoL from 2000 to 2006. The relevant section consists of (1) tabular information – especially Table 2; (2) comments and/or remarks made by the respective examination officers on the performance of the candidates in general and in subject groups; (3) subject specific remarks under the ‘Examiners’ Eye’ section, and (4) Performance patterns. Comments/remarks on performance in History appear under both the Social Sciences group and the ‘Examiners’ Eye’ but, due to inconsistencies explained below, the paper only reflects information from the latter section.
One observation to make regarding the ECoL tabular information described above is that, over the years, there have been inconsistencies in the titles used for Table 2 (in the pass lists) and its columns, possibly as a way of improving its presentation and content. Therefore, it is not possible to quote everything the tables of the seven years contain without creating confusion and/or even distorting the original information. Thus, for the purpose of this study, Table 1 (below) only reflects the comments and remarks from ‘The Examiners’ Eye’ section although at times it, too, was just as inconsistent and even incomplete in highlighting the year-by-year strong and weak points of performance.

**Table 1:** Comments/Remarks from an ‘Examiners’ respective on Lesotho JC History Results, 2000-2003

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Strengths</th>
<th>Weaknesses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>Improved candidates’ performance in History has been phenomenal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>History (Old) showed a general improvement in the quality of scores</td>
<td>even though there were fewer high scores that last year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>History (Alt.) was the most accessible and there were more very high scores compared to last year</td>
<td>but performance was not as good as last year in terms of general performance and high scores</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>History Trial had some good scores</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>In History, performance has dropped with 63% &amp; 72% of the candidates obtaining E and above in Trial (514) and Alternative (513) respectively. The greatest concern is that candidates still fail to write coherent well thought-out essays in response to questions but instead throw some points without any explanations. The tendency is to still to write without carefully selecting relevant, specific information in addressing the task at hand. This affects the performance adversely.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The performance this year is encouraging with the mean of 100.7. Let us strive for an even better performance next year.

Candidates showed weaknesses in relating the Current Affairs issues to their historical background and were, therefore, disadvantaged.

Another data-related observation to be mentioned is that from 2004 onwards, the ECoL pass lists have dropped the general and/or subject-specific ‘Examiners’ Eye’ section. Instead, the available tabular information consists of Table 1 titled ‘Patterns of Candidates’ Performance’ and and ‘Comparative Grade Analysis Report in All Subjects’ in Table 2. Further restructuring of the presentation of results is seen in the 2006 record that has the former and not the latter of the tables. Therefore, the whole situation has necessitated inclusion of another table in the present study to indicate performance percentages in the years 2004-2005 instead of comments and/or remarks for 2000-2003.

### Table 2  Performance patterns, 2004-2005

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>High Achievers with Grades A &amp; B</th>
<th>Mediocre Achievers with Grades C &amp; D</th>
<th>Low Achievers with Symbol E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>289 (25%)</td>
<td>458 (40%)</td>
<td>195 (17%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>282 (25%)</td>
<td>521 (45%)</td>
<td>183 (18%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

nounced, different interest groups in Lesotho usually speculate about the reason(s) for the high rate of success or failure in each level and per subject, especially in external examinations like the JC level. What Table 1 does, therefore, is to indicate that a close look at the ‘Examiners’ Eye’ section provides a more informed picture and the real reason(s) for the candidates’ good or poor performance.8

To start with, Table 1 clearly demonstrates that the History syllabus review was necessary and worthwhile because ‘Improved candidates’ performance in History has been phenomenal’. The remark refers to the first group of the JC candidates to write the Trial Syllabus in 2000. However, this is only part of the History examination results because there is no reference to the candidates who wrote the Old and Alternative syllabi which were being phased out at that time. All three syllabi are addressed in the 2001 remarks and performance in History was generally good because the one common weakness that is raised refers to lower or fewer pass scores. The year 2002 seems to have been very bad for JC History because there are no good points recorded in the results. In 2003, all JC History candidates wrote the same examination, and their performance was described as ‘encouraging’ although there was still a weakness of failing to connect the past and the present.

For the following years, Table 2 shows a slight improvement in the performance percentage patterns of the higher and lower achievers, and even better performance by the mediocre group in 2004-2005. Even without the Examiner’s Eye’ remarks, the argument here is that the performance patterns in Table 2 are also informative in their own way in that they were what they were because of more or less the same kinds of strengths and/or weaknesses reflected in the comments/remarks raised in years before 2004. At the same time, ECoL’s new format of reporting the results without any additional remarks by the ‘Examiner’s Eye’ will make it hard to detect the contributing factors to poor performance as exemplified in the 2004-2006 pass lists.

Main reason behind poor performance in JC History

On the basis of the information in the ‘weaknesses’ column of the table above, one can safely conclude that the overarching problem that seems
to have consistently contributed to the candidates’ poor performance in
the JC History examinations in 2000-2006 has been their (candidates’) lack of essay writing skills and other related aspects. The other side of this problem is that the History teachers seem to have been ineffective in their teaching in general. In particular, they failed to prepare the candidates in the acquisition of satisfactory essay writing skills by the time they sat for the examinations. What makes this problem even more crucial is the fact that the essay format is dictated by the JC History assessment format or the examination question papers.

One examiners’ remark in 2002 captures the overall essence and extent of the problem with the JC History results thus, ‘[T]he greatest concern is that candidates still fail to write coherent well thought-out essays in response to questions but instead throw some points without any explanations.’ When taken together with similar remarks that are phrased differently in the years before and after 2002, the statements point to one pervasive problem: the JC History candidates have difficulty writing/answering as required by the questions and expected by the examiners. Put differently, on the basis of the weaknesses highlighted in Table 1, in all seven years, there was neither effective (quality) History teaching nor effective (quality) learning of the subject.

One can even add that, for the problem to recur and affect the examination results as adversely as it did for so long, it must have been obvious during the course of the two years of study before the final (examination) year, but without being given satisfactory attention to rectify and even eradicate it. In fact, a cursory look at the ten years covered by the on-going larger study, and as confirmed by Seotsanyana, shows that the problem goes quite far back.9

The nature and extent of difficulties and barriers in History essay writing

The bolded operative words/phrases in the ‘weaknesses’ column of Table 1 constitute the breakdown and, therefore, specific nature and extent of the problem of History examination essay writing at JC level in Lesotho. The main concerns include the candidates’ failure, inability, inefficiency and/or weaknesses in fulfilling the requirements of the questions and/
or task(s) asked of them, and these have recurred over the years. These weaknesses seem to be universal because they correspond with Counsell’s five examples of pupils’ difficulties that are quoted by Haydn:

Many pupils find it difficult to:
- classify information
- organize information and deploy it for a specific purpose
- argue and analyse (as opposed to describe and narrate)
- support their arguments with appropriate detail
- distinguish between the general and the particular.\(^{10}\)

Similarly, in a section on ‘Students as writers of history’, Taylor and Young recognize Counsell’s contribution of research on this issue. They first start by identifying the narrative and non-narrative kinds of historical writing she has outlined. They then hone in on and discuss at length the statement that ‘[B]oth require similar technical know-how, but to develop this we have to break through several barriers,’\(^{11}\) thus covering several aspects that correspond with the ‘weaknesses’ in Table 1.

In addition to the universal difficulties or barriers mentioned above, Basotho JC learners struggle with keeping to the specified region and time in the questions. Above all, because they are Sesotho speakers first, they also face problems with English as a second language (or even third for the Nguni-speakers of Lesotho) as a medium of instruction and having to understand and answer questions in a foreign language under examination conditions. Granted that the programme gives the learners three years before they get to the final examination, but the results indicate that their essay writing skills have consistently let them down. The present paper points to Lesotho’s Teacher Education to address the problem.

**Essay writing in History teaching and learning**

The place and importance of essay writing in History is included in many – if not all - sources that deal with History teaching and learning, and is discussed at length in textbooks and study guides. For example, the History Study Guides for Grades 8-12 by Vorster begin with an introduction of Guidelines for both students and teachers,
and the section alerts the latter about what Historical skills to instill in the students. Essay writing is listed as the fourth among thirty-five skills, and one would regard the high ranking as an indication of the skill’s significance in History teaching and learning. 12

In concurrence, Mathews, et. al. state that, “Essay writing is a very necessary skill for history pupils as they need it for assignments, tests and examinations. But, it is probably one of the greatest weaknesses and a reason why many of them never achieve good marks in tests and examinations.”13 Similarly, in his discussion of the issue of writing as aspect of learning strategies and the use of language, Haydn declares that,

Of the range of activities, which take place in the learning of history, writing is one of the most important and, at the same time, the least popular among pupils. Yet, it is principally through their writing that their knowledge and understanding is usually assessed. Writing is an issue of some concern.14

These sources, and many others on History education, do not only indicate the main areas of concern but also give suggestions of how to deal with them. Therefore, it is important to understand the statements quoted above as clear indicators of a universal and immediate need for quality History [teacher] education with special emphasis on essay writing skills. The stated concerns also point to the fact that it is incumbent upon teacher educators to produce the kind of teachers that will guarantee quality [History] education by way of teaching essay writing skills properly in order to achieve good examination results, the kind of teacher that the Head of LASED wanted his staff members to produce.

Teacher education strategies in developing trainees’/pupils’ History essay writing skills

Knowing what the problem is and where it lies is one thing, but deciding on how to rectify it could be just as, if not more, problematic. In this paper, poor essay writing skills have been identified as the main problem leading to poor performance in JC History, and the title points to teacher [History] education as the target in the Lesotho higher edu-
cation system that should tackle the problem at hand.

**Target group**

Making teacher education bear the brunt of the remedial task needed in JC History is in recognition of and agreement with what Haydn regards as the critical and peculiar responsibility of History teachers in a quotation taken from one Aldrich: “[I]n the long run, success or failure in history teaching, perhaps more than in any other subject, depends on the ability and interest of the individual teacher”\(^{15}\) Therefore, for the purposes of the present study, the pursuit of quality History teaching and learning in Lesotho in order to improve JC History examination results requires regular in-service workshops for History teachers and improved pre-service training for student-teachers.

The above suggestion foresees a three-front approach where the Lesotho teacher training institutions, the History teaching schools and, at times, a combination of the two, are all geared to address the problem. The approach also points to a situation of intensifying what is already being done and also introducing new strategies to instill proper History essay writing skills during the training of the student-teachers at NUL and LCE, and also working closely with the History teachers in the schools. That way, when the newly qualified teachers join those on the ground, they will all be speaking one language of essay writing skills, and pulling together to improve the JC History examination results.

**Language competence**

In Table 1, the JC History examiners have raised a very strong concern regarding the candidates’ standard of English in general and essay writing in particular. Therefore, the first issue to consider and pay special attention to should be the mastery of the language and essay writing skills by both the student- and History teachers in the schools.

In the Lesotho education system, English language is the medium of instruction from the fourth year of primary schooling, and it is also one of the core (and usually most failed) subjects up to high school.\(^{16}\) Emphasis on English Language continues at NUL where the Common First
Year’s Communication Skills Course (CSS100: 8A/B) has to be passed before one can proceed to Third Year.17

Over the years, many student-teachers have had to repeat CSS100 at Second Year, thus making the English Language Education (LED) Unit worry about the possibility of language incompetence that may be passed on to the learners’ regular schooling and poor performance in English and other subjects’ examination results. These concerns have forced the lecturers in the Unit to lead the way in several language-related remedial strategies.

Therefore, not only do the lecturers concerned address the issues of effective teaching of English Language and Literature as a whole, they also look into the specific reasons behind the high failure rate of JC English. Second, in recognition of the fact that the problems run across the curriculum, the lecturers also liaise with their counterparts in other teaching subjects to supply them with subject-specific language examples for emphasis and/or problem eradication. Third, it has been suggested that all student-teachers who choose English Language as one of their teaching subjects should be forced to take Literature as well, more so because the two are taught as one subject at JC level. Fourth, members of the NUL Faculty of Education (FED) have long felt that the Communication Skills section in the Teaching Practice Assessment Tool should give credit to student-teachers who encourage pupils to ask and answer in full sentences.

At institutional level, there is a widespread call on the NUL campus - led by the English Department and FED - for cooperation in strict observation of the correct way of writing essays. The call also includes insistence on complete sentences, correct grammar and spelling in all courses, and the use of English during consultation with lecturers. For its part, the History Department has a reputation of being a very tough unit on campus mainly because of the staff members’ insistence on both subject-matter and proper language.18 Overall, the main idea is for everybody in the teaching profession to constantly harp on, immerse the students in and saturate them with correct English Language practices until these become part and parcel of their educational journey. For student-teachers, the language competence in their own stud-
ies should be guided to also translate into effective teaching/learning and good examination results.

**Subject-specific language use**

Closely related to the teachers’ mastery of the English language in general is how the language is used in the teaching and learning of the respective subjects, with particular emphasis on essay writing. In the case of History, Haydn has devoted a whole chapter to what he calls ‘Learning Strategies and the Use of Language in History’, and not only is it fascinating to read but it also presents examples that are easy to detect and implement in any History classroom.

As indicated in Table 1, the Examiners’ Eye has used a variety of expressions (and repeatedly so) to indicate the link between the weaknesses and poor performance in JC History examinations. Overall planning for and implementation of strategies to prepare student-teachers in History - and refresh their certified counterparts - in teaching essay writing skills should start with their assumed knowledge in the seven categories identified by Shulman. In other words, it will be necessary to determine and take into account what student- and History teachers bring into the task at hand that will facilitate and/or hinder success, and this will then be integrated into what they need to know in order to teach History essay writing skills effectively.

All discussions of essay writing skills underpin the understanding of the question as the first step of the process. What this means is that teachers should instill in the learners that every question or topic of an essay has instruction words which state what the question or topic wants the learner to do – the task at hand - and that there could be as many as such words as there are ways of asking or re/phrasing questions.

Usually, the same instructions words are used in both the general, specific and assessment objectives that appear at the beginning of a syllabus and as instructional objectives of a lesson. For example, the ‘user-friendly’ format of the Lesotho JC History syllabus has a column of one hundred and twenty-four (124) End of Level Objectives for the three Forms A, B, and C which are dominated by such words as ‘describe,
discuss, define, outline, explain, compare’, and the like. Therefore, in what one source has titled: ‘Teach about Question Meanings: How do I know what the question means?’; the teachers are advised how to help the learners understand the instruction words by defining the requirements of each one of them as opposed to the others. In fact, most, if not all, sources that discuss essay writing skills usually provide a glossary of the ‘question’ words to help establish a common understanding of what they mean.

What this means, therefore, is that History teachers and those still in training should maintain a constant familiarisation with the JC syllabus Assessment Objectives and Scheme as well as previous examination question papers, all of which contextualize the instruction words. For example, the assessment objectives22 read as follows:

By the end of the course [three years] candidates should be able to:

- Explain historical terminology and concepts.
- Recall, select and explain the relevant content.
- Analyse and interpret information or evidence to make coherent and logical decisions.
- Demonstrate knowledge of historical developments in Southern Africa and selected themes in the history of the World.
- Empathise with the past, and interpret events and decision-making of a particular period in the light of information and conditions prevailing at that time.

The assessment objectives are immediately followed by the Scheme of Assessment in four sections (A, B, C, and D) that constitute the three hour examination paper.23 The first two sections consist of multiple-choice and ballad questions respectively but the last two sections require the candidates to display essay writing skills thus:

**SECTION C: Short Essays**

Twelve (12) essay questions are asked in this section. Candidates are expected to answer in five to ten (5-10) lines any six (6) questions.

**SECTION D: Long Essays**
Six (6) essay questions are asked in this section. Candidates attempt two (2) essays of thirty (30) lines each.

A quick look at past JC History examination question papers confirmed that the format was followed to the letter, and that the instruction words would have been familiar to the candidates. However, as indicated in the ‘weaknesses’ column of Table 1, doing exactly as asked in the essay questions is problematic for the candidates.

Regular Use of Relevant and Appropriate Resources

There is a need for constant reference to and practice with History essay writing suggestions that are provided in History education texts, textbooks, and tons of essay writing guidelines posted on the internet. This activity should start with the very first History essay that that student-teachers write, and they should continue with the practice until it becomes a habit they carry beyond their graduation into their teaching career and professional development.

History Education Sources

As far as History education sources are concerned, one good example is the brief chapter by Mathews, et. al. in which they discuss the four steps of teaching essay writing, and their views represent many other teacher training sources that deal with this topic. The four steps include selection of a topic and working out a plan for the essay; discussion of the question with the pupils and guiding them to find out exactly what the question is asking; writing the requirements of the question on the board in point form, and extending (together with the pupils) the basic plan into a more detailed scheme for the essay. The chapter provides specific examples for all of the steps, thus making it a possible handout for all learners to use when they work on their own essays. 24

Regarding school textbooks, it is encouraging to see that they are now paired off with corresponding teachers’ guides which go hand-in-hand with methodology/pedagogy courses. For example, there is a section on ‘How to approach essay writing’ in the Teacher’s guides of the Oxford History textbooks series.25 That way, teachers can photocopy the relevant page(s) for students to refer to time and again in order to sharpen
their essay writing skills until these come to them naturally.

School Textbooks
In Lesotho, the Ministry of Education and Training (MOET) has embarked on a textbook loan scheme that ensures accessibility to textbooks for all learners up to JC and in all subjects, including History. By so doing, the Ministry is trying to eliminate one of the commonly-quoted culprits of quality education, that is, lack of textbooks, especially among the poor majority. Another positive outcome of the new policy is that it has attracted local authors to write more relevant textbooks in the respective subjects. The availability of textbooks and teachers’ guides means that teachers will have many options of learners’ activities based on the textbook. However, the Textbook Evaluation Tool that is used places more emphasis on teachers’ and learners’ activities than it does on writing skills. Therefore, it is for the History teachers in particular to write and/or insist on the use of textbooks that pay special attention to writing in History as discussed at length by Haydn.

For the learners, regular use of the textbooks should, in turn, resuscitate the diminished reading culture among the Basotho youth and also improve their writing skills. In fact, because History is a reading subject, there is a general belief among History (and even English Literature) teachers that lack of reading skills is one of the factors that lead to poor examination results. This view is confirmed by Harris and Foreman-Peck who identified and addressed the need for appropriate study skills by ‘focus[ing] mainly on reading strategies as I wished to make students more independent in this area.’ The effort was a great success but the ‘students still appeared to find problems extracting relevant information from books, which suggested they needed more help to create a tighter reading focus’ because ‘where students had a focus when reading they were able to pull out key ideas and pieces of information on topics, which helped them generate understanding and conviction in their views.’

Internet Resources
One other very informative example is on the internet and, although it is meant for students, it is just as useful for teachers. Not only does the author provide the general rules for writing an essay and the steps
of writing an effective essay, but he makes the process easy to follow by breaking it into twenty-one items. Each one is followed by succinct discussions of essay writing skills using History examples, and there are sample papers. Thus, once downloaded, this source, too, can be used by learners at their own convenience.

Workshops
Running workshops for History teachers usually banks on an aspect of assumed knowledge on the part of the participants regarding the issue of History as a discipline and a subject. The expectations also rely heavily on the understanding that when History teachers graduated, they had just as the student-teachers will have ‘perfected’ their own essay writing skills accordingly, and familiarized themselves with the relevant materials in school History essay writing so as to eliminate the problems described above. Most crucial in this respect is the teachers’ ability to impart the said skills to their pupils.

The LHTA’s annual workshops that used to be run by Lesotho’s MOET through its inspectorate unit were suspended for a long time, but they have now been resuscitated by a non-governmental organization, the TRResource Centre (TRC). At these workshops then and now, the tendency is to present content-loaded papers that barely touch on how to teach that content. There have also been very brief sessions that highlight some of the weaknesses behind the performance patterns, but hardly any time to pick and dwell on one problem such as lack of essay writing skills. The gatherings could also be used by the schools that consistently perform well in or improved their History examination results to share their secrets.

Action Research
In their preparation for the requirements of the JC examination, the Lesotho secondary schools that offer History usually introduce learners to writing History essays from the very first post-primary year of study. They also organise mock examinations in the year of the third year but, according to the results in Table 1 and 2, more concerted effort needs to be put into those practices. Therefore, one way of enriching participation in workshops and cutting down on the content papers would be to introduce action research presentations on essay writing activities.
and experiences in the teachers’ respective classrooms, and the learners’ performance in the mock examinations. The Lesotho History teachers could learn a lot from one very good example of a successful action research remedial effort that was conducted by Harris and Lorraine-Peck.

Overall, most of the strategies suggested above, with a few exceptions, are not new as such which then begs the question ‘why raise them at all?’ The main difference this time is that, in the dearth of History education research in Lesotho, this study is a call for a concerted effort and campaign by all stakeholders to refine and intensify the strategies already in place, and also combine the known with the new suggestions in the teaching and learning of History essay writing skills. This seems to be the main problem that hinders good performance in JC History, and the issue of rectifying the situation constitutes the crux of this study. Meanwhile, the larger study considers many more possible problems such as ‘out-of-field’ teaching, afternoon scheduling and the length of the examination question paper, Principals leaving most of the History teaching to junior staff, and the like.

Conclusion

Every year since 2000 (and before), the History examiners in Lesotho have stated their main concerns about the poor JC History examination results in the remarks that appear in introductory section of the pass lists. On the basis of those comments and remarks, this study has highlighted the overall problem as the candidates’ lack of essay writing skills, and also made suggestions about how to help rectify the situation in the context of teacher education. The idea is to instill proper History essay writing skills in the schools teach and in teacher education institutions. That knowledge is to be turned into a habit by following the suggested strategies so as to make the JC learners think about the skills and practise them constantly during the three year continuous assessment in preparation for examination purposes.

References

1 This is a revised version of a paper that appears in the Proceedings of the South African Society of History Teaching Conference (SASHT) held in Durban on
The class ranking of the JC examination results includes only two social science subjects and, for years now, whenever the schools felt the need to drop a social science subject, History was usually the first to go.

In the Lesotho Education system, the first three post-primary years constitute Secondary or Junior Certificate (JC) level at the end of which candidates write a final examination. They then proceed into the next two years of High School at the end of which they write the Cambridge Overseas School Certificate (COSC) examination which is a requirement for entry into University.

Starting in 2007, the policy is that all new secondary schools that were built to accommodate the influx of the Free Primary Education school leavers should teach History.

At lot of times, parents and learners blame the teachers for poor results but when their children pass, the parents attribute the success to some supposedly 'brilliant' member of the family. So, the teachers never win!


LW Vorster, History of South Africa, Grade 12 (Standard 10), Guidelines Study Aids (Bramley: Guidelines (PTY) LTD, 1996).


Haydn, et.al., Learning to Teach, p. 83.
Haydn, et.al., *Learning to Teach*, p. 9.

For example, the 1998 COSC English Language results were so bad that NUL Senate had to deliberate the issue at length and come up with a strategy to insure the regular intake of students into First Year.

The First Year course is year-long and, among the failures, some students get a mark that qualifies them for two chances to supplement at Second Year (CSS298 3A/ and CSS299 3/B) while others have to repeat it.

At the same time, there have been a few student-teachers in History who have thanked their lecturers for patiently but constantly taking them through the sentence, paragraph, outline and essay writing sequence which they found very useful and effective in their own teaching.

Haydn, et.al., *Learning to Teach*, pp. 69-74.

These are subject-matter or content, general pedagogical, pedagogical content, curricular, contextual, educative knowledge and knowledge of learners and learning. They are succinctly summarized by Tony Taylor and Carmel Young, *Making History: A Guide for Teaching and Learning History in Australian Schools* (Monash University, Australia, 2003).

See *Junior Certificate History Syllabus 2004* (National Curriculum Development Centre, Ministry of Education and Training, Maseru, Lesotho). All primary and secondary school syllabuses of all subjects have the same format.


The 2006/2007 Third Year History student-teachers in the ‘History for the High School Teacher’ course are comparing the JC History syllabus and examination format as part of their pedagogical/content (subject-matter) knowledge (PCK) activity in anticipation of and contribution to the next syllabus review.

Mathews, et.al., *Discover History*, pp. 71-73.

Vorster, *In Search of History*.

Granted, members of the History Department have published in their respective fields of interest, including a joint textbook on the History of Lesotho. However, up to now, none of them have shown interest in linking their work with the schools. Similarly, the History teacher educators in LASED have not put to much use (in terms of publication) a collection of curriculum-related extended essays (dating to the early 1990s) and, thereafter, Action Research projects of their student teachers. Thus, in the last ten years, only two extensive pieces of research have been produced by MM Khoiti, “A critical evaluation of the Lesotho Junior Certificate Alternative history syllabus” (unpublished M.A. Ed. Dissertation, National University of Lesotho, 2000) and MMC Seotsanyana, “Factors affecting the teaching and learning of history in the Lesotho High Schools” (unpublished M.A. Ed. dissertation, National University of Lesotho, 1996).
27 R Harris and I. Foreman-Peck, “Learning to Teach History Writing: discovering what works” Educational Action Research, Volume 9 (Number 1, 2001), p. 105. Although the publication is co-authored by a student and his supervisor, they have maintained the use of the first person in the original action research project.


29 Given the limited access to computers and/or the internet in the Lesotho schools, downloading is open more to student-teachers than it is to History teachers. NUL and LCE will need to alert their trainees to maximize their opportunities in collecting all the relevant materials for future use in their careers.

30 In some countries like the USA, the prevalence of ‘out-of-field’ teaching has been raised as responsible for the learners’ poor knowledge/performance in history. See Diane Ravitch, ‘The Educational Backgrounds of History Teachers’ in Peter N. Stearns, et. al (eds.), Knowing, Teaching, and Learning History: National and International Perspectives (New York: New York University Press, 2000), 143-155
THE HIGH STAKES OF REMEMBERING THE PAST IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN HISTORY & SOCIAL SCIENCES CLASSROOM: CREATING A WAY FORWARD FOR WHITE STAFF & STUDENTS

James R. Wilson
Kgolagano College of Theological Education
Botswana

Introduction

At a recent educational conference in South Africa, a white history teacher working in an overwhelming white school lamented, “Our students are absolutely bored with learning about the Apartheid era. Isn’t it about time to move on and focus on those things less divisive?” That comment got this author thinking—Should history teachers allow “old dogs to lie” is their coverage of key historical events of South Africa? Should we be made to recall images, myths and stories of a time period known to be turbulent and divisive? Is there such a thing a trouble-free classroom or a neutral history syllabi?

Negative historical implications of whiteness in South African Society

Race, ethnicity and class have been perennial sources of conflict in South African society since the nation’s inception. Nonetheless, during the Apartheid era those tensions were both heightened and accentuated as whites attempted to pursue and enforce their definition of the good life with a comprehensive ethnic and exclusivist approach with State support. That is to say, the rule of law became a means of entrenching & preserving the rights of whites. By virtue of being a public sphere—South African education was used by the ruling regime to support and legitimate its cultural, social and economic interests and to limit the aspirations of all other ethnic and racial groups. Hegemony and educational ideology became inseparable. Education during the “apartheid era” fostered an environment of imposition, elitism and sustained gross
religious, political, cultural and economic power in the hands of a few (see Njobe 1990). As a politically charged milieu, cultural groups were made to compete for the recognition and the securement of fundamental human rights. It was a hegemonic knowledge as articulated by Antonio Gramsci, in support of the ruling grouping (see Hall 1986).

...it supports conformity to the status quo. This knowledge is transmitted through families, schools, churches, businesses, the media, government, and the medical and legal professions. Dominant groups with power in these institutions create discourses, including myths, symbols, language patterns, and knowledge through which we understand ourselves as "property" - that is, hierarchically-classed, raced, and gendered persons. They also shape cultural practices, such as the work ethic and sexual behavior, further regulating fundamental aspects of our lives (Hobgood 2000:11).

In particular, history as taught in the nation’s schools, became ideologically stitched into the fabric of Apartheid and used to reinforce a politics of domination by SOME and the subjugation of OTHERS. The history syllabus, for the vast majority in South Africans was non-representative, offensive, discreditable and corrupt...

Schools became contested terrain. Thus, with the fall of the apartheid regime in 1994, educational institutions, as public entities, were made to re-examine, re-negotiate and re-validate their continued existence. It spurred many of them to develop more democratic public philosophies under the new dispensation. In particular, the current government of South Africa by giving voice to the differing configurations of culture, power and knowledge in the public sphere, it has challenged in many cases, traditionally white educational institutions to come to terms with the inequalities, power dynamics and human suffering rooted in such institutions as well as to learn ways to live and perceive of themselves as one amongst many, i.e. in a rainbow nation with multiple cultural codes, experiences and languages. This call for self-examination and critical consciousness has been reflected in the government’s efforts at transforming the national education syllabus, inclusive of history.
Hopes & expectations under the new dispensation

As might be expected, many of South Africa’s stakeholders brought to the table of this new democracy a myriad of hopes and expectations. So much so, in fact, that much of it sound like a mantra of clichés- “In the new South Africa...” “Twelve years into freedom...”; “With the coming of majority rule...”; “With the fall of the apartheid regime...”; “In light of the 50th anniversary of the women’s march to the Union Buildings...”; “30 years after the June 16th unarmed student uprising...”; “Ten years after the adoption of a new Constitution enshrining human-rights-orientated guarantees...”; “With the country’s ratification of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination in 1999 (see Report on a Study by the SAHRC, February 1999)...”

These hopes and expectations were also specifically directed towards its educational system- “With the adoption of Section 29 (1) of the South African constitution that declares- “everyone has the right to basic education...”; “With the enactment of the South African Schools Act of 1996 that called for a new national educational system to redress the injustices created under the apartheid regime...”; “In response to the hearings of the Right to Basic Education in 2005 by the South African Human Rights Commission...”

Social realities in the new South Africa

Conditions become “social problems” when society decides that something should be done about them (Kornblum & Julian 1974:1).

Alongside the hopes and expectations of South Africa’s stakeholders, are the perennial social problems that challenge the long term viability of this non-racial, rainbow nation.

Nearly half of the population of South Africa live in poverty, “with 22 million people described as ‘desperate’ and 5.3 million South African children...suffering from hunger” (Pilger:2006); 90 percent of privately owned land “has been and is still in the hands of whites” (Cose 1997:221), and the number of landless black farmers and their families
have been evicted from farms continues to escalate (see Pilger 2006); sporadic eruptions of overt prejudice and racism continue to manifest themselves. (See Powell 2006) and poverty also continues to impact on education in terms of who can and who cannot pay school fees, as well as the hidden costs of uniforms, and transport. (see Cembi 2006).

**Race as a regenerating force**

Race does not proceed unchanged through time and space, but constructs and reconstructs itself, resistant to attempts both to be pinned down and eliminated. Racial identities cannot be bounded and framed, for they exceed, engulf, and mock the borders in which we attempt to encase them. “Racism” does not exist in the singular, as a monolithic, all-encompassing system of domination (Dolby 2001:115).

It is the belief of this author that racism as a form of hegemony is a constantly mutating and regenerating social force, much like postoperative staph infections (Staphylococcus aureus). It is both extremely resilient and a “shape shifter.” It is a process that continuously finds new ways of appropriating power; it defines and delimits what is legitimate; it encourages the unwitting consent of others to domination; it de-emphasizes a shared understanding of humanness; and it fails to recognize and appreciate diversity, self-reflection and cooperation in the classroom. I argue that in order to effectively respond to racism as a form of hegemony in the classroom, students as well as educators need to discover and embrace non-hegemonic paradigms, which call for both personal and structural transformation as well as a fresh discernment regarding diversity. Racism is intimately connected to hegemonic action.

**Hegemony**

Hegemony is defined in this paper as “the politics of domination”. At varying levels of interaction, hegemony can be characterized by such issues as unjust economic relations, biased racial relations, oppressive political relations, patriarchal gender relations and/or hierarchal power relations. Hegemony is also seen as being historic specific and as a constantly mutating phenomena.
Antonio Gramsci (20th century Italian Marxist) defined “hegemonic knowledge” as knowledge developed by dominant groups in a society to further their own monopolization of power (Hobgood 2000:11). It is the negative historical implication of whiteness which has underpinned the hubris of dominance in South Africa. It is a knowledge so entrenched in the national culture that families, schools, churches, businesses and the media support it without question. It is knowledge that perpetuates the subjugation of some people and justifies the domination by yet others, through the misinformation of hegemonic myths, symbols, language, patterns, and knowledge that regulates and shapes people’s lives. In such an environment, the abnormal becomes normal.

“When a people truly believe it is natural that some should “have” while others “do” that one should rule while another simply follows, it is easy to see how systematic oppression of whole peoples could be legitimated and even glorified as the work of God in some instances. The process of which persons who are hierarchically defined as appropriate recipients of oppression become agents of this very oppression is commonly encompassed by the term “hegemony” (Gonzalez 1998:227).

Thus, hegemony when allowed to exist unchallenged, ultimately generates suffering and pain in defense of the status quo.

An Apartheid mindset in a post-apartheid world

Reluctance To Change

One of things that this author discovered while living in Lesotho, a country completely surrounded by South Africa, is how intertwined the lives of the people are on both sides of the border. The residents of both Maseru and Ladybrand frequently cross back and forth between countries in order to shop, pay bills, and to attend school.

On one particular occasion, this author crossed over to South Africa with the hope of paying a medical bill and having lunch at a certain restaurant in Ladybrand. However, on the day concerned, I noticed that certain establishments on the South African side were opened while yet others were closed. Coming in contact with a white shopkeeper whose doors were open, this author asked as to what was happening. And he
responded by saying, “They are having one of their holidays.” He then rolled his eyes as a sign of disapproval. Ndabazandile (2006) having visited several white owned pubs and eating establishments across the country, found a similar attitude amongst the people encountered. That is to say, their televisions were solely fixed on rugby and English soccer and never on South African football, regardless of who might be in the room. Thabo Mbeki once said that South Africa is a country of two nations, one is white and rich, the other is black and poor (Khumalo 2003).

“While many government regulations have been repealed, there exists a mindset in certain individuals in our society that still relegate the interests of the majority to the bottom of the heap” (Ndabazandile 2006).

In South Africa, blacks are the majority. But that doesn’t make them dominant. (Paulose 1986) in discussing the issue of what constitutes a minority in a pluralistic society, indicates that a minority is not those who are small in number, but those who are powerless and voiceless. “Though whites make up roughly 13 percent of the population, they earn more than 60 percent of the nation’s total income” (Cose 1997:221).

Whites, as a dominating force in society regularly propagate certain hegemonic myths that need to be addressed. According to Ndebele (1998: 26), these acts oftentimes inflict invisible wounds more lethal than those which are visible; condescending platitudes capable of massacring countless people of color. Bartolome & Macedo (1997) have observed that whites oftentimes make use of historical amnesia, selectively remembering what serves their own interest.

Examining legitimizing myths in the classroom

According to Trompenaars (1994),

Identifying systemic biases that disadvantage individuals and groups is often difficult for students, particularly those who have never experienced discrimination....Students recognize that although stereotypes are a normal human response to processing information, they are often inaccurate.

Trompenaars challenges teachers to empower students; to help them to
identify and come to terms with their own prejudices, including race. From a South African context, teachers of the social sciences and history might want to address some of the commonly held “myths” propagated amongst white students and teachers.

**Myth No. 1: Color-blindness & racial innocence**

...any white person who says they’re not a racist—by that I mean someone whose perceptions are not coloured by race—is not being honest with themselves (Seary 2006).

One white educator working in a multicultural school setting once professed to this author, “When children come into my classroom, I don’t see Africans or a Whites or Chinese; I just see children. I treat them all the same.” The primary point being deducted from that conversation is—“I am not a racist” and “I am not prejudiced.” Nonetheless, according to (Thompson 1998) one of the biggest hindrances towards true racial integration in the classroom is the inability by teachers, and in particular white teachers to talk about or to acknowledge the issue of race. Thompson calls such conversations “color talk.” In an effort to be respectful to cultural diversity, such teachers consciously choose to be silent. Such actions, however, according to Thompson, often mask the very ignorance and discomfort that the teacher concerned has regarding questions of race. She calls all such attempts to be “intentionally” color-blind while interacting with students as an affront to the unique racial, ethnic and cultural composition of the students as well as the individual teacher concerned. It is a defense mechanism for protecting our identities from pain.

rationalization about ourselves, our acts, or our motivations is another one of the more common defense mechanisms. Compared with other defensive mechanisms, rationalizing is a relatively mild way of protecting our identities from pain. To rationalize (in the sense we are using it here) means to give a logical but false and self-serving explanation for something. (O’Connell, A & V 1980:109)

(Govender 2006) reported that a headmaster in Mpumalanga recently warned one of his teachers “not to teach about the apartheid era because it was over….he also did not approve of photographs, which showed a...
policeman checking the passes of black people..."

“Racism” is always a part of unfinished business. As educators, we need to acknowledge and work through the negative historical implications of “whiteness”, which has undermined the hubris of dominance in South Africa and which continues to interact with all other forms of socialisation. According to (Terrblanche 2002:443), “A fundamental change in the way in which South Africans view fellow compatriots is therefore a sine qua non for building a better South Africa.”

Myth No. 2: “You Can’t Blame Me...I Didn’t Do It”

Many whites (especially younger people) are inclined to say that they themselves did nothing wrong, and can therefore should not be blamed for the effects of white domination and apartheid. However, they clearly do not understand the systemic character of colonialism, segregation, and apartheid, and their collective responsibility for what has happened. (Terrblanche 2002:5).

Whether we admit it or not, nearly everything that is owned and which benefits those in white South Africa is contaminated according to (Terrblanche 2002).

The moral responsibility of whites is further complicated by their relative isolation from other communities. Ignorance, arrogance and isolation protect their unearned benefits while keeping them in conformity to the status quo (Hobgood 2000:10).

Some in the white community, have grumbled that since the election of the ANC, they are becoming victims of “reverse discrimination” as that government concentrates its efforts of uplifting formerly disadvantaged communities through varying policies of affirmative action. (See Seary 2006)

It’s understandable, given all the philosophical, constitutional, and even moral problems with affirmative action, that any number of people would prefer simply to see it (and anything reminiscent of it) disappear. As it is true of any lesser evil, affirmative action is not a beautiful thing to gaze upon, and, to make matters worse, it reminds us of some unpleasant and ugly things about ourselves. Nonetheless... contemplate throwing out
much of what has gone under the name of affirmative action, we must also seriously contemplate whether we are prepared to pay the long-term price of replacing a bad system with one that- in insisting that we blind ourselves to...racial reality- is incalculably worse (Cose 1997:137).

Cose also admits that affirmative action has multiple meanings, depending on the political and racial make-up of the people addressing the issue. “It can mean everything from quota programs for supposed incompetents to extending a hand to eminently qualified people previously held back by bias” (Cose 1997:96-99). Although he indicates that it is not the best solution to put forward, it is still the best possible way forward, under the circumstances. He equates it to paying taxes. No one in their right mind would say that they are unequivocally in favor of paying taxes. But the alternative to paying taxes is far worse; it is the best available alternative at the moment; it is a lesser evil. In a society where everything is equitable; “a place of perfect knowledge, perfect competition, and perfect access to information and opportunity, all of which ensure that society will function in a perfectly bias-free way” (Cose 1997:96-99), in such a society, perhaps, there would no need for such a thing as affirmative action.

The “how to” of teaching History and social sciences

As mentioned earlier in this paper, classrooms are not trouble-free. As history teachers we should expect to become adept with and discuss issues of discomfort, tension and conflict that might arise among our students, including the changing of a community’s name or the name of an institution or a major road throughout South Africa. Nonetheless, any discussion in the classroom should ultimately lead towards the empowerment and a constructive way forward for students- including an understanding of the legitimate desire to Africanize and de-colonize of a nation’s public assets. Such a discussion might also include an examination as to why other countries have done likewise; as was the case of India changing a city’s name from Bombay to Mumbai. Although this may be hard for teachers with little or no experience with issues of diversity, the key might be to work towards rejecting whatever residuals of prejudice that still lingers, i.e (Scapp 2003:159):
.....the sexism that still undermines girls and women, the classism that still harms so many children and their parents, the homophobia that still renders many in our democracy into second-class citizens, and the institutional barriers that still pose unjust obstacles to those physically challenged trying to lead good lives....

**Taking responsibility for the beliefs that we absorb**

An ethical agenda for people in dominant social locations includes taking responsibility for the beliefs we absorb in an uncritical way and unexamined way. These beliefs promote and extend systems of unearned and unshared privilege. An ethical agenda includes taking responsibility for the ways we become (often unwitting) conduits for passing these systems on to others, reproducing and intensifying the monopolization of social power Hobgood (2000:31)

Hobgood believes that the fundamental role of education under such conditions is to “break out of the socially constructed identities placed on us by those who dominate. According to Hobgood, we need to question our roles in the family, the neighborhood, the church, the workplace as well as the political system. It means disengaging ourselves from what Paulo Freire rightly described as the “banking model of education,” where teachers serve as experts and pour knowledge into the empty heads of the students. In return, the student gives the information back to the teacher in an unadulterated form. Nonetheless, we need to do more as educators than merely make our students critical thinkers. We need to work towards the transformation of students individually and collectively. (Giroux 1992:79) broadens the role of education beyond a conscious raising exercise or the process of raising questions in an effort to prick their conscience. According to him, students need to be commit themselves to transformative action. A transformation of the oppressive dimensions of schooling must be preceded by a transformation of the language we use to speak about, and therefore comprehend, interpret, and criticize the process and purpose of schooling (McLaren 1997:28)

All knowledge, curriculum, institutional structures, issues of individuality and solidarity, as well as leadership styles in education are areas of dispute. Educators in such social situations, do not stand in isolation
to the presence of domination and exploitation present in society as a whole (Scapp 2003:16):

If teachers are going to be held in any way responsible for the moral character of their students, then teachers will need to confront their own ethical positions and be clear about the connections between their teaching and the values they are advocating or are being asked to promote.

For many whites in South African society, they are “deeply scared-scared of violence. Of crime, of being squeezed out of a job by affirmative action and, above all, scared of the sheer brute power of African nationalism (Johnson 1996:134-137).

Those fears and concerns exert a powerful influence on the types of interaction that white educators have with their students in the classroom. Thus, white educators having been raised and steeped in a hegemonic environment, need to look elsewhere for educational strategies that will nurture an ethos of inclusiveness and critical pluralism.

**Moving beyond political correctness: being politically active**

“We need to be more than politically correct in addressing issues in the classroom in the simplistic and cynical tone that the term has come to engender, but rather to become “personally conscious” in our roles as concerned white educators committed to social healing and positive change....(Nieto 1999:208)

Most of us as teachers are survivors- both inside and outside the classroom. We carefully survey the landscape around us, determine what it takes to live “trouble-free” and then put a plan into action. It is often a case of learning to “tolerate” those different from ourselves in a less than inclusive way. It does not involve being accessible or communicative. The teaching of the social sciences and history, needs to develop a pedagogy which is something beyond being politically correct; We are called to contribute in a political and pro-active political way to inter-ethnic understanding (Nieto 1999:210):

What is needed, then, is committed and purposeful political activity, both within the classroom and outside of it, to ensure that the stated ideals of education in a democratic society are realized.
According to this author, we should not imagine “oppression” as someone else’s problem. That is to say, we must be willing to confront and recognize that we too are often part of the problem. Our racism, our sexual prejudices, our class anxieties, our empowered desires that we must confront and resist have contributed to hegemony in their own way. Paulo Freire identified certain key factors that are needed by any educator who is to be involved in the struggle for liberation. These factors are “the ability to perceive and clarify reality in an oppressive and dehumanizing situation...[and] the ability to arrive at an effective action to change the situation as part of a pedagogical praxis” (Goba 1988:16). Educators, as facilitators of social change, are obliged to work for the removal all artificial barriers which come to be erected as a result of racial, social, ethnic, sexist and political prejudice: racism, classism, sexism and any other “ism” that keeps people from living empowered lives (Tutu 1999:279):

True forgiveness deals with the past, all of the past, to make the future possible. We cannot go on nursing grudges even voraciously for those who cannot speak for themselves and longer. We have to accept that what we do we do for generations past, present, and yet to come. This is what makes a community a community or a people a people- for better or for worse

According (Terrblanche 2002) if whites do not critically re-evaluate their past, they cannot expect the victims of colonialism to accept them as trustworthy companions in building a common future. Since 1994 South Africans- especially whites- have had the opportunity to look at the country’s history from a totally new perspective, and many have taken up this challenge. That is to say, we cannot build the new epoch without a clear understanding of the old (Terrblanche 2002:4).

Dialoguing in the classroom and beyond

Fine, Weis & Powell (1997) observed that merely by including youth or teachers of different races and ethnicities in the same school does not in itself produce an environment that respects diversity. Chomsky makes a strong case for the use of dialogue and the need to bring people together, i.e (Chomsky 2001:28):
Part of the genius of the system of domination and control is to separate people from one another so that it doesn’t happen. As long as we can’t consult our neighbors, we’ll believe that there are good times. It is important to make sure that people don’t consult their neighbors. If they’re together, they’ll start having thoughts, interchanging them and learning about them.

If education is to be an effective agent in a multicultural society, it must make an effort to develop a conceptual map of pluralism as well as an understanding of human differences. With an education steeped in dialogue, there is no need to institutionalize a particular cultural reality, ethnocentric approach or cultural vision. Rather, it calls for the acceptance of many centers, whereby both the dominant as well as the minority cultures are enriched by the spiritual, moral and aesthetic values of the other.

South Africa cannot restore what it is still in the process of establishing. A positive change in race relations cannot come about in one quick and effortless motion. Rather, it will most probably be a slow and pain-staking endeavor, involving a long term commitment to race relations. It also implies the need of each teacher to realign their own racial constructs or perceptions of humankind as well as to work towards the shaping of all those people fall under their sphere of influence. Paulo Freire has said, “...dialogue is a kind of necessary posture to the extent that humans have become and are more critically communicative beings” (Shor & Freire, 1987:98). It is a call to be more open.

Conclusion

Plato of ancient Greece apparently thought that when a person knows what is good, the person would automatically do good. However, mankind now knows from experience that a gap tends to exist between knowing what should be done to be good and the actual behavioral response of doing good. That is, people who know good often do not do good. (Njobe, 1990:1)

According to Wilson (2003) educators have two choices as to how they will teach. One is described as “surface teaching” and the other as “deep teaching.” The first focuses primarily on the sharing of information as
“surface teaching;” it covers the topics and subject areas, but it often-times fail to uncover the essence, or deeper meanings of what is being covered. The other kind of teaching- deep teaching”- reaches below the surface of information and involves the sharing and igniting of ideas. As teachers of Social Studies and History the use of “deep teaching;” can help us to engaged students in a curriculum”which is constructive and which grows and expands through the contributions of all in a multi-cultural classroom. In its application to the teaching of history, Giroux (Giroux 1991:501-519) comments:

We don't need to treat history as a closed, singular narrative that simply has to be revered and memorised. Educating for difference, democracy and ethical responsibility is not about enshrining reverence in the service of creating passive citizens. It is about providing students with the knowledge, capacities and opportunities to be noisy, irreverent and vibrant.

Sarah Joseph in her book, Mapping Multiculturalism, places the threat of hegemony in the classroom as not coming from the threat of people who have a myopic understanding of the world...but from ideologies in a society which would support a politics of difference....societies can only be multicultural if individuals are multicultural. A safeguard of tolerance in a multicultural society is a multicultural sense of identity for individuals (Joseph 2002:170):

Education, if it is doing its job, is preparing students to deal with multiple issues- race, class, gender and all other kinds of oppression in society, and to be effective agents of change (Tutu 1999:274):

Reconciliation is going to have to be the concern of every South African. It has to be a national project to which all earnestly strive to make their particular contribution- by learning the language and culture of others; by being willing to make amends; by refusing to deal in stereotypes by making racial and other jokes that ridicule a particular group; by contributing to a culture of respect for human rights, and seeking to enhance tolerance- with zero tolerance for intolerance; by working for a more inclusive society where most, if not all, can feel they belong- that they are insiders and not aliens and strangers on the outside, relegated to the edges of society

The time has come to collectively recall and debate the past and pre-
prepare for the future- by commemorating of the 50th anniversary of the women’s march to the Union Buildings, 30th anniversary of the student uprising in Soweto; for the changing a community’s name from Pretoria to Tshwane and in becoming familiar with South Africa’s Constitution.

References


JOSEPH, J (2002) “Do Multicultural individuals require a multicultural state” in Deb,


NDABAZNDILE, S (2006) “The more things change, the more they stay the same: Opinion,” *Saturday Star*, 15 April, 14


SEARY, B (2006) “Smug whites need to acknowledge racism: My view”, *The Star*, 10 June, 14


HOW RELEVANT IS THE HISTORY TEACHER IN THE 21ST CENTURY ???

Patrick McMahon
Crawford College, Pretoria

Sometimes one wonders whether or not the history teacher is a dying species. Is the history teacher about to go the same way as the dodo – or more worryingly, the same way as the Latin teacher of some 30 years ago.

Well, here are some worrying signs that might indicate that this is the case!

- Are the history lessons given by this teacher difficult to understand?

- Are the notes handed out by the teacher of any use? Are they obscure and problematic? Are they from some old book studied by the teacher?

- What is the relevance of the topic to the students? Is the teacher making it relevant?

- Is punishment involved for not following what is happening?

In other words……is the lesson that is being given irrelevant and boring to the learner or is it a meaningful and stimulating experience? To what extent is the teacher connecting with the learner?

We must remember that we are dealing with learners who are living in a world of modern technology. Ipods, DVDs, surroundsound and colour are the norm. Even if the student comes from a disadvantaged background and does not own the latest technology, it is still all around us in commercial malls and public places. Yet how many of our notes incorporate colour? How many of our textbooks incorporate colour? How many of us use sound during our lessons?
Part of the inaugural speech made by Nelson Mandela looks impressive, but to listen to it being said by him (available on various sound recordings), is even more impressive.

“We must therefore act together as a united people, for national reconciliation, for nation building, for the birth of a new world. Let there be justice for all. Let there be peace for all. Let there be work, bread, water and salt for all. Let each know that for each the body, the mind and the soul have been freed to fulfill themselves.

Never, never and never again shall it be that this beautiful land will again experience the oppression of one by another and suffer the indignity of being the skunk of the world.

Let freedom reign. The sun shall never set on so glorious a human achievement! God bless Africa!”

Teachers must relate to this world in their teaching. Too often, teachers are hostile to it!

But how do history teachers relate to it? Through a bland textbook? Through many roneoed notes?

This disparity between the world of the history teacher, the pupil and the outside world can lead to misunderstanding and conflict, leading both sides to hostility. A good example is that of reading. Many teachers grew up with a love of books as places from which much information can be obtained. Young people these days do tend to have a problem with reading: either they won’t do it or perhaps they can’t do it. A recent report in Britain indicated how the reading level is dropping and how young people are enjoying reading less.

The history teachers, if they are to be relevant must be able to relate to all this. Are history teachers not supposed to be the worst of all?? Stuck in the past!! But we are not -
or, at least, we should not be...

Another matter is that sometimes we may sell ourselves short as teachers. We say, or perhaps we just think that we are “only a teacher”. If we undervalue ourselves, we are simply making ourselves not relevant and we may as well go to the scrapheap.

What is the value of a headmaster? If one examines the pay packet of a headmaster at a local school compared to that of a general manager of a local supermarket – which do you think would be the greater? Nearly everyone I have spoken to, believes (rightly so) that it is the supermarket manager who wins. Is this not where our priorities are wrong? Surely the value of the headmaster is much more important? Of course, perhaps our priorities are wrong if we consider the pay packet of a national soccer coach!

There is no doubt, however, that the role of the teacher is changing.

He or she must become:

- An expert in their field of knowledge! (Otherwise, what is the point? Get the knowledge from the internet!)

Of course, the Internet also has its problems. It needs to be managed – by the relevant teacher! To quote once again from the previous article, very few people have had proper instruction on how to use the internet and how to pick out what is true and what is false.

- A good manager of the classroom situation – the teacher is the one in control!

Punch magazine once gave a very sobering view of the modern classroom, referring to the less advantaged schools in Great Britain. “The modern classroom is a hive of activity with 40% of the class engaged in sex and 40% of the class engaged in violence and 20% engaged in both … controlled by a teacher hanging from a light cord.”

- A good and efficient administrator!
The good teacher can deal with paperwork, can organise, can construct notes, question papers, memoranda, rubrics, assessments, visits etc.

There is some confusion as to what certain people think a good teacher should be.

A teacher is NOT...
- A bus driver.
- A sports coach!
- A general dogsbody!!

Many headmasters would like to see them be all three of these, but the teachers cannot do everything – they cannot produce quality work and have loads of extra duties, or undertake part-time work.

So, I would like to start a new fund / or campaign...the save-the teacher fund, especially the history teacher!

- Don’t overload the history classes – make them manageable for instruction and discussion – not just lecturing!
- Don’t over-bureaucratise!! The bureaucrats have taken over!! There are minutes / meetings/ admin of meetings/ roadshows/ paper-paper-paper (etc and etc)
- Give the teacher TIME to do their work – time to prepare, to assess, to read and to unload (during the holidays). There is a sound educational reason why pupils and teachers have these holidays!

However...the history teachers must also save themselves!! They must be those with:
good knowledge...in fact......expert knowledge! They must know what is going on.

They must be up to date with current events and technology – not stuck in the last century! Otherwise, their credibility has gone!!

And then, they will save themselves!
Of course...good teachers are essential! The bad or incompetent ones... must become extinct. They must strive to be good managers and administrators – go on courses to learn the latest knowledge and techniques!

The really good teachers must be able to:

- Kickstart the lessons.
- Manage and administer and
- Assess effectively.

Let us not get too carried away by assessment. It is an important tool in history, but it is not the only one. The lessons must be enjoyable.

Another matter, moving towards the more human component is that teachers bring the human element to schools - they're much more cosy than calculators or computers.

Of course, this is looking at the ideal situation in the classroom where the focus is on teaching and learning and not on problems, crime and violence. But...if we do not look at the ideal...what do we have to aim at??If we can only all do a little bit ourselves, imagine how wonderful the classrooms and schools could be!

So the final answer to the question on how relevant the history teacher is in the 21st century is ... Would it be obvious to work out the conclusion as it is a history conference attended by many history educators? The answer is YES! The history teacher IS relevant to the 21st century BUT...only if they want to be...we want knowledge and contribution not sheltered employment!!! And then they will move from becoming history teachers to becoming history.
Yesterday & Today

References and footnotes

The footnote method for references is accepted in articles for Yesterday & Today. Footnote references should be placed at the bottom of each page. Footnotes should be numbered sequentially throughout the article and starting with 1. No other numerical system is allowed. Archival sources/published works/authors referred to in the text should be cited in full in the first footnote of each new reference. Thereafter it can be reduced to a shorter footnote reference. The use of the latin word “Ibid” is not allowed. Rather refer to the actual reference again (its shortened version) on the rest of a page(s) in the footnote section.

The first letter of most words in titles of books, articles, chapters, theses, dissertations and papers/manuscripts should be capitalised. Only the first letter of the surname of authors should be capitalized, not the complete surname. No names of authors, in full, is allowed. The following practical examples may serve as a guideline:

Examples of an article in a journal


Example of a shortened version of an article in a journal

From:


To:


[Please note: only the title of the article is shortened]
Examples of a reference from a book


JJ Buys, *Die oorsprong en migrasiebewegings van die Koranna en hulle rol in die Transgariep tot 1870* (Universiteit van die Vrystaat, Bloemfontein, 1989), pp.33-34.

*Please note the style to the reference variety to page numbers used*

Example of a shortened version of a reference from a book

From:


To:


Example of a reference from a chapter in a book


Shortened version:


Example of a reference from an unpublished dissertation/thesis


Examples of a reference from a newspaper

Archival references

Interview(s)

Provide at least key details such as: Name of interviewee and profession; the interviewer and profession and date of interview

Example of interview reference:

K Rasool (Personal Collection), interview, K Kotzé (CEO, Goldfields, Johannesburg Head Office)/E Schutte (Researcher, NWU, School of Basic Science), 12 March 2006.

Example of shortened interview reference (after it has been used once in article)


National archives (or any other archive)


(Please note: after one reference to the National Archives or Source Group, It can be abbreviated to e.g. NA or DE)

A source accessed on the Internet


GENERAL:

Illustrations

Photographs, sketches, tables, diagrams; graphics, maps etc should be numbered consecutively (Eg. Figure 1-4; Sketch 1-2; Diagram 1-3; Photo 1-6). The appropriate positioning of the illustration should be indicated in the
text. Original copies should be clearly identified on the back. High quality scanned versions are always welcome.

Authors, PLEASE obtain copyright and reproduction rights on photographs and other illustrations

Copyright on all material in Yesterday&Today rests within the Editorial Advisory Committee of Yesterday&Today.
Any book reviews or History content or History educator material/ textbooks are welcome. Send to the Editor,

Yesterday & Today
School for Basic Sciences
PO Box 1174
Vanderbijlpark
1900

Enroll for Membership SASHT
(That includes the Yesterday & Today) !!!

The SASHT School for Basic Sciences,
PO Box 1174,
Vanderbijlpark
1900